

Benchmarking an algorithm for expensive high-dimensional objectives on the bbob and bbob-largescale testbeds

Zachary Hoffman, Steve Huntsman

▶ To cite this version:

Zachary Hoffman, Steve Huntsman. Benchmarking an algorithm for expensive high-dimensional objectives on the bbob and bbob-largescale testbeds. GECCO Workshop on Black-Box Optimization Benchmarking (BBOB 2022), Jul 2022, Boston, United States. hal-03665291

HAL Id: hal-03665291 https://hal.science/hal-03665291

Submitted on 11 May 2022 $\,$

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

Benchmarking an algorithm for expensive high-dimensional objectives on the bbob and bbob-largescale testbeds

Zachary Hoffman Systems and Technology Research Woburn, Massachusetts zachary.hoffman@str.us

ABSTRACT

We report benchmarks for a recently developed algorithm on the bbob and bbob-largescale benchmarking testbeds in COCO. This algorithm is designed for expensive high-dimensional multimodal objectives (such as arise in hyperparameter optimization or via simulations), and this regime introduces challenges for benchmarking. In particular, while the COCO experimental procedure yields evidence that this algorithm improves on the state of the art, the COCO framework also exhibits shortcomings for the very low evaluation budgets involved here. Consequently, we also report the results of *ad hoc* experiments that demonstrate a more obvious if less rigorous advantage for the algorithm over its nearest competition.

CCS CONCEPTS

• Computing methodologies → Continuous space search.

KEYWORDS

Benchmarking, Black-box optimization

ACM Reference Format:

Zachary Hoffman and Steve Huntsman. 2022. Benchmarking an algorithm for expensive high-dimensional objectives on the bbob and bbob-largescale testbeds. In *Proceedings of the Genetic and Evolutionary Computation Conference 2022 (GECCO '22)*. ACM, New York, NY, USA, 9 pages. https://doi. org/10.1145/123_4

1 INTRODUCTION

The paper [13] introduces an optimization algorithm designed to handle intrinsically high-dimensional ($D \gtrsim 40$, and with all dimensions relevant) optimization problems for very expensive (≥ 1 minute/evaluation) multimodal objective functions. This regime includes problems of fundamental interest (e.g., optimizing the results of simulations) that push against fundamental limits of benchmarking tools: for example, high dimensionality and multimodality coupled with low function evaluation budgets preclude achieving global minima as a realistic goal. Meanwhile, while the algorithm in

GECCO '22, July 9-13, 2022, Boston, MA, USA

© 2022 Copyright held by the owner/author(s).

ACM ISBN 123-4567-89-101/11/21. https://doi.org/10.1145/123_4 Steve Huntsman Systems and Technology Research Arlington, Virginia steve.huntsman@str.us

[13] is carefully designed with such problems in mind, its runtime overhead introduces an additional challenge: benchmarking itself becomes very expensive.

The *COmparing Continuous Optimizers* (COCO) platform [9] enables automated benchmarking and performance comparisons for optimization algorithms. In this paper, we benchmark the algorithm in [13]-hereinafter referred to as EXPLO2 in the text and EE in the COCO plots-on the bbob [5, 10] and bbob-largescale [4] test suites, as well as performing a more *ad hoc* evaluation to address gaps in COCO for low function evaluation budgets.

2 ALGORITHM PRESENTATION

If *d* is the distance matrix of a finite subset of \mathbb{R}^D and $t \ge 0$, then $Z_{jk} = \exp(-td_{jk})$ is a positive definite matrix [20], hence invertible. With this in mind, the corresponding *weighting w* is the solution of Zw = 1, where 1 denotes a vector of all ones; the *magnitude* of *Z* is $\sum_j w_j$ [15]. Magnitude is a very general scale-dependent notion of an effective number of points that encodes rich geometrical data [16]. Meanwhile, the components of a weighting meaningfully encode a notion of effective size per point.

Moreover, *Z* is a *radial basis function* (RBF) interpolation matrix [2] and the equation Zw = 1 amounts to defining a weighting *w* as the vector whose components are coefficients for interpolating the unit function. So if $\{x_j\}_{j=1}^n$ are points in \mathbb{R}^D with distance matrix *d* and $y_j := f(x_j)$ for $f : \mathbb{R}^D \to \mathbb{R}$, then the RBF interpolation is $f(x) \approx yZ^{-1}\zeta(x)$, where $\zeta_k(x) := \exp(-t|x - x_k|)$ and we treat *y* and ζ respectively as row and column vectors.

EXPL02 constructs a surrogate on a box in \mathbb{R}^D that convexly combines i) the differential magnitude due to a new point in relation to a dynamically curated subset of prior evaluation points, and ii) the RBF interpolation relative to those same points. These two functions respectively embody notions of exploration and exploitation, and over the course of the algorithm the surrogate shifts from the former to the latter. Successive evaluation points are determined by optimizing the surrogate with an inner large-scale algorithm (default: fmincon).

3 EXPERIMENTAL PROCEDURE

We ran EXPLO2 with default settings as described in [13] and with $n_{\parallel} = 32$ parallel workers on the entire bbob suite for $25 \times D$ evaluations according to [12]. We also ran EXPLO2 in the same way on the multimodal functions f_{15}, \ldots, f_{19} in the bbob-largescale suite for $2 \times D$ evaluations. ¹ The limited budget and function selection were due to runtime overhead, as discussed in the sequel.

^{*}This research was developed with funding from the Defense Advanced Research Projects Agency (DARPA). The views, opinions and/or findings expressed are those of the author and should not be interpreted as representing the official views or policies of the Department of Defense or the U.S. Government.

Permission to make digital or hard copies of part or all of this work for personal or classroom use is granted without fee provided that copies are not made or distributed for profit or commercial advantage and that copies bear this notice and the full citation on the first page. Copyrights for third-party components of this work must be honored. For all other uses, contact the owner/author(s).

¹We also ran EXPLO2 in the same way on the weakly structured multimodal functions f_{20}, \ldots, f_{24} in the bbob-largescale suite, but with degenerate results.

