Performance Metrics for Haptic Interfaces

Springer Series on Touch and Haptic Systems

Series Editors

Manuel Ferre Marc O. Ernst Alan Wing

Series Editorial Board

Carlo A. Avizzano José M. Azorín Soledad Ballesteros Massimo Bergamasco Antonio Bicchi Martin Buss Jan van Erp Matthias Harders William S. Harwin Vincent Hayward Juan M. Ibarra Astrid Kappers Abderrahmane Kheddar Miguel A. Otaduy Angelika Peer Jerome Perret Jean-Louis Thonnard

Evren Samur

Performance Metrics for Haptic Interfaces



Evren Samur Robotic Systems Laboratory École Polytechnique Fédérale de Lausanne (EPFL) Lausanne, Switzerland

ISSN 2192-2977 ISSN 2192-2985 (electronic) Springer Series on Touch and Haptic Systems ISBN 978-1-4471-4224-9 ISBN 978-1-4471-4225-6 (eBook) DOI 10.1007/978-1-4471-4225-6 Springer London Heidelberg New York Dordrecht

Library of Congress Control Number: 2012943842

© Springer-Verlag London 2012

Chapter 7 is published with kind permission of © SPIE 2009. All rights reserved.

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed. Exempted from this legal reservation are brief excerpts in connection with reviews or scholarly analysis or material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work. Duplication of this publication or parts thereof is permitted only under the provisions of the Copyright Law of the Publisher's location, in its current version, and permission for use must always be obtained from Springer. Permissions for use may be obtained through RightsLink at the Copyright Clearance Center. Violations are liable to prosecution under the respective Copyright Law.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

While the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication, neither the authors nor the editors nor the publisher can accept any legal responsibility for any errors or omissions that may be made. The publisher makes no warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein.

Printed on acid-free paper

Springer is part of Springer Science+Business Media (www.springer.com)

To the women of my life: Annem, Ablam, Elif and Ceren

Series Editors' Foreword

This is the fifth volume of the "Springer Series on Touch and Haptic Systems", which is published in collaboration between **Springer** and the **EuroHaptics Society**. *Performance Metrics for Haptic Interfaces* is focused on evaluating the performance of haptic devices by physical and psychophysical metrics. This work represents a significant step forward in haptic interface standardization, which helps the broader dissemination of human interaction devices that include haptic feedback.

The double approach presented in this volume is consistent with the nature of haptic devices: on the one hand, these devices are defined in terms of engineering features such as controllers, actuators, sensors, etc. On the other hand, haptic devices are designed to directly interact with users. Therefore, the human interaction capability will determine the suitable performance measure for such devices.

The basis for this volume is the PhD thesis of Evren Samur who was the winner of the 2011 EuroHaptics Society PhD award. It was selected from a pool of many other excellent works on haptics research. This monograph is an excellent example of the state of the art in the use of engineering and psychophysics for the development of haptics, and as such is an important starting point for future advances in this field.

> Manuel Ferre Marc Ernst Alan Wing

Preface

The purpose of evaluation procedures for haptic interfaces is to achieve both qualitative and quantitative statements on haptic rendering realism and performance. Since haptic technology is being increasingly used in computer games, surgical simulators, mobile phones etc., there is a need for defining standards for haptic applications. This book aims at meeting this need by establishing standard practices for the evaluation of haptic interfaces and by identifying significant benchmark metrics.

Towards this end, a combined physical and psychophysical experimental methodology is given in this book. First, the existing physical performance measures and device characterization techniques were investigated and described in an illustrative way. The physical characterization methods were demonstrated on a two degreesof-freedom haptic interface. Second, a wide range of human psychophysical experiments were reviewed and the appropriate ones were applied to haptic interactions. The psychophysical experiments were unified as a systematic and complete evaluation method for haptic interfaces. Seven psychophysical tests were derived and implemented for three commercial force-feedback devices. Experimental user studies were carried out and applicability of the tests to a tactile feedback device was investigated. Finally, synthesis of both evaluation methods is also discussed.

The generic methodology provided in this book enables readers to evaluate the suitability of a haptic interface for a specific purpose, to characterize and compare devices quantitatively and to identify possible improvement strategies in the design of the system.

