

Lecture Notes in Artificial Intelligence

610

Subseries of Lecture Notes in Computer Science

Edited by J. Siekmann

Lecture Notes in Computer Science

Edited by G. Goos and J. Hartmanis



F. von Martial

Coordinating Plans of Autonomous Agents

Springer-Verlag

Berlin Heidelberg New York

London Paris Tokyo

Hong Kong Barcelona

Budapest

Series Editor

Jörg Siekmann

University of Saarland

German Research Center for Artificial Intelligence (DFKI)

Stuhlsatzenhausweg 3, W-6600 Saarbrücken 11, FRG

Author

Frank von Martial

DETECON GMBH

Aennchenstr. 19, W-5300 Bonn 2, FRG

CR Subject Classification (1991): I.2.11, H.5.3, I.2.8, H.1.2, I.2.1

ISBN 3-540-55615-X Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg New York

ISBN 0-387-55615-X Springer-Verlag New York Berlin Heidelberg

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, re-use of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other way, and storage in data banks. Duplication of this publication or parts thereof is permitted only under the provisions of the German Copyright Law of September 9, 1965, in its current version, and permission for use must always be obtained from Springer-Verlag. Violations are liable for prosecution under the German Copyright Law.

© Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg 1992

Printed in Germany

Typesetting: Camera ready by author/editor

Printing and binding: Druckhaus Beltz, Hemsbach/Bergstr.

45/3140-543210 - Printed on acid-free paper

Foreword

The use of computers to support collaborative work is an emerging trend that will have a significant impact on how we do our daily work, especially as our work becomes mediated by computerized intelligent assistants that understand our goals and plans. This book represents an important contribution to the field of *Computer-Supported Cooperative Work*. However, this book is also equally important to the area of *Distributed Artificial Intelligence* because of the techniques it develops for agent coordination, specifically multi-agent planning. It considers the issue of how plans that are developed autonomously by individual agents should be restructured when other agent plans are in conflict or when there exist beneficial relationships among them. The basic approach to the recognition of these relationships among agents' plans and their resolution is a distributed one.

This work is not only interesting for the computational techniques developed for plan coordination but also for the formal framework that underlies these techniques. The characterization of plan interactions among agents is built on a formal logical framework based on an event-based characterization of actions. This framework allows for the representation of concurrent actions in multiple agent plans, temporal relationships among actions, and plans at multiple levels of abstraction. Based on this framework, a taxonomy of plan relationships is defined that includes both positive and negative relationships among plans.

Negative relationships are those that may prevent either or both plans from carrying out their intended purpose. The basis for these negative relationships are due to shared resource usage or incompatible actions. Actions are incompatible when the action of one plan creates a logical state of the world which precludes another agent from successfully completing its action. Resource conflicts due to shared resource usage are further broken down into two categories, one involving consumable resources and the other non-consumable resources.

Positive relationships are also broken into categories involving equality, subsumption and favor. An equality relationship indicates the ability of an agent to carry out an action in another agent's plan and is the basis of task sharing. A subsumption relationship indicates that one agent's actions will make unnecessary an action of another agent. A favor relationship indi-

cates one agent has the potential for slightly altering its plan in such a way that the number of actions required by another agent to carry out the intended purpose of its plan is reduced. The formal specification of these relationships among agents' plans and how these relationships can be used to improve overall network problem solving is an important aspect of this work.

The major emphasis in the discussion on resolving negative conflicts is on those caused by shared access to non-consumable resources. The techniques for handling other types of conflicts are more domain-dependent in character and are not treated in detail. In a principled way, the alternative strategies for resolving this type of conflict are detailed based on temporal ordering constraints; additionally, heuristics are specified for choosing the order of resolving multiple conflicts among agents and for choosing among alternative strategies for resolving conflicts. The protocol for exploiting the favor relationship is also explored in detail. Especially interesting is the quantitative heuristics for deciding when the favor relationship should lead to agents restructuring their plans. The techniques for resolving non-consumable resource conflicts and exploiting favor relationships are explained through a number of examples which provide a good understanding.

