

# Between Logic and Reality

# LOGIC, EPISTEMOLOGY, AND THE UNITY OF SCIENCE

---

VOLUME 25

---

## *Editors*

Shahid Rahman, *University of Lille III, France*

John Symons, *University of Texas at El Paso, U.S.A.*

## *Editorial Board*

Jean Paul van Bendegem, *Free University of Brussels, Belgium*

Johan van Benthem, *University of Amsterdam, The Netherlands*

Jacques Dubucs, *University of Paris I-Sorbonne, France*

Anne Fagot-Largeault, *Collège de France, France*

Bas van Fraassen, *Princeton University, U.S.A.*

Dov Gabbay, *King's College London, U.K.*

Jaakko Hintikka, *Boston University, U.S.A.*

Karel Lambert, *University of California, Irvine, U.S.A.*

Graham Priest, *University of Melbourne, Australia*

Gabriel Sandu, *University of Helsinki, Finland*

Göran Sundholm, *Universiteit Leiden, The Netherlands*

Heinrich Wansing, *Technical University Dresden, Germany*

Timothy Williamson, *Oxford University, U.K.*

*Logic, Epistemology, and the Unity of Science* aims to reconsider the question of the unity of science in light of recent developments in logic. At present, no single logical, semantical or methodological framework dominates the philosophy of science. However, the editors of this series believe that formal techniques like, for example, independence friendly logic, dialogical logics, multimodal logics, game theoretic semantics and linear logics, have the potential to cast new light on basic issues in the discussion of the unity of science.

This series provides a venue where philosophers and logicians can apply specific technical insights to fundamental philosophical problems. While the series is open to a wide variety of perspectives, including the study and analysis of argumentation and the critical discussion of the relationship between logic and the philosophy of science, the aim is to provide an integrated picture of the scientific enterprise in all its diversity.

For further volumes:

<http://www.springer.com/series/6936>

Majda Trobok · Nenad Mišćević · Berislav Žarnić  
Editors

# Between Logic and Reality

Modeling Inference, Action  
and Understanding

 Springer

*Editors*

Majda Trobok  
University of Rijeka  
Rijeka  
Croatia  
trobok@ffri.hr

Nenad Miščević  
University of Maribor  
Maribor  
Slovenia  
vismiscevic@ceu.hu

Berislav Žarnić  
University of Split  
Split  
Croatia  
berislav@ffst.hr

ISBN 978-94-007-2389-4 e-ISBN 978-94-007-2390-0

DOI 10.1007/978-94-007-2390-0

Springer Dordrecht Heidelberg London New York

Library of Congress Control Number: 2011941577

© Springer Science+Business Media B.V. 2012

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work.

Printed on acid-free paper

Springer is part of Springer Science+Business Media ([www.springer.com](http://www.springer.com))

# Preface

The papers collected in this book analyse the logic-mathematics-reality relationship from different approaches and perspectives. It connects logical theory with more concrete issues of rationality, normativity and understanding, thus pointing to a wide range of potential applications.

Let us say a few words about the context in which the book was created. Continuing a longer tradition that started in the 1980s by the members of the *Rijeka Analytic Philosophy Circle* (V. Muškardin, N. Smokrović, B. Berčić, S. Prijić-Samaržja, the editors of the present volume, and others), the *Department of Philosophy* at the *University of Rijeka* has been active in organizing international philosophical conferences and other philosophical events in Croatia establishing thus global and vital connections between the philosophers from all sides of the world with those from the local region, in particular those coming from academic communities in Bulgaria, Croatia, Hungary, Italy, Serbia and Slovenia. Thanks to its cosmopolitan atmosphere and a regard for logic, the *Department of Philosophy* at *University of Rijeka*, the only analytic department of philosophy in Croatia, has provided a supporting environment for promoting logico-philosophical research. The book originated from two recent conferences that took place in Rijeka.<sup>1</sup>

We were also lucky to have on our side the hospitality of the *Inter-University Center Dubrovnik*, where we organized or helped organizing a series of conferences, most notably the yearly courses/conferences *Analytic Philosophy: Epistemology and Metaphysics*, in particular the 2010 conference *The Philosophy of Logical Consequence* organized by Stewart Shapiro, and the *Mind, World and Action* course. Also, two larger scientific projects funded by the Ministry of Science, Education and Sports of Republic of Croatia have offered further institutional framework for the initiatives that have led to the assembling of the book: *Logic and Reality*, and *Logical Structures and Intentionality*.

---

<sup>1</sup> In 2006, *Analytic Philosophy—Logical Investigations*, and in 2009, *Contemporary Philosophical Issues—Logic and Reality*.

**Acknowledgments** We would like to thank those who helped in making this book possible. The two mentioned projects *Logic and Reality* (project number: 009-0091328-0941) and *Logical Structures and Intentionality* (project number: 191-1911111-2730) have been financed by the Ministry of Education of Science, Education and Sport of the Republic of Croatia—we are most grateful to the Ministry for its generous support.

We are indebted to *Kruzak*, the publisher of the *Croatian Journal of Philosophy*, for granting permission to republish the articles written by Stewart Shapiro, Dale Jacquette, and Imre Rusza.

Special thanks go to Stewart Shapiro, Dale Jacquette, Zsófia Zvolenszky and Ferenc Rusza for their generous support, and to Lovre Grisogono for technical assistance. And finally, last but not the least, to Lucy Fleet and Hendrikje Tuerlings of Springer for their unrelenting help and patience.