As [13] details, a representative set of algorithms to benchmark against for low-dimensional, expensive, multimodal functions is NEWUOA, MCS, GLOBAL, SMAC-BBOB, and \star -CMA-ES with $\star \in \{1mm, DTS, 1q\}$. Of these, only NEWUOA is well-suited to problems with hundreds of dimensions. Indeed, most of these algorithms have not even been benchmarked for dimension 40 in COCO as of this writing, and even NEWUOA eventually scales poorly with dimension [19]. Thus it is also important to perform large-scale benchmarking of EXPLO2, and to compare its performance to fmincon, which EXPLO2 is a wrapper for and is itself a large-scale algorithm.

This experimental procedure was useful, but still insufficient to adequately characterize the regime for which EXPLO2 was designed and where it exhibits advantage over competing algorithms, viz. very expensive high-dimensional multimodal objectives. In particular, this procedure did not yield plots in COCO that readily conveyed meaningful information (e.g., an "expensive plot" option does not appear to be available for the bbob-largescale suite). We therefore also performed a more *ad hoc* comparison of EXPLO2 to VD-CMA-ES [1], the best performing large-scale algorithm for structured multimodal functions in [23]. As Figures 10-13 show, EXPLO2 performs better with respect to evaluation counts, regardless of parallelism. However, it also incurs a very large runtime overhead.

4 CPU TIMING

In fact, the CPU timing of EXPL02 is orders of magnitude higher than competing algorithms, as it wraps a large amount of dense linear algebra (albeit with carefully controlled runtime, and also with prospects for eventually achieving sparsity) around an inner optimizer. Therefore, EXPL02 is only indicated instead of *-CMA-ES for objectives whose evaluation requires on the order of minutes or more. For example, the bbob data presented here took roughly a week to generate; the bbob-largescale data was similarly very time-consuming. For this reason, precise timing measurements were largely pointless, and high function evaluation budgets were impractical.

5 RESULTS

Results from experiments according to [12] and [8] on the benchmark functions given in [4, 5] are presented in Figures 1, 2-3, and 4-8; see also Table 1. ² The experiments were performed and plots produced with COCO [9], version 2.4. Additionally, our *ad hoc* experiments with VD-CMA-ES are presented in Figures 10-13.

The **expected runtime (ERT)**, used in Table 1, depends on a given target precision, $I_{\text{target}} = f_{\text{opt}} + \Delta f$, and is computed over all relevant trials as the number of function evaluations executed during each trial while the best function value did not reach f_t , summed over all trials and divided by the number of trials that actually reached f_t [12, 17]. **Statistical significance** is tested with the rank-sum test for a given target Δf_t using, for each trial, either the number of needed function evaluations to reach f_t (inverted

and multiplied by -1), or, if the target was not reached, the best Δf -value achieved, measured only up to the smallest number of overall function evaluations for any unsuccessful trial under consideration.

Because of the runtime overhead of EXPLO2, our experiments used a fixed budget of 25 function evaluations per dimension (i.e., $25 \times \text{DIM}$ function evaluations in total). ³ As [12] points out, algorithms are only comparable up to the smallest budget given to any of them, corresponding in this case to $\log_{10} 25 \approx 1.40$ on the horizontal axis for Figures 2-3 and 4-7, and to $\log_{10} 2 \approx 0.3$ for Figure 8. This corresponds in our case exactly to the location of crosses (×), which indicate where bootstrapping of experimental data begins to estimate results for larger numbers of function evaluations. At the same time, we used $n_{\parallel} = 32$ parallel workers, ⁴ and $\log_{10}(25/32) \approx -0.107$. Thus allowing for parallel resources (see §5.1) suggests comparing EXPLO2 at the value $\log_{10} 25$ on the horizontal axes with the other algorithms at $\log_{10}(25/32)$, except for *-CMA-ES, which is parallelizable. ⁵ 6

To summarize, as the dimension of structured multimodal problems grows, EXPLO2 outperforms NEWUOA, particularly when taking parallelism into account; meanwhile, the quadratic scaling with dimension of non-large-scale *-CMA-ES algorithms puts them at an increasing disadvantage since EXPLO2 has essentially no runtime dependence on dimension other than through its inner solver, which here is the default large-scale interior-point fmincon algorithm. Finally, on structured multimodal functions, EXPLO2 outperforms VD-CMA-ES, which is otherwise the best-performing large-scale algorithm that we are aware of.

5.1 Parallel performance

While EXPLO2 is parallelized (at marginal cost to performance), to the best of our knowledge no competing technique is except for *-CMA-ES. Indeed, as [6] points out, most surrogate-based derivativefree optimizers-including NEWUOA-require sequential function evaluations. Though parallel algorithms exist [7, 18, 25], these are relatively few in number outside the context of Bayesian optimization (which is unsuitable for high-dimensional problems), and parallel techniques appropriate for high-dimensional problems have been considered in our design and/or benchmarking.

With this in mind, since our experiments use $n_{\parallel} = 32$, exceeding our per-dimension evaluation budget of 25, it is obvious that EXPL02 can outperform any of the competing algorithms considered here on the number of rounds of parallel function evaluations, except for *-CMA-ES, which becomes (depending on the variant employed) illsuited for use or less performant than EXPL02 in high dimensions.

² In an appendix of [13], we also produced fixed-budget plots of cumulative best values using the same data (and substituting, e.g. DTS-CMA-ES for 1mm-CMA-ES) via the web interface of IOHanalyzer [3] at https://iohanalyzer.liacs.nl/, but these plots produced neither additional nor conflicting insights.

³While [22] points out how an anytime benchmark of a budget-dependent algorithm such as EXPL02 can be performed with linear overhead, the cost-to-benefit ratio in our case was still prohibitive. In any event, this would not have made larger budgets any easier (or much more relevant) to obtain.

 $^{^4}$ NB. For benchmarking, it was necessary to simulate parallelism, i.e., we replaced parfor loops in MATLAB code with ordinary for loops.

⁵ While *-CMA-ES is easily parallelizable [11, 14], the quadratic scaling of non-largescale variants with dimension creates a serious disadvantage for high-dimensional problems. In high dimensions it is appropriate to compare EXPLO2 to large-scale variants of CMA-ES [23, 24], and our *ad hoc* experiments in this regard yielded good results.

