

Lecture Notes in Artificial Intelligence 2953

Edited by J. G. Carbonell and J. Siekmann

Subseries of Lecture Notes in Computer Science

Springer

Berlin

Heidelberg

New York

Hong Kong

London

Milan

Paris

Tokyo

Karsten Konrad

Model Generation for Natural Language Interpretation and Analysis



Springer

Series Editors

Jaime G. Carbonell, Carnegie Mellon University, Pittsburgh, PA, USA
Jörg Siekmann, University of Saarland, Saarbrücken, Germany

Author

Karsten Konrad
XtraMind Technologies GmbH
Stuhlsatzenhausweg 3, 66123 Saarbrücken, Germany
E-mail: konrad@xtramind.com

Cataloging-in-Publication Data applied for

A catalog record for this book is available from the Library of Congress.

Bibliographic information published by Die Deutsche Bibliothek
Die Deutsche Bibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie;
detailed bibliographic data is available in the Internet at <<http://dnb.ddb.de>>.

CR Subject Classification (1998): I.2.7, I.2, F.4.1, I.7, J.5

ISSN 0302-9743

ISBN 3-540-21069-5 Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg New York

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, re-use of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other way, and storage in data banks. Duplication of this publication or parts thereof is permitted only under the provisions of the German Copyright Law of September 9, 1965, in its current version, and permission for use must always be obtained from Springer-Verlag. Violations are liable for prosecution under the German Copyright Law.

Springer-Verlag is a part of Springer Science+Business Media

springeronline.com

© Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg 2004

Printed in Germany

Typesetting: Camera-ready by author, data conversion by Olgun Computergrafik
Printed on acid-free paper SPIN: 10988374 06/3142 5 4 3 2 1 0

Foreword

This monograph is a revised version of Karsten Konrad's doctoral dissertation. It focuses on a topic of rapidly increasing importance in computer science: the development of inference tools tailored to applications in Natural Language Processing. Technology in mathematical theorem proving has undergone an impressive development during the last two decades, resulting in a variety of attractive systems for applications in mathematical deduction and knowledge processing. Natural Language Processing has become a theme of outstanding relevance in information technology, mainly due to the explosive growth of the World-Wide Web, where by far the largest part of the information is encoded in natural language documents. The book appears at a pivotal moment, when much attention is being paid to the task of adding a semantic layer to the Web, and representation and processing of NL-based semantic information pops up as the primary requirement for further technological progress.

Konrad's book argues for the Model generation paradigm as a framework, which supports specific tasks of natural language interpretation and NL-based inference in a natural way. It presents extensions in several respects: restricted techniques of model generation for higher-order logics, which are useful for the construction of semantic representations, as well as refined methods for minimal model generation. The latter support the use of world knowledge in natural language inference and realize a concept of preferential reasoning. The proposed method is similar in its results to NL applications of weighted abduction, but it obtains these results in a more systematic and transparent way.

Konrad applies his variant of model generation to selected topics in NL semantics: the well-known problem of reference resolution for anaphoric definite noun phrases, and the selection of readings for reciprocal pronouns. His method provides natural and general solutions for a variety of phenomena, which hitherto had to be treated by enumeration of variants. The inference problems are delegated to the KIMBA model generator, an innovative implementation of the inference method in the constraint programming framework.

Certainly the book does not offer final solutions, but it opens a perspective on a fascinating and highly relevant field of future research, and it offers tools to start out with. The book is nicely written, it provides motivation and background to readers who are unfamiliar with part of this interdisciplinary research area. I strongly recommend it to readers both from the NLP and the deduction communities.

Manfred Pinkal

Table of Contents

1	Motivation	1
1.1	The Subject of This Volume	1
1.2	Interpretation, Analysis, Computation	2
1.2.1	Interpretation	2
1.2.2	Analysis	3
1.2.3	Computation	4
1.3	Acknowledgments	5

Part I Logics

2	Model Generation	9
2.1	Introduction	9
2.2	Preliminaries	9
2.3	Topics	10
2.3.1	Models and Decidability	10
2.3.2	Herbrand Models	11
2.3.3	Finite Models	11
2.3.4	Representations	12
2.3.5	Minimality	12
2.3.6	Subset Minimality	12
2.3.7	Domain Minimality	13
2.3.8	Predicate-Specific Minimality	13
2.3.9	Enumeration	14
2.3.10	Model Enumeration with Theorem Provers	14
2.3.11	Enumeration with Finite Model Generators	14
2.4	Methods	15
2.4.1	Analytical Tableaux	15
2.4.2	Ground Tableaux	16
2.4.3	Free Variable Tableaux	16
2.4.4	Positive Unit Hyper-resolution	17
2.4.5	A Method Complete for Finite Satisfiability	19

2.4.6	The Davis-Putnam Procedure	20
2.4.7	Calculus and Procedure	20
2.4.8	Branches as Models	21
2.4.9	Efficiency	22
2.5	Related Work	22
3	Higher-Order Model Generation	25
3.1	The λ -Calculus in Linguistics	25
3.1.1	Composition of Meaning	26
3.1.2	Quantification in Natural Language	26
3.1.3	Quantifiers as Higher-Order Expressions	27
3.1.4	First-Order Limitations	29
3.1.5	A Motivation for a New Kind of Logic	30
3.2	Higher-Order Logic	31
3.2.1	Syntax	31
3.2.2	Types	31
3.2.3	Terms	32
3.2.4	Semantics	32
3.2.5	Functional Interpretations	33
3.2.6	Logical Constants	33
3.2.7	Defining a Logic	34
3.2.8	Standard Frames and Generalised Interpretations	35
3.2.9	Model Generation for Generalised Frames?	35
3.2.10	Equivalency for Higher-Order Atoms	36
3.2.11	Function Domains and Quantification	37
3.3	A Fragment of Higher-Order Logic	38
3.3.1	Syntax	39
3.3.2	Semantics	40
3.3.3	Constant Frames	40
3.3.4	Interpretations and Denotations	40
3.3.5	An $\mathcal{MQL}$ Logic	42
3.3.6	Connectives	42
3.3.7	Quantifiers	43
3.3.8	Definitions	44
3.3.9	Equality	45
3.4	Constructing Models	45
3.4.1	Determining Models Intelligently	46
3.4.2	Formulas as Constraints	46
3.4.3	Solving Constraints	46
3.4.4	Translating Formulas into Constraints	48
3.4.5	An Example	50
3.4.6	Properties of the Translation	51
3.4.7	Refutation Soundness	51
3.4.8	Completeness for $\mathcal{MQL}$ Satisfiability	52
3.4.9	Enumerating Models	53

