PUBLISHER CORRECTION



Publisher Correction to: The Ethics of AI Ethics: An Evaluation of Guidelines

Thilo Hagendorff¹

Published online: 28 July 2020 © Springer Nature B.V. 2020

Correction to: Minds and Machines (2020) 30:99–120 http://doi.org/10.1007/s11023-020-09517-8

In the original publication of this article, the Table 1 has been published in a low resolution. Now a larger version of Table 1 is published in this correction. The publisher apologizes for the error made during production.

The original article can be found online at https://doi.org/10.1007/s11023-020-09517-8.

Cluster of Excellence "Machine Learning: New Perspectives for Science", University of Tuebingen, Tübingen, Germany



[☐] Thilo Hagendorff thilo.hagendorff@uni-tuebingen.de

458 T. Hagendorff

 Table 1 Overview of AI ethics guidelines and the different issues they cover

Al Protection principles of Al of Al products principles of Al of Al privacy protection fairness, non-discrimination, justice accountability transparency, openness safety, cybersecurity common good, sustainability, well-being human oversight, control, auditing solidarity, inclusion, social cohesion explainability, interpretability science-policy link legislative framework, legal status of Al systems future of employment/worker rights future of employment/worker rights future of employment/worker rights dual-use problem, military, Al arms race field specific deliberations (health, military, mobility etc.) human autonomy diversity in the field of Al control of Al products protection of whistiseblowers cuttured of employment for Al products protection of whistiseblowers cuttured of employment for Al products protection of whistiseblowers cuttured of employment for Al products protection of whistiseblowers cuttured of employment for Al products protection of whistiseblowers cuttured of employment for Al products protection of whistiseblowers cuttured of employment for Al products protection of whistiseblowers cuttured of employment for Al products protection of whistiseblowers cuttured of employment for Al products protection of whistiseblowers cuttured of employment for Al products protection of whistiseblowers cuttured of employment for Al products protection of whistiseblowers cuttured of employment for Al products protection of whistiseblowers cuttured of employment for Al products protection of whistiseblowers cuttured of employment for Al products protection of whistiseblowers cuttured of employment for Al products protection of whistiseblowers cuttured of employment for Al products protection of whistiseblowers cuttured for Al products protection of the protection of the protection of the pr	able I Overview of Al ethics gui	1								
private at al. 2018) of extra at al. 2018 of extra at 201		The European Commission's High-Leve I Expert Group on Artificial Intelligence	Report on the Future of Artificial Intelligence	Beijing Al Principles	DECD Recommendation of the Council on Artificial Intelligence	The Malicious Use of Artificial Intelligence	Al4People	The Asilomar Al Principles	Al Now 2016 Report	Al Now 2017 Report
Ley issue Al principles Al principles of the US of the U	authors			Academy of Artificial Intelligence	for Economic Co- operation and Development			Life Institute		
falmess, non-discrimination, justice accountability transparency, openness safety, cybersecurity common good, sustainability, well-being human oversight, control, auditing solidarity, indusion, social cohesion explainability, interpretabiliy science-policy link legislative framework, legal status of AI systems future of employment/worker rights responsible/intensified research funding public awareness, education about AI and its risks dual-use problem, military, AI arms race field-specific deliberations (health, military, mobility etc.) human autonomy diversity in the field of AI certification for AI products protection of whistieblowers cultural differences in the ethically aligned design of AI systems ontess on technical implementations ves, but very few none none none ves none none rone rone rone rone rone rone	key issue					abuse scenarios of	analysis about principles for the beneficial	collection of different	on social implications	on social implications
accountability transparency, openness safety, openness sold safety, interpretability sold sold safety, indusion, social cohesion safety, openness sold safety, indusion, social cohesion sold safety, indusion	privacy protection	х		×	х	×	×	×	×	х