⁶Also, in an experiment shown in an appendix of [13], we found that EXPLO2 outperformed differential evolution and had performance almost indistinguishable from CMA-ES on the mixed-integer version of f_{15} [21] in dimension D = 20 (the only function/dimension pair we tried among the mixed-integer suite [21]).



Figure 1: Expected running time (ERT in number of f-evaluations as \log_{10} value) divided by dimension versus dimension. The target function value is chosen such that the best algorithm from BBOB 2009 just failed to achieve an ERT of $10 \times DIM$. Different symbols correspond to different algorithms given in the legend of f_1 and f_{24} . Light symbols give the maximum number of function evaluations from the longest trial divided by dimension. Black stars indicate a statistically better result compared to all other algorithms with p < 0.01 and Bonferroni correction number of dimensions (six). Legend: \circ : EE mul25par32lamLin, \diamond : GLOBAL pal noiseless, \star : MCS huyer noiseless, \bigtriangledown : NEWUOA ros noiseless, \bigcirc : SMAC-BBOB hutter noiseless, \triangle : fmincon pal noiseless, \bigcirc : lmm-CMA-ES auger noiseless.

Zachary Hoffman et. al.



Figure 2: Bootstrapped empirical cumulative distribution of the number of objective function evaluations divided by dimension (FEvals/DIM) for all functions and subgroups in 10-D. The targets are chosen from $10^{[-8..2]}$ such that the best algorithm from BBOB 2009 just not reached them within a given budget of $k \times DIM$, with 31 different values of k chosen equidistant in logscale within the interval $\{0.5, \ldots, 50\}$. As reference algorithm, the best algorithm from BBOB 2009 is shown as light thick line with diamond markers.



Figure 4: Empirical cumulative distribution of simulated (bootstrapped) runtimes, measured in number of objective function evaluations divided by dimension (FEvals/DIM) in dimension 20 and for those targets in $10^{[-8..2]}$ that have just not been reached by the best algorithm from BBOB 2009 in a given budget of $k \times \text{DIM}$, with 31 different values of k chosen equidistant in logscale within the interval $\{0.5, \ldots, 50\}$. Here we show just f_1, \ldots, f_8 : functions f_9, \ldots, f_{16} and f_{17}, \ldots, f_{24} are shown in successive figures.

GECCO '22, July 9-13, 2022, Boston, MA, USA



Figure 5: As in Figure 4, but for f_9, \ldots, f_{16} .



Figure 6: As in Figure 4, but for f_{17}, \ldots, f_{24} .

6 REMARKS

Some of the most important optimization problems in science and industry involve expensive objectives, e.g., the results of simulations. This fact and the experience of the present paper suggests introducing additional functionality in COCO to allow more precise benchmarking for extremely low function evaluation budgets.

Experiments on EXPLO2 along similar lines to those presented here indicate that using generic CMA-ES as the inner optimizer incurs a collateral runtime cost orders of magnitude beyond that of fmincon even for D = 2, which precludes careful benchmarking of that alternative.

Finally, though the runtime overhead of EXPLO2 scales favorably with dimension, it is still high for any given function evaluation: the surrogate is complicated and even a large-scale inner optimizer takes resources. EXPLO2 is therefore only suited for highdimensional functions that are very expensive to evaluate, and it will generally be advisable to evaluate the suitability of *-CMA-ES as well in any particular application.

REFERENCES

- Youhei Akimoto, Anne Auger, and Nikolaus Hansen. 2014. Comparison-based natural gradient optimization in high dimension. In Proceedings of the 2014 Annual Conference on Genetic and Evolutionary Computation. 373–380.
- Martin D Buhmann. 2003. Radial basis functions: theory and implementations. Vol. 12. Cambridge.
- [3] Carola Doerr, Hao Wang, Furong Ye, Sander van Rijn, and Thomas Bäck. 2018. IOHprofiler: A benchmarking and profiling tool for iterative optimization heuristics. arXiv preprint arXiv:1810.05281 (2018).
- [4] Ouassim Elhara, Konstantinos Varelas, Duc Nguyen, Tea Tusar, Dimo Brockhoff, Nikolaus Hansen, and Anne Auger. 2019. COCO: the large scale blackbox optimization benchmarking (BBOB-largescale) test suite. arXiv preprint arXiv:1903.06396 (2019).

GECCO '22, July 9-13, 2022, Boston, MA, USA

Zachary Hoffman et. al.