The distributed negotiation protocols used by agents to recognize and resolve/exploit these plan relationships are some of the most sophisticated strategies yet devised for coordinating agent activities. They exploit the hierarchical nature of plan descriptions to reduce communication among agents, and can work with only partially expanded plan networks. These complex, multi-step, asynchronous protocols are extremely hard to verify for correctness. This work reworks and applies verification techniques, developed for the analysis of low-level network communication protocols, so that they can be used to verify these high-level negotiation protocols.

The final part of this book examines the design of a prototype system that supports collaborative work in the office domain based on the plan coordination techniques developed in early parts of the book. As part of the system, a planning subsystem is described, which is used to generate the activity plans of individual agents.

In summary, this book represents a thorough and deep investigation of an important topic in distributed AI and computer-supported collaborative work. It is clearly written with many examples and background material that should allow readers of both fields to understand it.

Preface

The ability to coordinate and negotiate is part of almost any intelligent behavior and, hence, reasoning about coordination is one of its fundamental components. This work deals with the coordination of distributed agents which have planning and communicative competence.

Important issues in this book are:

- How to recognize and reconcile conflicting intentions among a collection of agents.
- How to recognize and take advantage of favorable interactions.
- How to enable individual agents to represent and reason about the actions, plans, and knowledge of other agents in order to coordinate with them.
- When to call a set of plans "coordinated" and what operations are possible to transform uncoordinated plans into coordinated ones.
- How to enable agents to communicate and interact: what communication languages or protocols to use, and what and when to communicate.

We will present a novel approach to coordinate activities of autonomous agents. The intended actions of agents are described as plans. The coordination of plans is triggered by the relations which exist between the actions of different plans. With the help of an explicit model of multiagent plan relations a powerful approach for coordination is realized. Our model covers the whole spectrum from negative to positive relations between plans. Negative relations may prevent one or several of the plans from being executed as intended. Positive relations are all those relations between plans where some benefit to the agents can be derived by combining the plans. The handling of plan relations includes both the operations for conflict resolution and for the utilization of favorable relations and the way agents can interact and negotiate about their relations.

The main contributions of our work include:

- a detailed taxonomy of relations between plans of different agents,
- strategies for coordination and plan modifications based on these relations, and
- a negotiation framework for synchronizing activities.

The reader may also appreciate the thorough introduction to the field of *distributed artificial intelligence* and its subarea *multiagent planning*.

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank Jörg Siekmann for all his help during my research. His enthusiasm animated me very much when launching my research project. He accompanied my work with many constructive suggestions. I would like to express my gratitude to Wolfgang Wahlster for fruitful discussions and helpful comments on drafts of this book.

The research presented here grew mainly out of the author's contribution to the Assisting Computer project of GMD's Institute for Applied Information Technology, which is headed by Peter Hoschka. I would like to thank GMD for providing me with extremely satisfying working conditions. Thomas Kreifelts helped me to sharpen and develop some of my ideas. I am grateful for his many valuable comments on drafts of this book. During the time I worked at GMD he has always been a highly cooperative and friendly group leader. I would like to thank Frank Victor for inspiring me to write this book. Parts of the implementations of this research have been done by Thomas Kreifelts, Edgar Sommer, Frank Victor and Gerd Woetzel. I would like to thank them for their work. Peter Seuffert and Gerd Woetzel have helped me a lot with problems I had with the computing environment. I also owe great debt to Peter Wißkirchen for providing the basis of my research spirit.

I am particularly grateful to Victor Lesser for his valuable contributions to my research. His interest and belief in my work stimulated me very much and his criticism helped me to improve drafts of this book.

Christoph Weidenbach spent considerable time with me discussing mathematical aspects of my work. I would like to thank him for his efforts. I am also grateful to Toru Ishida, who introduced me into the field of Distributed Artificial Intelligence during the time I stayed at NTT in Japan.

My very special thanks go to my wife Suha and our kids Rascha, Simon and Marius for tolerating my not being available to them so often. Although highly motivated to study the mentally produced artificial agents of my research, I am much more fascinated by my physically produced human agents, namely our children. Suha also helped me very much with her encouraging and optimistic spirit to pursue my goal of writing this book.