Rijeka, Croatia  
Maribor, Slovenia  
Split, Croatia  
April 2011

Majda Trobok  
Nenad Mišćević  
Berislav Žarnić

# Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction</b> .....	<b>1</b>
	Majda Trobok, Nenad Mišćević, and Berislav Žarnić	
<b>Part I Logical and Mathematical Structures</b>		
<b>2</b>	<b>Life on the Ship of Neurath: Mathematics in the Philosophy of Mathematics</b> .....	<b>11</b>
	Stewart Shapiro	
<b>3</b>	<b>Applied Mathematics in the Sciences</b> .....	<b>29</b>
	Dale Jacquette	
<b>4</b>	<b>The Philosophical Impact of the Löwenheim-Skolem Theorem</b> .....	<b>59</b>
	Miloš Arsenijević	
<b>5</b>	<b>Debating (Neo)logicism: Frege and the Neo-Fregeans</b> .....	<b>83</b>
	Majda Trobok	
<b>Part II Epistemology and Logic</b>		
<b>6</b>	<b>Informal Logic and Informal Consequence</b> .....	<b>101</b>
	Danilo Šuster	
<b>7</b>	<b>Logical Consequence and Rationality</b> .....	<b>121</b>
	Nenad Smokrović	
<b>8</b>	<b>Logic, Indispensability and Aposteriority</b> .....	<b>135</b>
	Nenad Mišćević	
<b>Part III Dynamic Logical Models of Meaning</b>		
<b>9</b>	<b>Extended Game-Theoretical Semantics</b> .....	<b>161</b>
	Manuel Rebuschi	
<b>10</b>	<b>Dynamic Logic of Propositional Commitments</b> .....	<b>183</b>
	Tomoyuki Yamada	

<b>11</b>	<b>Is Unsaying Polite?</b> .....	201
	Berislav Žarnić	
<b>Part IV Logical Methods in Ontological and Linguistic Analyses</b>		
<b>12</b>	<b>Towards a Formal Account of Identity Criteria</b> .....	227
	Massimiliano Carrara and Silvia Gaio	
<b>13</b>	<b>A Mereology for the Change of Parts</b> .....	243
	Pierdaniele Giaretta and Giuseppe Spolaore	
<b>14</b>	<b>Russell Versus Frege</b> .....	261
	Imre Rusza	
<b>15</b>	<b>Goodman's Only World</b> .....	269
	Vladan Djordjević	
<b>Index</b>	.....	281



# Contributors

**Miloš Arsenijević** Department of Philosophy, University of Belgrade, Čika Ljubina 18–20, 11000 Belgrade, Serbia, marsenij@f.bg.ac.rs

**Massimiliano Carrara** Department of Philosophy, University of Padua, Piazza Capitanio 3, 35139 Padua, Italy, massimiliano.carrara@unipd.it

**Vladan Djordjević** Department of Philosophy, University of Belgrade, Čika Ljubina 18–20, 11000 Belgrade, Serbia, vladan@ualberta.ca

**Silvia Gaio** Department of Philosophy, University of Padua, Piazza Capitanio 3, 35139 Padua, Italy, silvia.gαιο@unipd.it

**Pierdaniele Giarretta** Department of Philosophy, University of Padua, Piazza Capitanio 3, 35139 Padua, Italy, pierdaniele.giarretta@unipd.it

**Dale Jacquette** Universität Bern, Institut für Philosophie, Abteilung Logik und theoretische Philosophie, Untertobel, Länggassstrasse 49a, Bern 9, CH-3000, Switzerland, dale.jacquette@philo.unibe.ch

**Nenad Mišćević** Department of Philosophy, University of Maribor, Koroška 160, 2000 Maribor, Slovenia, vismiscovic@ceu.hu

**Manuel Rebuschi** L.H.S.P. – Archives H. Poincaré, Nancy University, France, manuel.rebuschi@univ-nancy2.fr

**Imre Rusza (1921–2008)** Department of Logic, Eötvös University, Budapest, Hungary

**Stewart Shapiro** Department of Philosophy, The Ohio State University, 350 University Hall, 230 North Oval Mall, Columbus, OH 43210, USA, shapiro.4@osu.edu

**Nenad Smokrović** Department of Philosophy, University of Rijeka, Slavka Krautzeka bb, 51000 Rijeka, Croatia, nenad@ffri.hr

**Giuseppe Spolaore** Department of Philosophy, University of Verona, Lungadige Porta Vittoria, 17 37129 Verona, Italy, giuseppe.spolaore@univr.it

**Danilo Šuster** Department of Philosophy, University of Maribor, Koroška 160, 2000 Maribor, Slovenia, danilo.suster@uni-mb.si

**Majda Trobok** Department of Philosophy, University of Rijeka, Slavka Krautzeka bb, 51000 Rijeka, Croatia, trobok@ffri.hr

**Tomoyuki Yamada** Graduate School of Letters, Hokkaido University, N10 W7, Kita-ku, Sapporo 060–0810, Japan, yamada@LET.hokudai.ac.jp

**Berislav Žarnić** Faculty of Philosophy, University of Split, Teslina 12, 21000 Split, Croatia, berislav@ffst.hr