TTE (D	1 05	1.0		10	50	L.	#FFs/D	0.5	12	3	10	50	#\$110
#FES/D	0.5	1.2	3	10	50	#succ	64.4	0.5	0.5 0.05	1 (2010	10	1.0 11000	1.540
f1	6.3e+1:24	4.0e+1:42	1.0e-8:43	1.0e-8:43	1.0e-8:43	15/15	- 111	4.0e+4:11	2.50+3:27	1.60+2:313	1.0e+2:481	1.0e+1:1002	15/15
EE	1.5(0.6)	1.2(0.4)	~	~	∞ 501	0/15	EE	1.3(1)	4.3(8)	6.7(9)	∞	∞ 501	0/15
CLOBA	14(0.4)	8 1(0)	8.0(0)	8.0(0)	8.0(0)	15/15	GLOBA	1.7(1)	3.0(4)	2.1(0.6)	1.5(0.2)	1.2(0.4)	15/15
MOC 1	14(0.4)	0.1(0)	5.0(0)	5.0(0)	5.0(0)	15/15	MCS h	13(0.6)	1(0.6)	4 8(6)	53(68)	00 8e4	0/15
MCS n	1.0(0.3)	1.00(0.1)	7.0(3)	7.0(3)	7.0(3)	15/15	NEWLIC	2.1(2)	1 4(0.8)	1((7)	15(4)	15(2)	15/15
NEWUO	1.8(0)	1.0(0.0)	1.0(0.0)*4	1.0(0.0)*4	1.0(0.0)*4	15/15	NEWUC	2.1(2)	1.4(0.8)	10(7)	15(4)	15(5)	15/13
lmm-C	2 5(2)	2 5(1)	10(0 2)	10(0 2)	10(0 2)	15/15	Imm-C	1.3(1)	1.4(0.9)	4.5(3)	3.7(1)	2.1(0.2)	15/15
SMAC	0.91(0.4)	0.67(0.2)	~~~~~	20(0.2)	~ 2000	0/15	SMAC-	0.60 (0.3)	0.68(0.5)	2.4(3)	7.3(16)	$\infty 2000$	0/15
SIVIAC-	0.01(0.4)	0.67(0.2)	80	80	80 2000	0/15	fmina	1 6(2)	2.7(1)	0 22(0 2)	0.22(0.1)*2	$0.16(0.0) \times 4$	15/15
fminc	0.92(0)	0.52(0)	5.1(0.4)	5.1(0.4)	5.1(0.5)	15/15	finite	4.0(2)	2.7(1)	0.33(0.2)	0.22(0.1)	0.10(0.0)	13/13
f2	4.0e+6:29	2.5e+6:42	1.0e+5:65	1.0e+4:207	1.0e-8:412	15/15	f12	1.0e+8:23	6.3e+7:39	2.5e+7:76	4.0e+6:209	1.0e+1:1042	15/15
EE	0.57(0.5)	0.82(0.7)			22 501	0/15	EE	5.1(4)	5.7(2)	8.1(9)	∞	∞ 501	0/15
LL	0.57(0.5)	0.85(0.7)	000	80	00 301	0/15	GLOBA	14(3)	8.8(0.5)	4.8(0.1)	1.9(0.2)	1.00(0.9)	15/15
GLOBA	1.6(2)	2.8(3)	9.2(2)	7.2(1)	63(50)	13/15	10001	1 0(0 0)	1 0(0 5)	1.00(0.0)*	1.00(0.5)	1.1(0,0)	
MCS h	5.5(5)	4.0(4)	3.5(2)	1.4(0.8)	∞ 8e4	0/15	MCS n	1.0(0.9)	1.0(0.5)	1.00(0.3)	1.00(0.5)	1.1(0.8)	15/15
NEWUO	1.4(0.3)	1(0)	1.00(0.4)	1.00(0.4)	303(130)	15/15	NEWUC	3.5(1)	2.5(0.8)	1.9(0.9)	1.2(0.5)	3.0(3)	15/15
lmm-C	0 52(0 5)	0 68(0 7)	7 2(2)	3.8(1.0)	14(2)	15/15	lmm-C	2.0(1)	2.4(1)	2.6(0.6)	1.9(0.3)	1.1(0.1)	15/15
CMAC	0.52(0.4)	0.70(0.()	22(18)	140(216)	2000	0/15	SMAC-	28(3)	38(51)	a a	~	~ 2000	0/15
SIVIAC-	0.55(0.4)	0.70(0.6)	23(18)	142(516)	00 2000	0/15	for in a	2.0(3)	1 8(0.0)	1 ((0.7)	1 4(0 7)	0.81(0.5)	15/15
fminc	2.6(0.4)	2.3(4)	10(9)	6.1(4)	22(10)	15/15	imme	2.0(2)	1.8(0.9)	1.0(0.7)	1.4(0.7)	0.81(0.5)	15/13
f3	6.3e+2:33	4.0e+2:44	1.6e+2:109	1.0e+2:255	2.5e+1:3277	15/15	f13	1.6e+3:28	1.0e+3:64	6.3e+2:79	4.0e+1:211	2.5e+0:1724	15/15
EE	0.72(0.2)	1.8(0.7)	8	~	∞ 501	0/15	EE	1.5(0.6)	1.2(0.3)	1.8(0.6)	∞	∞ 501	0/15
CLOBA	7.9(4)	19(22)	441(720)	1428(020)	20 Fed	0/15	GLOBA	11(1)	5.7(0)	4.8(0.3)	3.4(0.7)	1.1(0.1)	15/15
GLOBA	7.0(4)	10(52)	441(739)	1438(930)	∞ J£4	0/15	MCS h	0.00(0.7)	1 2(0.8)	2 4(0.6)	49(54)	28(25)	12/15
MCS h	1(0.2)	1.00(0.1)	1.0(1.0) * 4	1.00(0.5) * 4	4.2(3)	15/15	MICO II	0.77(0.7)	1.5(0.0)	5.4(0.0)	+3	56(25)	12/13
NEWUO	2.5(1)	24(30)	360(595)	7456(7708)	∞ 1e5	0/15	NEWUC	1.7(0.3)	1.0(0.1)	0.99(0.2)	1.00(0.2)	1.5(3)	15/15
lmm-C	1.0(0.9)	23(10)	6.0(2)	48(07)	2 1(2)	14/15	lmm-C	1.6(0.9)	2.6(1)	3.3(0.8)	4.2(0.5)	1.1(0.2)	15/15
CMAC	0.40(0.5)	2.5(1.6)	105(011)	114(122)	2000	0/15	SMAC	0.00(0.4)	0 ((0 2))	0.84(0.1)*	1 4(0 2)	2000	0/15
SIVIAC-	0.49(0.5)	2.1(5)	125(211)	114(155)	80 2000	0/15	SIVIAC-	0.80(0.4)	0.00(0.2)	0.84(0.1)	1.4(0.2)	00 2000	0/13
fminc	6.6(13)	31(34)	6190(4670)	2.3e4(2e4)	∞ 4e5	0/15	fminc	1.1(0.4)	1.2(0.9)	1.8(1)	2.8(0.5)	0.51(0.1)	15/15