Chicago, USA

Evren Samur

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank my PhD advisor, Hannes Bleuler, for giving me the opportunity to work at EPFL. I feel privileged to have been working with you and your team, full of brilliant people all the time. I always admire your enthusiasm and deep knowledge on the world culture and languages. Many thanks to Roger Gassert for not only giving me an extensive feedback but also encouraging me during the tough times of my research. Your stimulating support helped me develop confidence in my research. I would like to express my sincere appreciation to Paolo Fiorini, Matthias Harders and Max Hongler, for their valuable comments, suggestions and constructive criticisms. I would also like to thank Ed Colgate for accepting me as a visiting scholar in his lab at the Northwestern University, Chicago where I learned so much in a short period. Your brilliant and always challenging ideas advanced my critical thinking.

I also owe gratitude to Thomas Moix, Ulrich Spaelter, Dominique Chapuis, Lindo Duratti and Wang Fei. It was an unforgettable experience to work with you all. I am truly grateful to Lionel Flaction, Pascal Maillard, Andrew Watson, Andrew Whyte, Anders Larsson and our oversea colleagues Josh Passenger and David Hellier. Many thanks also go to all my colleagues and close friends at the lab, especially Solaiman Shokur, Aleksey Gribovskiy, Ricardo Pérez Suaréz, Masayuki Hara, Ricardo Beira, Ali Şengül, Giulio Rognini, Jeremy Olivier and Laura Santos Carreras.

Together with my long-lasting (academic) friends, Ufuk Olgaç, Erk Subaşı and FC Meral, we hit the road from Ankara, passed by Istanbul and arrived in Switzerland or in Chicago. I hope we continue to walk together. My dear friends Luca Pozzoli, Simos Koumoutsaris, Mathieu Aurousseau and Danielle Ramseier; you made me feel like at home in Switzerland. And now in Chicago, I am lucky to have beloved Rogers Park residents Matt Runfola and Sandra Stone in my life. I have to express my enormous gratitude to all my friends in Turkey for the joyful times we are spending—the list is too long to mention all the names. Elif the sister and İlham the brother; you always cared about me and showed your love. *Anne* and *Abla*; I dedicate this book to you because of your deep love for me. You raised me, continuously support me and tirelessly waited for me to come back home. My final thanks go to Ceren with whom I share every single moment of my life with love.

Contents

Part I Basic Considerations

1	Intr	oduction	3
	1.1	Motivation	3
	1.2	Objectives and Approach	5
	1.3	Outline	6
	Refe	rences	7
2	Stat	e of the Art	9
	2.1	Haptic Interfaces	9
		2.1.1 Force Feedback Devices	9
		2.1.2 Tactile Interfaces	19
		2.1.3 Other Applications	20
	2.2	Evaluation Studies	20
		2.2.1 Physical Evaluation Studies	20
		2.2.2 Psychophysical Evaluation Studies	21
	Refe	rences	22
3	Hun	nan Haptic Perception	27
	3.1	Human Hand and Haptics	27
	3.2	Psychophysics and Psychophysical Methods	28
	3.3	Human Haptic Perception Limits	31
	Refe	rences	36
Par		· ·	36
Par 4	t II	rences	36 43
	t II	Physical Evaluation	
	t II Perf	rences	43
	t II Perf 4.1	rences	43 43
	t II Perf 4.1 4.2	rences Physical Evaluation ormance Evaluation Based on Physical Measurements Introduction Modeling Haptic Interface Performance	43 43 43