transparency, openness safety, cybersecurity common good, sustainability, well-being human oversight, control, auditing solidarity, inclusion, social cohesion explainability, interpretability science-policy link legisliative framework, legal status of AI systems future of employment/worker rights responsible/intensified research funding public ewareness, education about AI and its risks dual-use problem, military, AI arms race field-specific deliberations (health, military, mobility etc.) human autonomy diversity in the field of AI certification for AI products protection of whistleblowers cultural differences in the ethically aligned design of AI systems hidden costs (labeling, clickwork, contend moderation, energy, secures) notes on technical implementations yes, but very few none none yes none none none none none none none no	fairness, non-discrimination, justice	×	×	х	×		×	×	×	х
safety, cybersecurity common good, sustainability, well-being human oversight, control, auditing solidarity, inclusion, social cohesion explainability, interpretability science-policy link legislative framework, legal status of Al systems future of employment/worker rights responsible/intensified research funding public awareness, education about Al and its risks dual-use problem, military, Al arms race field-specific deliberations (health, military, mobility etc.) human autonomy diversity in the field of Al cartification for Al products protection of whistleblowers cultural differences in the ethically aligned design of Al systems indeen costs (labeling, dickwork, contend moderation, energy, resources) notes on technical implementations yes, but very few none none yes none none none none proportion of women among authors (t/m) (8/10) (2/3) rs ss (5/21) (5/8) rs (4/2) (3/1) length (number of words)	accountability	×	×	×	×	×	×	×	×	
common good, sustainability, well-being human oversight, control, auditing solidarity, inclusion, social cohesion explainability, interpretability science-policy link legislative framework, legal status of Al systems future of employment/worker rights responsible/intensified research funding public awareness, education about Al and its risks dual-use problem, military, Al arms race field-specific deliberations (health, military, mobility etc.) human autonomy diversity in the field of Al certification for Al products protection of whistleblowers cultural differences in the ethically aligned design of Al systems hidden costs (labeling, clickwork, contend moderation, energy, resources) notes on technical implementations yes, but very none none none yes none none none none none none none none	transparency, openness	х	×	х	×	×		х	×	х
human oversight, control, auditing solidarity, indusion, social cohesion explainability, interpretability science-policy link legislative framework, legal status of AI systems future of employment/worker rights responsible/intensified research funding public awareness, education about AI and its risks dual-use problem, military, AI arms race field-specific deliberations (health, military, mobility etc.) human autonomy diversity in the field of AI certification for AI products protection of whistleblowers cultural differences in the ethically aligned design of AI systems hidden costs (fabeling, clickwork, contend moderation, energy, resources) notes on technical implementations Yes, but very none none none yes none none none proportion of women among authors (I/m) (8/10) (2/3) ns ns (5/21) (5/8) ns (4/2) (3/1) length (number of words)	safety, cybersecurity	×	×	×	×	×	×	×		
solidarity, inclusion, social cohesion explainability, interpretability science-policy link legislative framework, legal status of Al systems future of employment/worker rights responsible/intensified research funding public awareness, education about Al and its risks dual-use problem, military, Al arms race field-specific deliberations (health, military, mobility etc.) human autonomy diversity in the field of Al certification for Al products protection of whistleblowers cultural differences in the ethically aligned design of Al systems notes on technical implementations Yes, but very emproyers on the service of the status of Al 22787, 766 3249 34017, 8609 646 11530 18273 Filiation (programment industry, cionena) Filiation (programme	common good, sustainability, well-being		×	×	х		×	×	×	x