f4	6.3e+2:22	4.0e+2:91	2.5e+2:250	1.6e+2:332	6.3e+1:1927	15/15	f14	2.5e+1:15	1.6e+1:42	1.0e+1:75	1.6e+0:219	6.3e-4:1106	15/15
FE	5 3(4)	4 0(2)	<u>~</u>	~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~	cc 501	0/15	EE	2.9(2)	3.4(3)	3.7(3)	~	∞ 501	0/15
CLOBA	17(4)	78(172)	18((220)	2081(2405)	501	0/15	CLOBA	10(9)	8 2(0 E)	5 0(0 2)	2 2(0 2)	1(0.1)	15/15
GLUDA	17(4)	/6(1/5)	180(239)	5081(2405)	00 804	0/15	GLOBA	19(0)	8.3(0.3)	5.0(0.5)	2.5(0.5)	1(0.1)	13/13
MCS h	0.98(0.9)	1(0.6)*	1.0(0.2)*	1.00(0.1)*4	4.1(5)	15/15	MCS h	0.97(0.5)	1.0(0.4)	1(0.5)	1.9(0.9)	3.3(1)	15/15
NEWLIO	37(79)	48(96)	104(106)	1703(1866)	00 2e5	0/15	NEWUC	4.2(1)	2.1(1)	1.5(0.8)	1.00(0.5)	1.0(0.2)	15/15
Imm C	1 2(1)	2 2(0 0)	2 0(0 8)	2 0(0 7)	3.0(2)	12/15	lmm-C	3.7(5)	2.9(2)	3.0(1)	2.2(0.4)	1.9(0.1)	15/15
mm-c	1.2(1)	2.2(0.7)	2.0(0.8)	3.0(0.7)	2.0(2)	15/15	SMAC-	2 0(3)	3 4(7)	19(11)	~	~ 2000	0/15
SMAC-	6.7(9)	102(71)	~	~	$\infty 2000$	0/15		2.0(3)	5.1(7)	1)(11)	+3	2000	0,13
fminc	1.3(2)	42(80)	525(984)	5108(5132)	∞ 4e5	0/15	fminc	1.9(0.7)	1.1(0.5)	0.74 (0.1)	0.49(0.1) ^ J	0.60(0.1)	15/15
f5	2.5e+2:19	1.6e+2:34	1.0e-8:41	1.0e-8:41	1.0e-8:41	15/15	f15	6.3e+2:15	4.0e+2:67	2.5e+2:292	1.6e+2:846	1.0e+2:1671	15/15
FF	1 1(0 3)	0.84(0.4)	~	~	∞ 501	0/15	FE	2.0(1)	1 2(1 0)	14(07)	<u>~</u>	oo 501	0/15
OLODA	5.(()	10(0.0)	44(0.0)	44(0.0)	44(0.0)	0/15	CLOBA	15(11)	24(2()	110(07)		3-1	0/15
GLOBA	5.6(6)	10(0.2)	11(0.9)	11(0.9)	11(0.9)	15/15	GLOBA	15(11)	24(20)	110(97)	00	00 204	0/13
MCS h	1.4(0.0)	1.0(7e-3)	0.99(0.0)	0.99(0.0)	0.99(0.0)	15/15	MCS h	1.0 (0.4)	1.0(0.3)	35(23)	96(78)	70(72)	7/15
NEWUO	2.2(0)	1.3(0.0)	1.6(0.5)	1.6(0.4)	1.6(0.5)	15/15	NEWUC	4.4(3)	11(17)	14(18)	41(32)	1078(1235)	1/15
lmm-C	18(0.6)	2 1(0 5)	6 1(1)	61(0.9)	61(0.9)	15/15	lmm-C	1.4(2)	1.3(0.7)	0.77(0.4)	0.72(0.3)	0.86(0.3)	15/15
	+2	2.1(0.5)	*2	*2	+2	13/13	SMAC	1.2(2)	2.0(0.0)	2.8(5)	~~~~	~ 2000	0/15
SMAC-	0.46(0.1)	0.33(0.1)	0.66(0.3)	0.66(0.3)	0.66(0.3)	15/15	SWIAC-	1.2(2)	2.9(0.9)	2.8(3)	~~~	∞ 2000	0/13
fminc	1.2(0)	1.3(0)	3.0e4(4e4)	3.0e4(3e4)	3.0e4(8e4)	4/15	fminc	30(72)	20(19)	42(65)	323(287)	1681(1968)	2/15
f6	2.5e+5:16	6.3e+4:43	1.6e+4:62	1.6e+2:353	1.6e + 1:1078	15/15	f16	4.0e+1:26	2.5e+1:127	1.6e+1:540	1.6e+1:540	1.0e+1:1384	15/15
EE	1.7(1)	1 2(0.7)	1.0(1)	10(0)	aa 501	0/15	EE	2.8(2)	27(38)	∞	8	∞ 501	0/15
LL	1.7(1)	1.5(0.7)	1.9(1)	10(9)	00 501	0/15	CLOBA	4 5(4)	2 7(0 2)	1.00(0.7)	1.00(0.7)	1.00(1)	15/15
GLOBA	11(10)	7.9(0.7)	6.1(0.9)	3.0(2)	3.5(1)	15/15	GLOBA	4.3(4)	2.7(0.3)	1.00(0.7)	1.00(0.7)	1.00(1)	13/13
MCS h	1(1)	1.0(0.5)	1.3(1)	6.9(12)	1102(749)	1/15	MCS h	1.3(1)	17(40)	4.4(10)	4.4(5)	11(13)	15/15
NEWUO	2.4(1)	1.3(0.3)	1.00(0.3)	1.0(0.7)	1.0(0.2)	15/15	NEWUC	2.5(0.8)	6.5(9)	7.8(11)	7.8(6)	16(23)	15/15
Imm C	16(10)	1 6(0.8)	2.0(0.7)	6.8(4)	0.0(5)	11/15	lmm-C	4.9(8)	8.1(6)	2.7(0.8)	2.7(0.8)	1.2(0.4)	15/15
mm-c	1.0(1.0)	1.0(0.8)	2.0(0.7)	0.8(4)	9.0(3)	11/15	SMAC-	2 4(3)	1 5(0.9)	0 78(0 3)	0.78(0.5)	0.76(0.4)	14/15
SMAC-	1.6(1)	1.2(0.9)	1.6(1)	2.8(3)	$\infty 2000$	0/15	Sivil ic	2.4(3)	20(02)	51(97)	51(25)	(75(17(0))	E /15
fminc	6.0(15)	5.3(8)	5.9(5)	2.6(1)	1.6(0.7)	15/15	imme	22(50)	29(25)	51(87)	51(55)	675(1769)	5/13
f7	1.0e+3:11	4.0e+2:39	2.5e+2:74	6.3e+1:319	1.0e+1:1351	15/15	f17	1.6e+1:11	1.0e+1:63	6.3e+0:305	4.0e+0:468	1.0e+0:1030	15/15
FF	1.2(1)	1.2(0.6)	1.2(0.5)	~	∞ 501	0/15	EE	1.8(0.6)	1.3(0.6)	2.1(2)	~	∞ 501	0/15