Table of Contents

1	Introduction	1
1.1	Assumptions and Problems	3
1.2	Solution: A Relation Driven Coordination Process via Negotiation	6
1.2.1	Scheme for Coordinating Plans of Agents	6
1.2.2	Coordination as Improvement Instead of Optimization	8
1.2.3	Types of Agents.....	9
1.2.4	Phases of Activity Coordination.....	11
1.3	The Examples Used in this Book	12
2	Cooperation and Coordination of Intelligent Agents.....	15
2.1	Distributed Artificial Intelligence - An Overview.....	15
2.1.1	Distributed Artificial Intelligence and Related Disciplines.....	16
2.1.2	Historical Perspective	18
2.1.3	Motivating Distributed AI	20
2.1.4	Dimensions of Distributed AI.....	22
2.1.5	Application Domains for DAI Systems.....	26
2.2	Activity Coordination via Multiagent and Distributed Planning.....	28
2.2.1	A Planning Taxonomy.....	29
2.2.2	Single-agent and Multiagent Planning	31
2.2.3	Plan Coordination Versus Planning Versus Plan Recognition.....	33
2.3	Selected Related Work	36
2.3.1	Centralized Multiagent Planning	37
2.3.2	Distributed Planning	46

2.4	Communication and Negotiation.....	53
2.5	Critique of Existing Multiagent Planning Approaches.....	56
3	Actions and Plans in Multiagent Domains	59
3.1	Basic Notions.....	59
3.2	Actions.....	65
3.3	Temporal Relations.....	67
3.3.1	Interval Relationships.....	68
3.3.2	Complex Temporal Relationships	71
3.4	Plans.....	72
3.4.1	Plan Structure	72
3.4.2	Domain Predicates.....	75
3.4.3	Plan Refinement	76
3.4.4	Coordination Input.....	79
3.4.5	No Explicit Notion of Goals.....	80
4	Multiagent Plan Relations.....	83
4.1	Example.....	83
4.2	Negative Relations.....	89
4.3	Positive Relations	95
4.3.1	Equality.....	95
4.3.2	Subsumption	97
4.3.3	Favor.....	97
4.4	Request Relations	100
4.5	Coordinated Plans.....	101

5	Handling Plan Relations	105
5.1	Resolving Conflicts	105
5.1.1	Plan Modifications.....	106
5.1.2	Examples	109
5.1.3	Conflict Resolution Heuristics.....	116
5.2	Using the Favor Relation.....	128
5.2.1	Favor Detection	129
5.2.2	Plan Modifications.....	129
5.2.3	Quantitative Aspects of a Favor Relation Driven Cooperation.....	131
5.2.4	Example for Favor Relation Detection and Exploitation	135
5.2.5	Delivery Scenario: The Favor Relation in a Transportation Domain.....	137
5.3	Relation Handling in General.....	143
5.4	Summary of Plan Modification and Coordination Operators.....	145
6	Negotiation for Plan Coordination.....	147
6.1	Requirements for Communication.....	147
6.2	The Protocol: Messages, Agents and Conversation Rules	151
6.3	A Different Notation for Communication Behavior.....	157
6.4	Appendix: Technical Problems in Installing a Conversation Protocol.....	159
7	A Synthesized Model of Distributed Planning by Autonomous Cooperating Agents	167
7.1	Environment	167
7.2	Agent States.....	168
7.3	Coordination Process.....	170

7.4	Revival of the Art and Bert Example	173
7.5	Mobile Vehicles as Autonomous Agents	178
8	Plan Coordination for Office Automation and Computer-Supported Cooperative Work	185
8.1	Coordination of Distributed Planning Activities in Organizations	185
8.1.1	What is the Office and CSCW?	186
8.1.2	Inherent Distribution in the Office	188
8.1.3	Distributed Project Planning and Management	190
8.2	Implementation	192
8.2.1	Modules	194
8.2.2	A Multiagent Planning Support System	200
8.2.3	Plan Synchronizer.....	209
9	Conclusions	215
9.1	Research Issues and Contributions	216
9.2	Future Work.....	218
	References.....	221
	Abbreviations	239
	List of Figures	241
	List of Tables	243
	Index	245