		4.4.2 Elastostatics	51
		4.4.3 Dynamics	51
	4.5	Powered System Properties	52
		4.5.1 Actuation Capabilities	52
		4.5.2 Sensing Capabilities	58
	4.6	Controlled System Properties	59
		4.6.1 Impedance Range	59
		4.6.2 Control Bandwidth	60
	4.7	Physical Performance Metrics	61
	4.8	Conclusions	61
	Refe	rences	63
-	A	lisation to a Hantia Intenfance	67
5		lication to a Haptic Interface	67
	5.1	Apparatus: 2-DOF Haptic Interface for Colonoscopy Simulation .	67
	5 0	5.1.1 Design Requirements	67 68
	5.2	Physical Evaluation	68 68
		5.2.1 Unpowered System Properties	68 69
	5 2	5.2.3 Controlled System Performance	74
	5.3	Conclusions	76
	Refe	rences	77
Par	t III	Psychophysical Evaluation	
6	Perf	ormance Evaluation Based on Psychophysical Tests	81
6	Perf 6.1	ormance Evaluation Based on Psychophysical Tests	81 81
6		Introduction	
6	6.1	Introduction	81
6	6.1	Introduction	81 82
6	6.1	Introduction	81 82 82
6	6.1 6.2	Introduction	81 82 82 84
6	6.1 6.2	Introduction	81 82 82 84 85
6	6.1 6.2	Introduction	81 82 82 84 85 85
6	6.1 6.2	IntroductionTestbed Evaluation Methodology6.2.1Categorization of Haptic Interaction Tasks6.2.2Psychophysical Performance MetricsExperimental Implementation6.3.1Experimental Setup6.3.2Apparatus: 3-DOF Haptic Interfaces6.3.3Participants and Procedure	81 82 82 84 85 85 86
6	6.16.26.3	Introduction	81 82 84 85 85 86 86
6	6.16.26.3	IntroductionTestbed Evaluation Methodology6.2.1Categorization of Haptic Interaction Tasks6.2.2Psychophysical Performance MetricsExperimental Implementation6.3.1Experimental Setup6.3.2Apparatus: 3-DOF Haptic Interfaces6.3.3Participants and ProcedurePsychophysical Testbeds6.4.1Experiment 1: Travel and Selection	81 82 84 85 85 86 86 86 87
6	6.16.26.3	IntroductionIntroductionTestbed Evaluation Methodology	81 82 84 85 85 86 86 86 87 87
6	6.16.26.3	Introduction	81 82 84 85 85 86 86 86 87 87 87
6	6.16.26.3	Introduction	81 82 82 84 85 85 86 86 86 87 87 89 91
6	6.16.26.3	Introduction	81 82 82 84 85 85 86 86 87 87 89 91 93
6	6.16.26.3	IntroductionIntroductionTestbed Evaluation Methodology	81 82 84 85 85 86 86 87 87 87 89 91 93 95
6	6.16.26.36.4	IntroductionTestbed Evaluation Methodology6.2.1Categorization of Haptic Interaction Tasks6.2.2Psychophysical Performance MetricsExperimental Implementation6.3.1Experimental Setup6.3.2Apparatus: 3-DOF Haptic Interfaces6.3.3Participants and ProcedurePsychophysical Testbeds6.4.1Experiment 1: Travel and Selection6.4.2Experiment 3: Detection6.4.4Experiment 4: Force Discrimination6.4.5Experiment 5: Texture Discrimination6.4.6Experiments 6 & 7: Size & Shape Identification	81 82 82 84 85 86 86 87 87 89 91 93 95 97
6	 6.1 6.2 6.3 6.4 6.5 6.6 	IntroductionTestbed Evaluation Methodology6.2.1Categorization of Haptic Interaction Tasks6.2.2Psychophysical Performance MetricsExperimental Implementation6.3.1Experimental Setup6.3.2Apparatus: 3-DOF Haptic Interfaces6.3.3Participants and ProcedurePsychophysical Testbeds6.4.1Experiment 1: Travel and Selection6.4.2Experiment 3: Detection6.4.4Experiment 4: Force Discrimination6.4.5Experiment 5: Texture Discrimination6.4.6Experiments 6 & 7: Size & Shape IdentificationConclusions	81 82 84 85 86 86 87 87 87 89 91 93 95 97 99
6	 6.1 6.2 6.3 6.4 6.5 6.6 Refe 	IntroductionTestbed Evaluation Methodology6.2.1Categorization of Haptic Interaction Tasks6.2.2Psychophysical Performance MetricsExperimental Implementation6.3.1Experimental Setup6.3.2Apparatus: 3-DOF Haptic Interfaces6.3.3Participants and ProcedurePsychophysical Testbeds6.4.1Experiment 1: Travel and Selection6.4.2Experiment 2: Selection and Manipulation6.4.3Experiment 3: Detection6.4.4Experiment 5: Texture Discrimination6.4.5Experiment 6 & 7: Size & Shape IdentificationGeneral DiscussionConclusions	81 82 82 84 85 85 86 86 87 87 89 91 93 95 97 99 103 104
	 6.1 6.2 6.3 6.4 6.5 6.6 Refe 	Introduction Testbed Evaluation Methodology 6.2.1 Categorization of Haptic Interaction Tasks 6.2.2 Psychophysical Performance Metrics Experimental Implementation Experimental Setup 6.3.1 Experimental Setup 6.3.2 Apparatus: 3-DOF Haptic Interfaces 6.3.3 Participants and Procedure Psychophysical Testbeds Selection 6.4.1 Experiment 1: Travel and Selection 6.4.2 Experiment 2: Selection and Manipulation 6.4.3 Experiment 3: Detection 6.4.4 Experiment 4: Force Discrimination 6.4.5 Experiment 5: Texture Discrimination 6.4.6 Experiments 6 & 7: Size & Shape Identification General Discussion Conclusions rences Iteation to a Tactile Display	81 82 82 84 85 85 86 86 87 87 87 87 91 93 95 97 99 103 104
	6.1 6.2 6.3 6.4 6.5 6.6 Refe App	IntroductionTestbed Evaluation Methodology6.2.1Categorization of Haptic Interaction Tasks6.2.2Psychophysical Performance MetricsExperimental Implementation6.3.1Experimental Setup6.3.2Apparatus: 3-DOF Haptic Interfaces6.3.3Participants and ProcedurePsychophysical Testbeds6.4.1Experiment 1: Travel and Selection6.4.2Experiment 2: Selection and Manipulation6.4.3Experiment 3: Detection6.4.4Experiment 4: Force Discrimination6.4.5Experiment 5: Texture Discrimination6.4.6Experiments 6 & 7: Size & Shape IdentificationGeneral DiscussionConclusionsrencesIication to a Tactile DisplayTactile Pattern Display (TPaD)	81 82 82 84 85 85 86 86 87 87 89 91 93 95 97 99 103 104