OLODA	1.2(1)	1.2(0.0)	1.2(0.5)		000 501	0/15	GLOBA	9.0(13)	6.2(2)	33(77)	582(531)	∞ 7e4	0/15
GLUBA	4.4(7)	7.4(5)	4.9(0.4)	4.5(6)	00 104	0/15	MCS h	0.96(2)	1(0.7)	8 5(18)	587(605)	~ 8e1	0/15
MCS h	0.96(0.8)	1(0.5)	3.7(4)	66(86)	∞ 8e4	0/15	MEMULO	5.1(2)	1(0.7)	0.3(10)	2447(5522)	00 007	0/13
NEWUO	3.5(0.2)	1.4(0.3)	1.0(0.6)	34(69)	∞ 5e5	0/15	INEWUC	5.1(3)	10(4)	55(131)	344/(5522)	Jeb 200	0/15
lmm-C	0.47(0.6)	1.2(1)	1.7(1)	1.0(0.2)	0.48(0.1)	15/15	lmm-C	0.59(0)	1(0.9)	0.65(0.3)	0.79(0.2)*3	1.4(0.4)	14/15
0140	0.5 ((0.7)	0.54(0.5)	0.10(0.0)	0.00(0.0)*	0.55(0.0)	10.00	SMAC	0.50(0.0)			(1(00)	/	0/15
SIVIAC-	0.30(0.7)	0.01(0.5)	0.49(0.3)	0.3900.31			SIVING -	1 0.50 (0.9)	0.92(1.0)	15(13)	61(89)	$\infty 2000$	0/15
fminc	2.8(3)				0.57(0.5)	15/15	fminc	20(65)	0.92(1.0) 21(28)	15(13)	61(89) 728(495)	∞ 2000 ∞ 4e5	
		166(161)	468(390)	~	∞ 2e5	0/15	fminc	20(65)	0.92(1.0) 21(28)	15(13) 14(14)	61(89) 728(495)	∞ 2000 ∞ 4e5	0/13
f8	4.0e+4:19	166(161) 2.5e+4:35	468(390) 4.0e+3:67	∞ 2.5e+2:231	∞ 2e5 1.6e+1:1470	0/15	fminc f18	20(65) 4.0e+1:116	0.92(1.0) 21(28) 2.5e+1:252	15(13) 14(14) <i>1.6e+1</i> :430	61(89) 728(495) 1.0e+1:621	∞ 2000 ∞ 4e5 4.0e+0:1090	15/15
EE	4.0e+4:19 1.9(0.9)	166(161) 2.5e+4:35 1.3(0.5)	468(390) 4.0e+3:67 2.2(2)	∞ 2.5e+2:231 ∞	∞ 2e5 <u>1.6e+1:1470</u> ∞ 501	0/15 15/15 0/15	fminc f18 EE	20(65) 4.0e+1:116 0.59(0.9)	0.92(1.0) 21(28) 2.5e+1:252 1.8(1)	15(13) 14(14) 1.6e+1:430 8.7(13)	61(89) 728(495) 1.0e+1:621 ∞	∞ 2000 ∞ 4e5 4.0e+0:1090 ∞ 501	0/15
EE GLOBA	4.0e+4:19 1.9(0.9) 18(0.6)	<u>2.5e+4:35</u> 1.3(0.5) 10(0.5)	468(390) <u>4.0e+3:67</u> 2.2(2) 5.7(0.3)	∞ 2.5e+2:231 ∞ 3.0(2)	∞ 2e5 <u>1.6e+1:1470</u> ∞ 501 <u>1.6(0,5)</u>	0/15 15/15 0/15 15/15	fminc f18 EE GLOBA	0.50(0.9) 20(65) <u>4.0e+1:116</u> 0.59(0.9) 11(25)	0.92(1.0) 21(28) 2.5e+1:252 1.8(1) 56(98)	15(13) 14(14) <u>1.6e+1:430</u> 8.7(13) 428(815)	61(89) 728(495) 1.0e+1:621 ∞ ∞	∞ 2000 ∞ 4e5 <u>4.0e+0:1090</u> ∞ 501 ∞ 7e4	0/15 15/15 0/15 0/15
F8 EE GLOBA	4.0e+4:19 1.9(0.9) 18(0.6) 0.09(0.0)	166(161) <u>2.5e+4:35</u> 1.3(0.5) 10(0.5) 1.0(0.6)	468(390) <u>4.0e+3:67</u> 2.2(2) 5.7(0.3) 1.2(0.0)	2.5e+2:231 0 3.0(2) 1.3(2)	$\infty 2e5$ 1.6e+1:1470 $\infty 501$ 1.6(0.5) 1.2(0.3)	0/15 15/15 0/15 15/15 15/15	fminc f18 EE GLOBA MCS h	0.50(0.9) 20(65) 4.0e+1:116 0.59(0.9) 11(25) 1.8(2)	0.92(1.0) 21(28) 2.5e+1:252 1.8(1) 56(98) 10(12)	15(13) 14(14) <u>1.6e+1:430</u> 8.7(13) 428(815) 491(725)	61(89) 728(495) 1.0e+1:621 ∞ ∞ ∞	∞ 2000 ∞ 4e5 <u>4.0e+0:1090</u> ∞ 501 ∞ 7e4 ∞ 8e4	0/15 15/15 0/15 0/15
f8 EE GLOBA MCS h	4.0e+4:19 1.9(0.9) 18(0.6) 0.99(0.9) 0.90(0.9)	166(161) <u>2.5e+4:35</u> 1.3(0.5) 10(0.5) 1.0(0.6) 1.0(0.6)	468(390) <u>4.0e+3:67</u> 2.2(2) 5.7(0.3) 1.3(0.9) 1. 2(5.1)	2.5e+2:231 2.30(2) 1.3(2)	$\infty 2e5$ $1.6e+1:1470$ $\infty 501$ $1.6(0.5)$ $1.2(0.3)$ $1.2(0.3)$	0/15 15/15 0/15 15/15 15/15	fminc f18 EE GLOBA MCS h	0.50(0.9) 20(65) 4.0e+1:116 0.59(0.9) 11(25) 1.8(2) 20(43)	0.92(1.0) 21(28) 2.5e+1:252 1.8(1) 56(98) 10(12) 47(91)	15(13) 14(14) <i>1.6e+1</i> :430 8.7(13) 428(815) 491(725) 1013(1095)	01(89) 728(495) 1.0e+1:621 ∞ ∞ ∞ $1.2e4(1e^4)$	$\infty 2000$ $\infty 4e5$ <u>4.0e+0:1090</u> $\infty 501$ $\infty 7e4$ $\infty 8e4$ $\infty 2e6$	0/15 15/15 0/15 0/15 0/15
