

# THE DYNAMICS OF THOUGHT

SYNTHESE LIBRARY

STUDIES IN EPISTEMOLOGY,  
LOGIC, METHODOLOGY, AND PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE

*Editor-in-Chief:*

VINCENT F. HENDRICKS, *Roskilde University, Roskilde, Denmark*  
JOHN SYMONS, *University of Texas at El Paso, U.S.A.*

*Honorary Editor:*

JAAKKO HINTIKKA, *Boston University, U.S.A.*

*Editors:*

DIRK VAN DALEN, *University of Utrecht, The Netherlands*  
THEO A.F. KUIPERS, *University of Groningen, The Netherlands*  
TEDDY SEIDENFELD, *Carnegie Mellon University, U.S.A.*  
PATRICK SUPPES, *Stanford University, California, U.S.A.*  
JAN WOLEŃSKI, *Jagiellonian University, Kraków, Poland*

VOLUME 300

# THE DYNAMICS OF THOUGHT

*by*

PETER GÄRDENFORS

*Lund University,*

*Sweden*



Springer

A C.I.P. Catalogue record for this book is available from the Library of Congress.

ISBN-10 1-4020-3398-2 (HB) Springer Dordrecht, Berlin, Heidelberg, New York  
ISBN-10 1-4020-3399-0 (e-book) Springer Dordrecht, Berlin, Heidelberg, New York  
ISBN-13 978-1-4020-3398-8 (HB) Springer Dordrecht, Berlin, Heidelberg, New York  
ISBN-13 978-1-4020-3399-5 (e-book) Springer Dordrecht, Berlin, Heidelberg, New York

---

Published by Springer,  
P.O. Box 17, 3300 AA Dordrecht, The Netherlands.

*Printed on acid-free paper*

All Rights Reserved  
© 2005 Springer

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work.

Printed in the Netherlands.

## CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	vii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	ix
<b>Decision theory</b>	
<i>Chapter 1: Probabilistic reasoning and evidentiary value</i>	1
<i>Chapter 2: Unreliable probabilities, risk taking, and decision making</i>	11
<i>Chapter 3: Rights, games and social choice</i>	31
<b>Belief revision and nonmonotonic reasoning</b>	
<i>Chapter 4: The dynamics of belief systems: Foundations vs. coherence theories</i>	47
<i>Chapter 5: The role of expectations in reasoning</i>	67
<i>Chapter 6: How logic emerges from the dynamics of information</i>	83
<b>Induction</b>	
<i>Chapter 7: Induction, conceptual spaces and AI</i>	109
<i>Chapter 8: Three levels of inductive inference</i>	125
<b>Semantics and pragmatics</b>	
<i>Chapter 9: Frameworks for properties: Possible worlds vs. conceptual spaces</i>	145
<i>Chapter 10: The pragmatic role of modality in natural language</i>	161
<i>Chapter 11: The social stance</i>	173
<i>Chapter 12: The emergence of meaning</i>	179
<i>Chapter 13: Does semantics need reality?</i>	201
<b>Evolution and cognition</b>	
<i>Chapter 14: The nature of man – games that genes play?</i>	215
<i>Chapter 15: The detachment of thought</i>	227
<i>Chapter 16: Cognitive science: From computers to anthills as models of human thought</i>	243
<i>References</i>	261
<i>Index</i>	277

## PREFACE

This book is a selection from the articles that I have written over a period of more than twenty years. Since the focus of my research interests has shifted several times during this period, it would be difficult to identify a common theme for all the papers in the volume. Following the Swedish tradition, I therefore present this as a smörgåsbord of philosophical and cognitive issues that I have worked on. To create some order, I have organized the sixteen papers into five general sections: (1) Decision theory; (2) belief revision and nonmonotonic logic; (3) induction; (4) semantics and pragmatics; and (5) cognition and evolution.

Having said this, I still think that there is a common theme to my work over the years: The dynamics of thought. My academic interests have all the time dealt with aspects of how different kinds of knowledge should be represented, and, in particular, how changes in knowledge will affect thinking. Hence the title of the book.

