

Cognitive Technologies

Managing Editors: D. M. Gabbay J. Siekmann

Editorial Board: A. Bundy J. G. Carbonell
M. Pinkal H. Uszkoreit M. Veloso W. Wahlster
M. J. Wooldridge

Advisory Board:

Luigia Carlucci Aiello
Franz Baader
Wolfgang Bibel
Leonard Bolc
Craig Boutilier
Ron Brachman
Bruce G. Buchanan
Anthony Cohn
Artur d'Avila Garcez
Luis Fariñas del Cerro
Koichi Furukawa
Georg Gottlob
Patrick J. Hayes
James A. Hendler
Anthony Jameson
Nick Jennings
Aravind K. Joshi
Hans Kamp
Martin Kay
Hiroaki Kitano
Robert Kowalski
Sarit Kraus
Maurizio Lenzerini
Hector Levesque
John Lloyd

Alan Mackworth
Mark Maybury
Tom Mitchell
Johanna D. Moore
Stephen H. Muggleton
Bernhard Nebel
Sharon Oviatt
Luis Pereira
Lu Ruqian
Stuart Russell
Erik Sandewall
Luc Steels
Oliviero Stock
Peter Stone
Gerhard Strube
Katia Sycara
Milind Tambe
Hidehiko Tanaka
Sebastian Thrun
Junichi Tsujii
Kurt VanLehn
Andrei Voronkov
Toby Walsh
Bonnie Webber

For further volumes:
<http://www.springer.com/series/5216>

Oleg Anshakov · Tamás Gergely

Cognitive Reasoning

A Formal Approach

With 6 Figures and 13 Tables

 Springer

Authors

Prof. D.Sc. Oleg M. Anshakov
Institute for Linguistics
Intelligent Systems Department
Russian State University
for the Humanities
6 Miusskaya Square
Moscow, 125993
Russia
oansh@yandex.ru

Prof. D.Sc. Tamás Gergely
Applied Logic Laboratory
H-1022 Budapest
Hankoczy u. 7
Hungary
gergely@all.hu

Managing Editors

Prof. Dov M. Gabbay
Augustus De Morgan Professor of Logic
Department of Computer Science
King's College London
Strand, London WC2R 2LS, UK

Prof. Dr. Jörg Siekmann
Forschungsbereich Deduktions- und
Multiagentensysteme, DFKI
Stuhlsatzenweg 3, Geb. 43
66123 Saarbrücken, Germany

Cognitive Technologies ISSN 1611-2482
ISBN 978-3-540-43058-2 e-ISBN 978-3-540-68875-4
DOI 10.1007/978-3-540-68875-4
Springer Heidelberg Dordrecht London New York

Library of Congress Control Number: 2009940796

ACM Computing Classification (1998): I.2, F.4, F.1, F.2, H.1, I.1, J.4

© Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg 2010

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilm or in any other way, and storage in data banks. Duplication of this publication or parts thereof is permitted only under the provisions of the German Copyright Law of September 9, 1965, in its current version, and permission for use must always be obtained from Springer. Violations are liable to prosecution under the German Copyright Law.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

Cover design: KunkelLopka GmbH, Heidelberg

Printed on acid-free paper

Springer is part of Springer Science+Business Media (www.springer.com)

Preface

Understanding cognition and modelling, designing and building artificial cognitive systems are challenging and long-term research problems. In this book authors wish to take a step towards a better understanding of cognition and its modelling by providing a well-founded integrated theory. Though this book is primarily not on cognitive system development, the need for an account of a genuine, logically well-founded formal framework seems to us especially important for system designers too. The authors' belief is that the practice of even those who most explicitly reject the need for theoretical foundation of intelligent systems on a constructive cognitive reasoning framework inevitably involves tacit appeal to insights and modes of reasoning that can be understood, designed and implemented.

This book had a long prehistory intertwined with the development of an important new method of plausible reasoning. The authors both participated in the development of the plausible reasoning technique which was called by its initiator V. K. Finn the JSM method of automatic generation of hypotheses in honour of the British thinker John Stuart Mill. This development has a long history of several decades, having already started in the former Soviet Union at the All-Russia Institute of Scientific and Technical Information (VINITI), Russian Academy of Sciences, Moscow. Some intensive periods of this development took place in co-operation with VINITI and the Applied Logic Laboratory, Budapest, Hungary.

The authors not only participated in the development of this method but also played key roles in the elaboration of the main results of this method.

Earlier, around the millennium, a book was planned to be written on the results obtained in the area of plausible reasoning provided by this method. Intensive and productive joint work was started with the participation of V. K. Finn, T. Gergely, S. O. Kuznetsov and D. P. Skvortsov on the preparation of the manuscript. It proved difficult at first, because coherence among the different viewpoints and techniques was not easy to establish. Soon after O. M. Anshakov joined the author team, replacing D. P. Skvortsov. The authors of this present book felt a pressing demand for the development of a new integrated approach that could provide a logic foundation for the entire area of cognitive reasoning. While working on the manuscript this feeling became stronger and stronger. Finally, having almost completed the manuscript,

work on it was suspended and the two authors started to realise their general goals. This took place around 2006. From then on the majority of the work was done in Budapest at the Applied Logic Laboratory. Authors wished to contribute to a better understanding of cognition and its modelling by developing a formal approach. This could provide a platform on which various existing approaches could be presented and handled.