7.3	Psychophysical Evaluation)9
	7.3.1 Friction Force Discrimination	10
7.4	Conclusions & Future Work	13
Refe	erences	14

Part IV Synthesis of Evaluation Methods

8	Conc	lusion
	8.1	Summary
	8.2	Synthesis of Physical and Psychophysical Methods
	8.3	Contributions
	8.4	Outlook
	Refe	rences
Glos	sary	
Inde	X.	

List of Acronyms, Symbols, Greek Letters

Acronyms		
Abs.	Absolute	
Amp	Amplifier	
ANOVA	Analysis of Variance	
Co-Me	Computer Aided and Image Guided Medical Interventions	
CPT	Counts Per Turn	
CSIRO	Australia's Commonwealth Scientific and Industrial Research	
	Organisation	
D/A	Digital to Analog	
DC	Direct Current	
DOF	Degree(s) of Freedom	
DL	Difference Limen (Difference or Differential Threshold)	
EPFL	Ecole Polytechnique Fédérale de Lausanne	
EPs	Exploratory Procedures	
Eq.	Equation	
Enc	Encoder	
Fig.	Figure	
fMRI	functional Magnetic Resonance Imaging	
FFT	Fast Fourier Transform	
GCI	Global Conditioning Index	
GIE	Generalized Inertia Ellipsoid	
JND	Just-Noticeable-Difference	
HD	High Definition	
ID	Index of Difficulty	
IP	Index of Performance	
IR	Infrared	
IT	Information Transfer	
I/O	Input Output	
ISO	International Organization for Standardization	
LDV	Laser Doppler Vibrometer	
LFFs	Lateral Force Fields	

n/anot applicable/not availableNCCRNational Centre of Competence in ResearchPCPersonal ComputerRLReiz Limen (Absolute Threshold)RMSRoot Mean SquareSDRStructural Deformation RatioTPaDTactile Pattern DisplayUSBUniversal Serial BusvarVarianceVEVirtual Environment	
Symbols a Intercept A Distance of Movement b Reciprocal of IP B Damping c Constant d_i Damping dW Workspace Derivative D Diameter $F(\omega)$ Force F_a^n Discrete Input Force F_a^n Discrete Input Force F_d Desired Force F_d^n Discrete Desired Force F_d Desired Force F_d Size of Hole H_f Transfer Function between Output and Input Force H_v Transfer Function between Output and Input Velocity i Input Current I Reference Stimulus J Jacobian Matrix k Stiffness K Virtual Stiffness/Spring M Mass M Mass Matrix M_i Mass/Inertia n Discrete Parameter Indicator/Total Number of Trials $n_{i,j}$ Number of Joint Event p Probability P Size of Peg	-