The papers have been selected to minimize the overlap with my books *Knowledge in Flux* (1988) and *Conceptual Spaces* (2000). However, because some of the articles in this volume were parts of the process of writing these books, there are still common themes. The articles have been published in disparate and often hard to access publications, which is a good reason to present them under one cover. However, this also entails that there is some overlap between the articles. In preparing them for this volume, I have therefore tried to eliminate the most blatant repetitions. I have also edited the articles lightly to make their styles more uniform.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Several people have been helpful in the process. Since it was created in 1988, the seminar in cognitive science at Lund University has been a constantly critical but friendly test bed for my ideas. I also want to thank Eva Börjesson who has been very efficient in transforming some of the articles that appear in this book, Nils-Eric Sahlin for allowing me to reuse one of our joint articles, Annie Kuipers who initiated the project at Kluwer, Ingrid Krabbenbos who kept it alive, and Vincent Hendricks who gently pushed me to finalize it.

Over the years, my research has been generously financed by the Swedish Council for Research in the Humanities and Social Science and the Swedish Foundation for Strategic Research, which I gratefully acknowledge.

The following list presents the original sources of the chapters. I am grateful to the publishers for granting me the permission to reprint them in this volume.

- Chapter 1:* “Probabilistic reasoning and evidentiary value,” in P. Gärdenfors, B. Hansson and N.-E. Sahlin, eds., *Evidentiary Value: Philosophical, Judicial and Psychological Aspects of a Theory*, Gleerups, Lund, 44-57. (1983)
- Chapter 2:* “Unreliable probabilities, risk taking, and decision making,” *Synthese* 51, 361-386. (1982)
- Chapter 3:* “Rights, games and social choice,” *Noûs* 15, 341-356. (© Blackwell Publishing 1981)
- Chapter 4:* “The dynamics of belief systems: Foundations vs. coherence theories,” © *Revue Internationale de Philosophie* 44, 24-46. (1990)
- Chapter 5:* “The role of expectations in reasoning,” in M. Masuch and L. Polos, eds., *Knowledge Representation and Reasoning Under Uncertainty*, © Springer-Verlag, Berlin, 1-16. (1994)
- Chapter 6:* “How logic emerges from the dynamics of information,” in J. van Eijck and A. Visser, eds., *Logic and Information Flow*, © MIT Press, Cambridge, MA, 49-77. (1994)
- Chapter 7:* “Induction, conceptual spaces and AI,” © *Philosophy of Science* 57, 78-95. (1990)
- Chapter 8:* “Three levels of inductive inference,” in D. Prawitz, B. Skyrms and D. Westerståhl, eds., *Logic, Methodology, and Philosophy of Science IX*, © Elsevier Science, Amsterdam, 427-449. (1994)
- Chapter 9:* “Frameworks for properties: Possible worlds vs. conceptual spaces,” © *Acta Philosophica Fennica* 49, 383-407. (1991)

- Chapter 10:* “The pragmatic role of modality in natural language,” in P. Weingartner, G. Schurz and G. Dorn, eds., *The Role of Pragmatics in Contemporary Philosophy*, © Hölder-Pichler-Tempsky, Vienna, 78-91. (1998)
- Chapter 11:* “Social intentions and irreducibly social goods,” in G. Brennan and C. Walsh, eds., *Rationality, Individualism, and Public Policy*, Centre for Research on Federal Financial Relations, Canberra, 91-96. (1990)
- Chapter 12:* “The emergence of meaning,” *Linguistics and Philosophy* 16, 285-309. (1993)
- Chapter 13:* “Does semantics need reality?,” in A. Riegler, M. Peschl and A. von Stein, eds., *Understanding Representation in the Cognitive Sciences: Does Representation Need Reality?* Kluwer Academic Publishers, New York, NY, 209--217 (1999)
- Chapter 14:* “The nature of man – games that genes play?,” in G. Holmström and A. Jones, eds., *Action, Logic and Social Theory* (© *Acta Philosophica Fennica* 38), Helsinki, 9–24. (1985)
- Chapter 15:* “The detachment of thought,” in C. Erneling and D. Johnson, eds., *The Mind as a Scientific Subject: Between Brain and Culture*, © Oxford University Press, Oxford, 323–341. (2005)
- Chapter 16:* “Cognitive science: From computers to anthills as models of human thought,” *World Social Science Report*, © UNESCO Publishing/Elsevier, Paris, 316-327. (1999)