explainability, interpretabiliy science-policy link legislative framework, legal status of Al systems future of employment/worker rights responsible/intensified research funding public awareness, education about Al and its risks dual-use problem, military, Al arms race field-specific deliberations (health, military, mobility etc.) human autonomy diversity in the field of Al certification for Al products protection of whistleblowers cultural differences in the ethically aligned design of Al systems other country, resources) notes on technical implementations yes, but very few none none yes none none none none proportion of women among authors (I/m) (8/10) (2/3) ns ns (5/21) (5/8) ns (4/2) (3/1) length (number of words).	human oversight, control, auditing	×		×	×		×	×		×
science-policy link legislative framework, legal status of AI systems future of employment/worker rights responsible/intensified research funding public awareness, education about AI and its risks dual-use problem, military, AI arms race field-specific deliberations (health, military, mobility etc.) human autonomy diversity in the field of AI certification for AI products protection of whistleblowers cultural differences in the ethically aligned design of AI systems notes on technical implementations yes, but very few none none yes none none none none proportion of women among authors (f/m) (8/10) (2/3) ns ns (5/21) (5/8) ns (4/2) (3/1) length (number of words).	solidarity, inclusion, social cohesion			×	×		×		×	
legislative framework, legal status of Al systems future of employment/worker rights responsible/intensified research funding public awareness, education about Al and its risks dual-use problem, military, Al arms race field-specific deliberations (health, military, mobility etc.) human autonomy diversity in the field of Al certification for Al products protection of whistleblowers cultural differences in the ethically aligned design of Al systems notes on technical implementations yes, but very few none none none yes none none none none proportion of women among authors (I/m) length (number of words) responsible/intensified research funding which is the field of Al and its risks dual-use problem, military, Al arms race field-specific deliberations (health, military, mobility etc.) human autonomy diversity in the field of Al certification for Al products protection of whistleblowers cultural differences in the ethically aligned design of Al systems cultural differences in the ethically aligned design of Al systems cultural differences in the ethically aligned moderation, energy, resources) responsible fine the products of	explainability, interpretabiliy	×		×			×	×		×
future of employment/worker rights responsible/intensified research funding public awareness, education about Al and its risks dual-use problem, military, Al arms race field-specific deliberations (health, military, mobility etc.) human autonomy diversity in the field of Al certification for Al products protection of whistleblowers cultural differences in the ethically aligned design of Al systems indiden costs (labeling, clickwork, contend moderation, energy, resources) notes on technical implementations yes, but very few none none none yes none none none none none none none no	science-policy link		х	×		х	×	×	х	
responsible/intensified research funding public awareness, education about AI and its risks dual-use problem, military, AI arms race field-specific deliberations (health, military, mobility etc.) human autonomy diversity in the field of AI certification for AI products protection of whistleblowers cultural differences in the ethically aligned design of AI systems hidden costs (labeling, clickwork, contend moderation, energy, resources) notes on technical implementations yes, but very few none none yes none none none none proportion of women among authors (I/m) (8/10) (2/3) ns ns (5/21) (5/8) ns (4/2) (3/1) length (number of words) 1 18273	legislative framework, legal status of AI systems	×	×		×	×	×		×	
public awareness, education about AI and its risks dual-use problem, military, AI arms race field-specific deliberations (health, military, mobility etc.) human autonomy diversity in the field of AI certification for AI products protection of whistleblowers cultural differences in the ethically aligned design of AI systems notes on technical implementations yes, but very few none none yes none none none none proportion of women among authors (f/m) (8/10) (2/3) ns ns (5/21) (5/8) ns (4/2) (3/1) length (number of words) response to the control of the product of the control	future of employment/worker rights		×	×	×				×	