xviii

$n_{i,j}$ Encoder Count \dot{q} Joint Rates \dot{q}_d^n Discrete Joint Rates R Sampled Output Sine R_j Number of Responses s Laplace Transform Variable S Shape Index S_{cor} Step Size for Correct Answer S_{ii} Number of Stimuli S_{incor} Step Size for Unsure Answer T_r Rise Time $v(\omega)$ Velocity v_{ee} Velocity of the End Effector v_{ee}^n Discrete Velocity of the End Effector v_{ee}^n Discrete Velocity of Virtual Environment V Voltage V_{in} Voltage to Amplifier W Width of Target/Precision y True Sine Y_d Admittance of Device Z_{im}^n Impedance of Virtual Coupling Z_d Impedance of Virtual Coupling Z_d Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_{e}^n Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_{e}^n Impedance of Virtual Coupling Z_{e}^n Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_{e}^n Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_{e}^n Total Impedance Z_{e}^n Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_{i} Total Impedance of Human Hand and Device Z_{e}^n Total Impedance of Human Hand and Device<	q	Pose
\dot{q}_{a} Joint Rates \dot{q}_{a}^{h} Discrete Joint Rates R Sampled Output Sine R_{j} Number of Responses s Laplace Transform Variable S Shape Index S_{cor} Step Size for Correct Answer S_{i} Number of Stimuli S_{incor} Step Size for Incorrect Answer S_{unsure} Step Size for Unsure Answer T_r Rise Time $v(\omega)$ Velocity v_{ee} Velocity of the End Effector v_{ee}^{n} Discrete Velocity of the End Effector v_{ee}^{n} Discrete Velocity of Virtual Environment V Voltage V_{in} Voltage to Amplifier W Width of Target/Precision y True Sine Y_{d} Admittance of Device Z_{in}^{n} Impedance of Virtual Coupling Z_{d} Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_{in}^{n} Discrete Model of a Device Impedance Z_{in}^{n} Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_{in}^{n} Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_{in}^{n} Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_{in}^{n} Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_{in}^{n} Total Impedance of Human Hand and Device $Greek Letters$ Greek Letters	$n_{i,j}$	Encoder Count
\dot{q}_d^n Discrete Joint Rates R Sampled Output Sine R_j Number of Responses s Laplace Transform Variable S Shape Index S_{cor} Step Size for Correct Answer S_i Number of Stimuli S_{incor} Step Size for Incorrect Answer S_{unsure} Step Size for Unsure Answer T_r Rise Time $v(\omega)$ Velocity v_{ee} Velocity of the End Effector v_{ee}^n Discrete Velocity of the End Effector v_{e}^n Discrete Velocity of Virtual Environment V Voltage V_{in} Voltage to Amplifier W Width of Target/Precision y True Sine Y_d Admittance of Device $Z(\omega)$ Mechanical Impedance Z_n^n Impedance of Virtual Coupling Z_d Impedance of Device Z_n^n Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_n^n Discrete Model of a Device Impedance Z_n^n Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_n Timedance of Virtual Environment Z_n Total Impedance Z_n^n Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_n Total Impedance Z_n^n Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_n Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_n Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_n Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling		Joint Rates
R Sampled Output Sine R_j Number of Responses s Laplace Transform Variable S Shape Index S_{cor} Step Size for Correct Answer S_i Number of Stimuli S_{incor} Step Size for Incorrect Answer S_{unsure} Step Size for Unsure Answer T_r Rise Time $v(\omega)$ Velocity v_{ee} Velocity of the End Effector v_{ee}^{e} Discrete Velocity of Virtual Environment V Voltage V_in Voltage to Amplifier W Width of Target/Precision y True Sine Y_d Admittance of Device Z_{eo} Impedance of Device Z_{a}^{n} Impedance of Device Z_{a}^{n} Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_{a}^{n} Impedance of Virtual Coupling Z_{a}^{n} Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_{a}^{n} Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_{a}^{n} Total Impedance of Human Hand and Device Z_{a}^{n} Total Impedance of Human Hand and Device		Discrete Joint Rates
sLaplace Transform VariableSShape Index S_{cor} Step Size for Correct Answer S_i Number of Stimuli S_{incor} Step Size for Incorrect Answer S_{unsure} Step Size for Unsure Answer T_r Rise Time $v(\omega)$ Velocity v_{ee} Velocity of the End Effector v_{ee}^n Discrete Velocity of the End Effector v_{ee}^n Discrete Velocity of Virtual EnvironmentVVoltage V_{in} Voltage to AmplifierWWidth of Target/PrecisionyTrue Sine Y_d Admittance of Device $Z(\omega)$ Mechanical Impedance Z_c^n Impedance of Virtual Coupling Z_d Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_h Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_t^n Timpedance of Virtual Environment Z_t^n Total Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_t^n Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_t^n Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_t^n Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_t^n Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_t^n Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_t Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_t Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_t Total Impedance of Human Hand and Device Z_t^n Total Impedance of Human Hand and Device <th></th> <th>Sampled Output Sine</th>		Sampled Output Sine