Acknowledgements

We appreciate the long-standing cooperation and fruitful discussions we have had with Professor V.K. Finn and his research team.

We also thank the Applied Logic Laboratory for providing all the facilities and conditions for writing this book.

Special thanks go to Springer for its endless patience in every sense, as well as to the team that supported us to shape the final version.

Budapest–Moscow,
October 2009

Tamás Gergely
Oleg Anshakov

Contents

1	Introduction	1
1.1	What Is Cognition?	1
1.2	Cognizing Agents	4
1.3	Cognitive Reasoning	6
1.4	Logic and Cognitive Reasoning	10
1.5	Requirements for a Formal Cognitive Reasoning Theory	11
1.6	Objectives	13
1.7	The Formal Approach to Be Developed	14
1.8	Overview	15
Part I Conceptual Theory of Cognitive Reasoning		
2	Introductory Explanation	25
3	Basic System of Concepts	29
3.1	Facts and Knowledge	29
3.2	Truth Values: Informal Discussion	32
3.3	Reasoning	35
4	Constructing a Model of a Cognizing Agent	41
4.1	The Structure and Functioning of the Cognizing Agent	43
5	Cognitive Reasoning Framework	51
5.1	Theories of the CR Framework	52
5.2	Modelling Cognitive Reasoning in the CR Framework	60
Part II Logic Foundation		
6	Introductory Explanation	71

7	Propositional Logic	73
7.1	Notation	74
7.2	Classical Propositional Logic (Syntax and Semantics)	75
7.3	Classical Propositional Logic (Calculus)	77
7.4	Propositional PJ Logics (Syntax and Semantics)	78
7.5	PJ Logics (Calculus)	83
8	First-Order Logics	93
8.1	Terms and Notation	93
8.2	Classical First-Order Logic (Syntax and Semantics)	105
8.3	Classical First-Order Logic (Calculus)	108
8.4	First-Order PJ Logics (Syntax and Semantics)	110
8.5	First-Order PJ Logic (Calculus)	114
 Part III Formal CR Framework		
9	Introductory Explanation	127
10	Modification Calculi	131
10.1	State Descriptions over Sets of Constants	132
10.2	Inference	141
11	Derivability in Modification Calculi and L^1	159
11.1	Cuts of Record Strings: the General Case	159
11.2	(m, s) -Cuts	168
11.3	Deductive Cuts and Their Applications	179
11.4	Deductive Correctness	185
12	Semantics	195
12.1	Sequences of L -Structures	195
12.2	Structure Generators	198
13	Iterative Representation of Structure Generators	209
13.1	Immersiones and Snaps	209
13.2	Implementations and Extensions	213
13.3	Iterative Images	220
14	Modification Theories	237
14.1	Validity and Derivability	237
14.2	Modification Theories	244
15	Conformability	259
15.1	Locality	259
15.2	Atomic Sorts	268

Part IV Handling Complex Structures

16	Introductory Explanation	277
16.1	Atomic Sorts	277
16.2	Set Sorts	278
16.3	Some Properties of the Set Sorts	281
16.4	Modification Rules and Modification Calculi for Set Sorts	282
16.5	Example	284
17	Set-Admitting Structures	291
17.1	Atoms	291
17.2	Set Axioms	295
18	Set Sorts in Modification Calculi	301
18.1	Positive and Negative Connection w.r.t. Set Sorts	301
18.2	Generating Rules for Modification Rule Systems with Set Sorts	305
19	Perfect Modification Calculi (PMC)	313
19.1	Coherent Inferences in Perfect Modification Calculi (General Properties)	313
19.2	Modification Rules Within Coherent Inferences (Positive Case)	322
19.3	Modification Rules Within Coherent Inferences (Negative Case)	330
19.4	Conformability (Set Case)	337

Part V JSM Theories

20	Introductory Explanation	343
21	Simple JSM Theories	345
21.1	Basic JSM theories	345
21.2	Simple JSM Theories	346
21.3	Causal and Prediction Rules	349
21.4	Defining Axioms for the Simple JSM Theories	350
21.5	Simple JSM Theories with Exclusion of Counterexamples	352
22	Advanced JSM Theories	355
22.1	Generalised JSM Theories	355
22.2	Defining Axioms for the Generalised JSM Theories	359
22.3	Non-symmetric JSM Theories	361
23	Similarity Representation	365
23.1	Basic Concepts	365
23.2	Distinguishability Condition and Similarity Representation	367

24	JSM Theories for Complex Structures	371
24.1	JSM Theories with Set Sorts	371
24.2	Simple JSM Theories with Property Sets	373
24.3	Defining Axioms for the Simple JSM Theories with Property Sets ..	377
 Part VI Looking Back and Ahead		
25	Introductory Overview	383
26	Towards the Realisation	387
26.1	Object Model Description	387
26.2	Object Model Application	397
27	CR Framework	399
27.1	Conceptual CR Framework	399
27.2	Formal CR Framework	401
28	Open Problems	407
29	Philosophical–Methodological Implications of the Proposed CR Framework	411
29.1	Epistemology	411
29.2	Ontology	414
29.3	Methodology	416
References		421
Glossary		425
Index		431