f8 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUO	4.0e+4:19 1.9(0.9) 18(0.6) 0.99 (0.9) 2.2(0) 2.2(0)	166(161) 2.5e+4:35 1.3(0.5) 10(0.5) 1.0(0.6) 1.3(0.4)	468(390) 4.0e+3:67 2.2(2) 5.7(0.3) 1.3(0.9) 1.0(0.4)	∞ 2.5e+2:231 ∞ 3.0(2) 1.3(2) 1.00(0.9)	$\infty 2e5$ 1.6e+1:1470 $\infty 501$ 1.6(0.5) 1.2(0.3) 1.0(0.4)	0/15 15/15 0/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15	fminc f18 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC	0.50(0.9) 20(65) 4.0e+1:116 0.59(0.9) 11(25) 1.8(2) 20(43)	0.92(1.0) 21(28) 2.5e+1:252 1.8(1) 56(98) 10(12) 47(91)	15(13) 14(14) <i>1.6e+1:</i> 430 8.7(13) 428(815) 491(725) 1013(1095) + 3	51(89) 728(495) 1.0e+1:621 ∞ ∞ 1.2e4(1e4) +3	$\infty 2000$ $\infty 4e5$ 4.0e+0:1090 $\infty 501$ $\infty 7e4$ $\infty 8e4$ $\infty 2e6$	0/15 15/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15
f8 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C	4.0e+4:19 1.9(0.9) 18(0.6) 0.99 (0.9) 2.2(0) 2.1(3)	$\begin{array}{r} 166(161) \\ \underline{2.5e+4:35} \\ \hline 1.3(0.5) \\ 10(0.5) \\ 1.0(0.6) \\ 1.3(0.4) \\ 2.6(1) \end{array}$	468(390) 4.0e+3:67 2.2(2) 5.7(0.3) 1.3(0.9) 1.0(0.4) 3.3(1)	2.5e+2:231 ∞ 3.0(2) 1.3(2) 1.00(0.9) 2.5(0.6)	$\infty 2e5$ 1.6e+1:1470 $\infty 501$ 1.6(0.5) 1.2(0.3) 1.0(0.4) 1.3(0.4)	0/15 15/15 0/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15	fminc fminc f18 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C	$\begin{array}{c} \textbf{0.50(0.9)} \\ 20(65) \\ \underline{4.0e+1:116} \\ 0.59(0.9) \\ 11(25) \\ 1.8(2) \\ 20(43) \\ 0.41(0.7) \end{array}$	0.92(1.0) 21(28) 2.5e+1:252 1.8(1) 56(98) 10(12) 47(91) 0.57(0.3)	15(13) 14(14) <i>1.6e+1:</i> 430 8.7(13) 428(815) 491(725) 1013(1095) 0.77 (0.3)*3	01(89) 728(495) 1.0e+1:621 ∞ ∞ ∞ 1.2e4(1e4) $0.76(0.3)^{*3}$	$ \begin{array}{c} \infty \ 2000 \\ \infty \ 2000 \\ \infty \ 4e5 \\ 4.0e+0:1090 \\ \hline \\ \infty \ 501 \\ \infty \ 7e4 \\ \infty \ 8e4 \\ \infty \ 2e6 \\ 0.85(0.3) \end{array} $	0/15 15/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 15/15
F8 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C SMAC-	4.0e+4:19 1.9(0.9) 18(0.6) 0.99(0.9) 2.2(0) 2.1(3) 1.4(2)	$\begin{array}{r} 166(161) \\ \hline 2.5e+4:35 \\ \hline 1.3(0.5) \\ 10(0.5) \\ 1.0(0.6) \\ 1.3(0.4) \\ 2.6(1) \\ 1.5(1) \end{array}$	468(390) <u>4.0e+3:67</u> 2.2(2) 5.7(0.3) 1.3(0.9) 1.0 (0.4) 3.3(1) 2.5(0.9)	∞ 3.0(2) 1.3(2) 1.00(0.9) 2.5(0.6) 4.1(2)	∞ 2e5 1.6e+1:1470 ∞ 501 1.6(0.5) 1.2(0.3) 1.0(0.4) 1.3(0.4) ∞ 2000	0/15 15/15 0/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 0/15	fminc f18 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC-	0.50(0.9) 20(65) 4.0e+1:116 0.59(0.9) 11(25) 1.8(2) 20(43) 0.41(0.7) 0.31(0.4)	0.92(1.0) 21(28) 2.5e+1:252 1.8(1) 56(98) 10(12) 47(91) 0.57(0.3) 8.3(20)	$\begin{array}{c} 15(13)\\ 14(14)\\ \hline 1.6e+1:430\\ 8.7(13)\\ 428(815)\\ 491(725)\\ 1013(1095)\\ \textbf{0.77}(0.3)^{\bigstar 3}\\ 20(15) \end{array}$	01(89) 728(495) 1.0e+1:621 ∞ ∞ ∞ 1.2e4(1e4) $0.76(0.3)^{*3}$ 22(15)	∞ 2000 ∞ 4e5 4.0e+0:1090 ∞ 501 ∞ 7e4 ∞ 8e4 ∞ 2e6 0.85 (0.3) ∞ 2000	0/15 15/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 15/15 0/15