SShape Index S_{cor} Step Size for Correct Answer S_i Number of Stimuli S_{incor} Step Size for Incorrect Answer S_{unsure} Step Size for Unsure Answer T_r Rise Time $v(\omega)$ Velocity v_{ee} Velocity of the End Effector v_{ee}^n Discrete Velocity of the End Effector v_{ee}^n Discrete Velocity of Virtual Environment V Voltage V_{in} Voltage to Amplifier W Width of Target/Precision y True Sine Y_d Admittance of Device $Z(\omega)$ Mechanical Impedance $Z(\omega)$ Mechanical Impedance Z_d^n Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_h Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_t^n Timpedance of Virtual Environment Z_t^n Timpedance of Virtual Coupling Z_t^n Timpedance of Virtual Environment Z_t^n Timpedance of Virtual Environment Z_t^n Timpedance of Virtual Environment Z_t^n Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_t Total Impedance of Human Hand and Device Z_t^n Total Impedance of Human Hand and Device Z_t^n Total Impedance of Human Hand and Device Z_t^n Total Impedance of Human Hand and Device	R_j	Number of Responses
S_{cor} Step Size for Correct Answer S_i Number of Stimuli S_{incor} Step Size for Incorrect Answer S_{unsure} Step Size for Unsure Answer T_r Rise Time $v(\omega)$ Velocity v_{ee} Velocity of the End Effector v_{ee}^n Discrete Velocity of the End Effector v_e^n Discrete Velocity of Virtual Environment V Voltage V_{in} Voltage to Amplifier W Width of Target/Precision y True Sine Y_d Admittance of Device $Z(\omega)$ Mechanical Impedance Z_n^n Impedance of Virtual Coupling Z_d Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_h Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_h Impedance of Virtual Coupling Z_d Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_h Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_h Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_h Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_i An Impedance Z_r^n Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_t Total Impedance of Human Hand and Device $Greek Letters$	S	Laplace Transform Variable
S_i Number of Stimuli S_{incor} Step Size for Incorrect Answer S_{unsure} Step Size for Unsure Answer T_r Rise Time $v(\omega)$ Velocity v_{ee} Velocity of the End Effector v_{ee}^n Discrete Velocity of the End Effector v_{ee}^n Discrete Velocity of Virtual Environment V Voltage V_{in} Voltage to Amplifier W Width of Target/Precision y True Sine Y_d Admittance of Device $Z(\omega)$ Mechanical Impedance Z_c^n Impedance of Virtual Coupling Z_d Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_h Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_h Impedance of Virtual Coupling Z_d Impedance of Virtual Coupling Z_d Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_h Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_h Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_i An Impedance Z_i^n Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_t Total Impedance of Human Hand and Device $Greek Letters$	S	Shape Index
S_{incor} Step Size for Incorrect Answer S_{unsure} Step Size for Unsure Answer T_r Rise Time $v(\omega)$ Velocity v_{ee} Velocity of the End Effector v_{ee}^n Discrete Velocity of the End Effector v_{ee}^n Discrete Velocity of Virtual Environment V Voltage V_{in} Voltage to Amplifier W Width of Target/Precision y True Sine Y_d Admittance of Device $Z(\omega)$ Mechanical Impedance Z_c^n Impedance of Virtual Coupling Z_d Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_h Impedance of Virtual Coupling Z_d Impedance of Virtual Coupling Z_d Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_h Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_h Impedance of Virtual Coupling Z_d Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_h Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_h Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_i An Impedance Z_F^n Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_t Total Impedance of Human Hand and Device <i>Greek LettersGreek Letters</i>	S_{cor}	Step Size for Correct Answer
S_{unsure} Step Size for Unsure Answer T_r Rise Time $v(\omega)$ Velocity v_{ee} Velocity of the End Effector v_{ee}^n Discrete Velocity of the End Effector v_{ee}^n Discrete Velocity of Virtual Environment V Voltage V_{in} Voltage to Amplifier W Width of Target/Precision y_{d} Admittance of Device Y_d Admittance of Device $Z(\omega)$ Mechanical Impedance Z_c^n Impedance of Virtual Coupling Z_d Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_i^n Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_i An Impedance Z_e^n Total Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_i An Impedance Z_e^n Total Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_i An Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_i Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_i Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_i Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_i Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_i Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_i Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_i Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_i Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_i Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_i Total Impedance	S_i	Number of Stimuli