dual-use problem, military, Al arms race field-specific deliberations (health, military, mobility etc.) human autonomy diversity in the field of Al certification for Al products protection of whistleblowers cultural differences in the ethically aligned design of Al systems cultural differences in the ethically aligned design of Al systems notes on technical implementations yes, but very few none none none yes none none none none proportion of women among authors (I/m) [8/10] (2/3) ns ns (5/21) (5/8) ns (4/2) (3/1) length (number of words) [8/10] (2/3) 7 766 3249 34017 8609 646 11530 18273	responsible/intensified research funding		×		×		х	х	×	
human autonomy diversity in the field of AI certification for AI products protection of whistleblowers cultural differences in the ethically aligned design of AI systems hidden costs (labeling, clickwork, contend moderation, energy, resources) notes on technical implementations yes, but very few none none none yes none none none none none proportion of women among authors (I/m) [8/10] (2/3) ns ns (5/21) (5/8) ns (4/2) (3/1) length (number of words) [8/10] (2/37) 7/66 3249 34017 8609 646 11530 18273	public awareness, education about AI and its risks		×	х			х		×	
human autonomy diversity in the field of AI certification for AI products protection of whistleblowers cultural differences in the ethically aligned design of AI systems hidden costs (labeling, clickwork, contend moderation, energy, resources) notes on technical implementations yes, but very few none none yes none none none none proportion of women among authors (I/m) (8/10) (2/3) ns ns (5/21) (5/8) ns (4/2) (3/1) length (number of words) 16546 22787 766 3249 3017 8609 646 11530 18273	dual-use problem, military, Al arms race		×			×		х		х
diversity in the field of AI certification for AI products protection of whistleblowers cultural differences in the ethically aligned design of AI systems fielden costs (labeling, clickwork, contend moderation, energy, resources) notes on technical implementations yes, but very few none none yes none none none none none proportion of women among authors (f/m) [8/10] (2/3) ns ns (5/21) (5/8) ns (4/2) (3/1) [8/10] (16546 22787 766 3249 34017 8609 646 11530 18273	field-specific deliberations (health, military, mobility etc.)		×			×			×	×
certification for Al products protection of whistleblowers cultural differences in the ethically aligned design of Al systems hidden costs (labeling, clickwork, contend moderation, energy, resources) notes on technical implementations yes, but very few none none yes none none none none none none none no	human autonomy	×		×	×		×	×		
protection of whistleblowers cultural differences in the ethically aligned design of AI systems hidden costs (labeling, clickwork, contend moderation, energy, resources) notes on technical implementations yes, but very none none none yes none none none none none none none no	diversity in the field of Al								×	×
cultural differences in the ethically aligned design of Al systems hidden costs (labeling, clickwork, contend moderation, energy, resources) notes on technical implementations yes, but very few none none none none none none none no	certification for Al products						х			
systems hidden costs (labeling, clickwork, contend moderation, energy, resources) notes on technical implementations yes, but very few none none none yes none none none none none proportion of women among authors (f/m) (8/10) (2/3) ns ns (5/21) (5/8) ns (4/2) (3/1) length (number of words) 16546 22787 766 3249 34017 8609 646 11530 18273	protection of whistleblowers									
hidden costs (labeling, clickwork, contend moderation, energy, resources) notes on technical implementations yes, but very none none none none none none none non										
notes on technical implementations yes, but very few none none none none none none none no	hidden costs (labeling, clickwork, contend moderation,									
proportion of women among authors (I/m) (8/10) (2/3) ns ns (5/21) (5/8) ns (4/2) (3/1) length (number of words) 16546 22787 766 3249 34017 8609 646 11530 18273 18274 18			none	none	none	yes	none	none	none	none
affiliation (agramment industry science) agramment science science science science science science	proportion of women among authors (f/m)		(2/3)	ns	ns	(5/21)	(5/8)	ns	(4/2)	(3/1)
number of ethical aspects 9 12 13 12 8 14 12 13 9				gov./ind.						