4	Minimal Model Generation	55
4.1	Preliminaries	55
4.2	Decidability of Local Minimality	55

Part II Linguistics

5	The Analysis of Definites	59
5.1	Introduction	59
5.1.1	The Semantics of Definite Descriptions	60
5.1.2	Definites and Deduction	60
5.1.3	How Models Interpret Sentences	61
5.1.4	Discourse Models	62
5.1.5	Models for Definites	63
5.1.6	Uniqueness and Lots of Rabbits	65
5.2	Some Representations	67
5.2.1	Simple Cases	67
5.2.2	Donkeys, Context Sets, and Anaphoric Use	68
5.2.3	Quantifiers and Donkey Sentences	68
5.2.4	Context Set Restrictions	69
5.2.5	The Treatment of Names	71
5.2.6	Restrictions with Knowledge	71
5.2.7	Implicit Knowledge and Accommodation	72
5.2.8	Bridging	73
5.2.9	Simple Cases Revisited	74
5.2.10	Non-resolvable Anaphora in DRT	74
5.2.11	Definites Are Not Anaphora	75
5.2.12	Non-existence	76
5.3	What We Have Learned so Far	76
6	Reciprocity	79
6.1	Introduction	79
6.2	Exploring the Meaning of <i>Each Other</i>	80
6.2.1	Reciprocals for Larger Groups	81
6.2.2	Classifying Reciprocal Meaning	82
6.2.3	Strong Reciprocity	82
6.2.4	One-Way Weak Reciprocity	83
6.2.5	Inclusive Alternative Ordering	83
6.2.6	Intermediate Reciprocity	84
6.2.7	Intermediate Alternative Reciprocity	84
6.2.8	Strong Alternative Reciprocity	85
6.2.9	Parameterisation	85
6.2.10	The Landscape of Reciprocity	85
6.2.11	Parameterised Definitions	86
6.2.12	Interpreting Reciprocals	87

6.2.13	The Strongest Meaning Hypothesis	87
6.2.14	A Counter-Example	88
6.2.15	The SMH Does Not Compute (Yet)	88
6.3	Inference to Best Reciprocal Meaning	89
6.3.1	To Strong Meaning through Minimality	90
6.3.2	Predicate Minimisation	91
6.3.3	A Logical Encoding of Less Is More	92
6.3.4	A First Attempt at Computation	92
6.3.5	First Method: Minimality by Proof	93
6.3.6	Second Method: Minimality by Bounded Search	93
6.3.7	Third Method: A Two-Stage Combination	93
6.3.8	An Example	94
6.3.9	Conservative Minimality	96
6.4	Experiments	98
6.4.1	Pitchers and Pearls	98
6.4.2	The Boston Pitchers	99
6.4.3	Pearls	99
6.4.4	Measles	100
6.4.5	Marriages	101
6.5	Loose Ends	102
6.6	How We Can Understand Each Other	102
7	Abduction	105
7.1	What Is Abduction?	105
7.1.1	A Formal Definition of Abduction	106
7.2	Models for Anaphora Resolution	107
7.2.1	Chasing the Criminal	107
7.2.2	Explaining Resolutions	108
7.2.3	Discussion	109
7.2.4	Incremental Inference instead of Generate-and-Test	110
7.2.5	An Alternative by Conservative Minimality	111
7.3	Weighted Abduction	113
7.3.1	Logic Programming and Abduction	113
7.3.2	Abductive Explanations	114
7.3.3	Weights and Costs	115
7.3.4	Applications	117
7.3.5	Definite Reference	117
7.3.6	Composite Noun Phrases	118
7.3.7	Resolving Ambiguity	119
7.3.8	Discussion	120
7.3.9	Similarities	121
7.3.10	Differences and Comparison	122

8	Implementation	125
8.1	Introduction	125
8.2	System Architecture	126
8.3	The Syntax	127
8.3.1	Logical Constants	127
8.3.2	Formulas	128
8.3.3	Problem Specifications	129
8.3.4	A Small Example	129
8.3.5	Definitions	130
8.4	The Semantics	130
8.4.1	Logic Definition Structures	131
8.4.2	Propagator Procedures	131
8.4.3	Connectives	131
8.4.4	Monadic Quantifiers	133
8.4.5	Diadic Quantifiers	134
8.4.6	The Translation	136
8.5	Proof Engines and Controlling Search	137
8.5.1	Proof Engines	138
8.5.2	Search	141
8.6	System Performance	142
8.6.1	Identifying Single Solutions	143
8.6.2	KIMBA as a Propositional Theorem Prover	144
8.6.3	Generating Minimal Models	145
9	Conclusion	149
9.1	Why Inference Is Worth the Effort	149
9.2	Contributions	151
9.3	Models as Meaning	152
A	Some Example Problems	155
A.1	The Job Puzzle	155
A.2	Reciprocals: The Boston Pitchers	155
	References	159
	Index	165