S_{unsure} Step Size for Unsure Answer T_r Rise Time $v(\omega)$ Velocity v_{ee} Velocity of the End Effector v_{ee}^n Discrete Velocity of the End Effector v_{ee}^n Discrete Velocity of Virtual Environment V Voltage V_{in} Voltage to Amplifier W Width of Target/Precision y_{d} Admittance of Device Y_d Admittance of Device $Z(\omega)$ Mechanical Impedance Z_c^n Impedance of Virtual Coupling Z_d Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_i^n Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_i An Impedance Z_e^n Total Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_i An Impedance Z_e^n Total Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_i An Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_i Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_i Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_i Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_i Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_i Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_i Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_i Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_i Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_i Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_i Total Impedance	Sincor	Step Size for Incorrect Answer
T_r Rise Time $v(\omega)$ Velocity v_{ee} Velocity of the End Effector v_{ee}^n Discrete Velocity of the End Effector v_{e}^n Discrete Velocity of Virtual Environment V Voltage V_{in} Voltage to Amplifier W Width of Target/Precision y True Sine Y_d Admittance of Device $Z(\omega)$ Mechanical Impedance Z_c^n Impedance of Virtual Coupling Z_d Impedance of Device Impedance Z_e^n Discrete Model of a Device Impedance Z_e^n Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_i An Impedance Z_e^n Total Impedance Z_e^n Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_i An Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_i Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_i Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_i Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_i Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_i Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_i Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_i Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_i Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_i Total Impedance of Human Hand and Device	Sunsure	Step Size for Unsure Answer
v_{ee} Velocity of the End Effector v_{ee}^n Discrete Velocity of the End Effector v_e^n Discrete Velocity of Virtual Environment V Voltage V_{in} Voltage to Amplifier W Width of Target/Precision y True Sine Y_d Admittance of Device Y_f Modified Admittance of Device $Z(\omega)$ Mechanical Impedance Z_c^n Impedance of Virtual Coupling Z_d Impedance of Device Z_n^n Discrete Model of a Device Impedance Z_e^n Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_i An Impedance Z_i Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_i Total Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_i Total Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_i Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_i Total Impedance of Human Hand and Device Z_e^n Total Impedance of Human Hand and Device		Rise Time
v_{ee}^n Discrete Velocity of the End Effector v_e^n Discrete Velocity of Virtual Environment V Voltage V_{in} Voltage to Amplifier W Width of Target/Precision y True Sine Y_d Admittance of Device Y_f Modified Admittance of Device $Z(\omega)$ Mechanical Impedance Z_c^n Impedance of Virtual Coupling Z_d Impedance of Device Z_n^n Discrete Model of a Device Impedance Z_e^n Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_h Impedance of Human Hand and Arm Z_i An Impedance Z_E^n Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_i Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_i Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_k Total Impedance of Human Hand and Device Z_E^n Total Impedance of Human Hand and Device	$v(\omega)$	Velocity
VVoltage V_{in} Voltage to AmplifierWWidth of Target/PrecisionyTrue Sine Y_d Admittance of Device Y_f Modified Admittance of Device $Z(\omega)$ Mechanical Impedance Z_c^n Impedance of Virtual Coupling Z_d Impedance of Device Z_{n}^n Discrete Model of a Device Impedance Z_{e}^n Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_h Impedance of Human Hand and Arm Z_i An Impedance Z_{E}^n Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_t Total Impedance of Human Hand and Device <i>Greek Letters</i>		Velocity of the End Effector
VVoltage V_{in} Voltage to AmplifierWWidth of Target/PrecisionyTrue Sine Y_d Admittance of Device Y_f Modified Admittance of Device $Z(\omega)$ Mechanical Impedance Z_c^n Impedance of Virtual Coupling Z_d Impedance of Device Z_{n}^n Discrete Model of a Device Impedance Z_{e}^n Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_h Impedance of Human Hand and Arm Z_i An Impedance Z_{E}^n Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_t Total Impedance of Human Hand and Device <i>Greek Letters</i>	v_{ee}^n	Discrete Velocity of the End Effector