Table 1 (continued)

lable 1 (continued)	ı						I		
	Al Now 2018 Report	Al Now 2019 Report	Principles for Accountable Algorithms and a Social Impact Statement for Algorithms	Montréal Declaration for Responsible Development of Artificial Intelligence	OpenAl Charter	Ethically Aligned Design: A Vision for Prioritzing Human Well-being with Autonomous and Intelligent Systems (Version for Public Discussion)	Ethically Aligned Design: A Vision for Prioritzing Human Well-being with Autonomous and Intelligent Systems (First Edition)	ITI Al Policy Principles	Microsoft AI principles
authors	(Whittaker et al. 2018)	(Crawford et al. 2019)	(Diakopoulos et al.)	(Abrassart et al. 2018)	(OpenAl 2018)	(The IEEE Global Initiative on Ethics of Autonomus and Intelligent Systems 2016)	(The IEEE Global Initiative on Ethics of Autonomus and Intelligent Systems 2019)	(Information Technology Industry Council 2017)	(Microsoft Corporation 2019)
key issue	statements on social implications of Al	statements on social implications of Al	principles of the FAT ML community	code of ethics released by the Université de Montréal	several short principles for the ethical use of Al	detailed description of ethical aspects in the context of Al	detailed description of ethical aspects in the context of Al	brief guideline about basic ethical principles	short list of keywords for the ethical use of Al
privacy protection	×	х		х		×	×	×	×
fairness, non-discrimination, justice	×	х	х	х		×	×		х
accountability	х		х	х		×	х	×	×
transparency, openness	×	X	×	х		×	×		×
safety, cybersecurity		×		×	×	×	×	×	×
common good, sustainability, well-being		x		×	×	×	×		
human oversight, control, auditing	×		×		×		х	×	
solidarity, inclusion, social cohesion	×	×		×			×		×
explainability, interpretabiliy			×	×			х	×	
science-policy link	×				×		х		
legislative framework, legal status of AI systems	×	х				×	×		
future of employment/worker rights		×				×	×	×	
responsible/intensified research funding						×		×	
public awareness, education about AI and its risks						×	×	×	
dual-use problem, military, AI arms race		Х		х		×			
field-specific deliberations (health, military, mobility etc.)	×	х				×	×		
human autonomy				×			×		
diversity in the field of AI	×	Х		х				х	
certification for AI products						×	х		
protection of whistleblowers	×	Х					×		
cultural differences in the ethically aligned design of Al systems						х	×		
hidden costs (labeling, clickwork, contend moderation, energy, resources)	×	×							
notes on technical implementations	none	none	none	none	none	none	none	none	none
proportion of women among authors (f/m)	(6/4)	(12/4)	(1/12)	(8/10)	ns	varies in each chapter	varies in each chapter	ns	ns
length (number of words)	25759	38970	1359	4754	441	40915	108.092	2272	75
affiliation (government, industry, science) number of ethical aspects	science 12	science 13	science 5	science 11	non-profit	industry 14	industry 18	industry 9	industry 6



460 T. Hagendorff

Table 1 (continued)

	DeepMind Ethics & Society Principles	Artificial Intelligence at Google	Everyday Ethics for Artificial Intelligence	Partnership on Al	number of mentions
authors	(DeepMind)	(Google 2018)	(Cutler et al. 2018)	(Partnership on Al 2018)	
key issue	several short principles for the ethical use of Al	several short principles for the ethical use of Al	IBM's short list of keywords for the ethical use of Al	principles of an association between several industry leaders	
privacy protection		х	×	×	18
fairness, non-discrimination, justice		×	×	×	18
accountability			×	×	17
transparency, openness	×				16
safety, cybersecurity		х		×	16
common good, sustainability, well-being	x	x	×	×	16
human oversight, control, auditing		х			12
solidarity, inclusion, social cohesion	х			x	11
explainability, interpretabiliy			×		10
science-policy link	x				10
legislative framework, legal status of AI systems					10
future of employment/worker rights				×	9
responsible/intensified research funding	×				8
public awareness, education about AI and its risks				×	8
dual-use problem, military, Al arms race		x			8
field-specific deliberations (health, military, mobility etc.)					8
human autonomy					7
diversity in the field of Al	х				7
certification for Al products			×		4
protection of whistleblowers					3
cultural differences in the ethically aligned design of Al systems					2
hidden costs (labeling, clickwork, contend moderation, energy, resources)					2
notes on technical implementations	none	none	none	none	
proportion of women among authors (f/m)	ns	ns	(1/2)	ns	(55/77)
length (number of words)	417	882	4488	1481	•
affiliation (government, industry, science)	industry	industry	industry	industry	
number of ethical aspects	6	6	6	8	



Publisher's Note Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