VVoltage V_{in} Voltage to AmplifierWWidth of Target/PrecisionyTrue Sine Y_d Admittance of Device Y_f Modified Admittance of Device $Z(\omega)$ Mechanical Impedance Z_c^n Impedance of Virtual Coupling Z_d Impedance of Device Z_{n}^n Discrete Model of a Device Impedance Z_{e}^n Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_h Impedance of Human Hand and Arm Z_i An Impedance Z_{E}^n Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_t Total Impedance of Human Hand and Device <i>Greek Letters</i>	v_e^n	Discrete Velocity of Virtual Environment
WWidth of Target/PrecisionyTrue Sine Y_d Admittance of Device Y_f Modified Admittance of Device $Z(\omega)$ Mechanical Impedance Z_c^n Impedance of Virtual Coupling Z_d Impedance of Device Z_d^n Discrete Model of a Device Impedance Z_e^n Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_h Impedance of Human Hand and Arm Z_i An Impedance Z_E^n Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_t Total Impedance of Human Hand and Device $Greek Letters$ $Etters$	V	Voltage
yTrue Sine Y_d Admittance of Device Y_f Modified Admittance of Device $Z(\omega)$ Mechanical Impedance Z_c^n Impedance of Virtual Coupling Z_d Impedance of Device Z_d^n Discrete Model of a Device Impedance Z_e^n Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_h Impedance of Human Hand and Arm Z_i An Impedance Z_E^n Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_t Total Impedance of Human Hand and Device <i>Greek Letters</i>	V_{in}	Voltage to Amplifier
Y_d Admittance of Device Y_f Modified Admittance of Device $Z(\omega)$ Mechanical Impedance Z_c^n Impedance of Virtual Coupling Z_d Impedance of Device Z_n^n Discrete Model of a Device Impedance Z_e^n Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_h Impedance of Human Hand and Arm Z_i An Impedance Z_E^n Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_t Total Impedance of Human Hand and Device <i>Greek Letters</i>	W	Width of Target/Precision
Y_f Modified Admittance of Device $Z(\omega)$ Mechanical Impedance Z_c^n Impedance of Virtual Coupling Z_d Impedance of Device Z_d^n Discrete Model of a Device Impedance Z_e^n Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_h Impedance of Human Hand and Arm Z_t An Impedance Z_t^n Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_t Total Impedance of Human Hand and Device	у	True Sine
$Z(\omega)$ Mechanical Impedance Z_c^n Impedance of Virtual Coupling Z_d Impedance of Device Z_d^n Discrete Model of a Device Impedance Z_e^n Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_h Impedance of Human Hand and Arm Z_i An Impedance Z_E^n Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_t Total Impedance of Human Hand and DeviceGreek Letters	Y_d	Admittance of Device
Z_c^n Impedance of Virtual Coupling Z_d Impedance of Device Z_d^n Discrete Model of a Device Impedance Z_e^n Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_h Impedance of Human Hand and Arm Z_i An Impedance Z_E^n Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_t Total Impedance of Human Hand and DeviceGreek Letters	Y_f	Modified Admittance of Device
Z_d Impedance of Device Z_d^n Discrete Model of a Device Impedance Z_e^n Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_h Impedance of Human Hand and Arm Z_i An Impedance Z_E^n Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_t Total Impedance of Human Hand and DeviceGreek Letters	$Z(\omega)$	Mechanical Impedance
Z_d^n Discrete Model of a Device Impedance Z_e^n Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_h Impedance of Human Hand and Arm Z_i An Impedance Z_E^n Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_t Total Impedance of Human Hand and DeviceGreek Letters	Z_c^n	Impedance of Virtual Coupling
Z_e^n Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_h Impedance of Human Hand and Arm Z_i An Impedance Z_E^n Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_t Total Impedance of Human Hand and DeviceGreek Letters	Z_d	Impedance of Device
Z_e^n Impedance of Virtual Environment Z_h Impedance of Human Hand and Arm Z_i An Impedance Z_E^n Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_t Total Impedance of Human Hand and DeviceGreek Letters	Z_d^n	Discrete Model of a Device Impedance
Z_h Impedance of Human Hand and Arm Z_i An Impedance Z_E^n Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_t Total Impedance of Human Hand and DeviceGreek Letters	$Z_e^{\tilde{n}}$	Impedance of Virtual Environment
Z_E^n Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling Z_t Total Impedance of Human Hand and DeviceGreek Letters		Impedance of Human Hand and Arm
<i>Z_t</i> Total Impedance of Human Hand and Device <i>Greek Letters</i>		An Impedance
<i>Z_t</i> Total Impedance of Human Hand and Device <i>Greek Letters</i>	Z_E^n	Total Impedance of Virtual Environment and Virtual Coupling
		Total Impedance of Human Hand and Device
A I Differential Threshold	Greek Lett	ers
	ΔI	Differential Threshold

 $\Delta I/I$ Weber Fraction ΔV Step Voltage Global Conditioning Index η к2 Condition Number Manipulability Index/Coefficient of Friction μ Friction μ_i Encoder Pulse ρ Smallest Singular Value of Jacobian σ_m Largest Singular Value of Jacobian σ_M

 τ_a^n Discrete Input Joint Torque

τ_i^n	Discrete Input to D/A
$ au_m$	Joint Torque
ω_b	(Operating) Bandwidth