f8 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C SMAC- fminc	4.0e+4:19 1.9(0.9) 18(0.6) 0.99(0.9) 2.2(0) 2.1(3) 1.4(2) 1.1(1)	$\begin{array}{r} 166(161) \\ \underline{2.5e+4:35} \\ 1.3(0.5) \\ 10(0.5) \\ 1.0(0.6) \\ 1.3(0.4) \\ 2.6(1) \\ 1.5(1) \\ 0.99(0.9) \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{r} 468(390) \\ \hline 4.0e+3:67 \\ \hline 2.2(2) \\ 5.7(0.3) \\ 1.3(0.9) \\ 1.0(0.4) \\ 3.3(1) \\ 2.5(0.9) \\ 1.6(1) \end{array}$	∞ 3.0(2) 1.3(2) 1.00(0.9) 2.5(0.6) 4.1(2) 1.4(0.5)	$\infty 2e5$ 2e5 1.6e+1:1470 $\infty 501$ 1.6(0.5) 1.2(0.3) 1.0(0.4) 1.3(0.4) $\infty 2000$ 0.84(0.2)	0/15 15/15 0/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 0/15 15/15	fminc f18 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fminc	0.50(0.3) 20(65) 4.0e+1:116 0.59(0.9) 11(25) 1.8(2) 20(43) 0.41(0.7) 0.31(0.4) 7.0(6)	0.92(1.0) 21(28) 2.5e+1:252 1.8(1) 56(98) 10(12) 47(91) 0.57(0.3) 8.3(20) 18(12)	15(13) 14(14) 1.6e+1:430 8.7(13) 428(815) 491(725) 1013(1095) 0.77(0.3)*3 20(15) 873(1279)	\sim 1.2e4(1e4) $0.76(0.3)^{\star 3}$ 22(15)	∞ 2000 ∞ 4e5 4.0e+0:1090 ∞ 501 ∞ 7e4 ∞ 8e4 ∞ 2e6 0.85(0.3) ∞ 2000 ∞ 4e5	0/13 15/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 15/15 0/15
f8 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C SMAC- fminc f9	$\begin{array}{r} 4.0e+4:19\\ \hline 1.9(0.9)\\ 18(0.6)\\ 0.99(0.9)\\ 2.2(0)\\ 2.1(3)\\ 1.4(2)\\ 1.1(1)\\ 1.0e\pm 2.257\end{array}$	$\begin{array}{r} 166(161)\\ \hline 2.5e+4:35\\ \hline 1.3(0.5)\\ 10(0.5)\\ \hline 1.0(0.6)\\ \hline 1.3(0.4)\\ 2.6(1)\\ \hline 1.5(1)\\ 0.99(0.9)\\ \hline 6.3e,1560\\ \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{r} 468(390) \\ \hline 4.0e+3:67 \\ \hline 2.2(2) \\ 5.7(0.3) \\ 1.3(0.9) \\ 1.0(0.4) \\ 3.3(1) \\ 2.5(0.9) \\ 1.6(1) \\ \hline 4.0e+1:68.4 \\ \hline \end{array}$	∞ 2.5e+2:231 ∞ 3.0(2) 1.3(2) 1.00(0.9) 2.5(0.6) 4.1(2) 1.4(0.5) 2.5e+1:756	∞ 2e5 1.6e+1:1470 ∞ 501 1.6(0.5) 1.2(0.3) 1.0(0.4) 1.3(0.4) ∞ 2000 0.84(0.2) 1.0e+1:1716	0/15 15/15 0/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 0/15 15/15 0/15 15/15	fminc f18 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fminc f10	$\begin{array}{c} \textbf{0.50}(0.3)\\ 20(65)\\ 4.0e+1:116\\ 0.59(0.9)\\ 11(25)\\ 1.8(2)\\ 20(43)\\ 0.41(0.7)\\ \textbf{0.31}(0.4)\\ 7.0(6)\\ 1.6e_{1:2}5c_{1}c_{2}\\ \end{array}$	0.92(1.0) 21(28) 2.5e+1:252 1.8(1) 56(98) 10(12) 47(91) 0.57(0.3) 8.3(20) 18(12) 1.0e+12.4e5	$\begin{array}{c} 15(13)\\ 14(14)\\ 8.7(13)\\ 428(815)\\ 1013(1095)\\ 0.77(0.3)^{\star}3\\ 20(15)\\ 823(1279)\\ 6.3^{\star}0.2^{\star}4x^{\star}\end{array}$	01(89) 728(495) 1.0e+1:621 ∞ ∞ ∞ 0.76(0.3)*3 22(15) ∞ 0.76(0.3)*3	$\infty 2000$ $\infty 4e5$ 4.0e+0:1090 $\infty 501$ $\infty 7e4$ $\infty 8e4$ $\infty 2e6$ 0.85(0.3) $\infty 2000$ $\infty 4e5$ 25e 23 4e5	0/13 15/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 15/15 0/15 0/
f8 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C SMAC- fminc f9	4.0e+4:19 1.9(0.9) 18(0.6) 0.99(0.9) 2.2(0) 2.1(3) 1.4(2) 1.1(1) 1.0e+2:357	166(161) 2.5e+4:35 1.3(0.5) 1.0(0.6) 1.3(0.4) 2.6(1) 1.5(1) 0.99(0.9) 6.3e+1:560	$\begin{array}{r} 468(390)\\ \hline 4.0e+3:67\\ \hline 2.2(2)\\ 5.7(0.3)\\ 1.3(0.9)\\ {\bf 1.0}(0.4)\\ 3.3(1)\\ 2.5(0.9)\\ 1.6(1)\\ 4.0e+1:684\\ \hline \end{array}$	2.5e+2:231 2.5e+2:231 00(2) 1.3(2) 1.00(0.9) 2.5(0.6) 4.1(2) 1.4(0.5) 2.5e+1:756	∞2e5 1.6e+1:1470 ∞501 1.6(0.5) 1.2(0.3) 1.0(0.4) 1.3(0.4) ∞2000 0.84(0.2) 1.0e+1:1716 ∞501	0/15 15/15 0/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 0/15	fminc f18 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fminc f19 PF	0.50(0.3) 20(65) 4.0e+1:116 0.59(0.9) 11(25) 1.8(2) 20(43) 0.41(0.7) 0.31(0.4) 7.0(6) 1.6e-1:2.5e5	0.92(1.0) 21(28) 2.5e+1:252 1.8(1) 56(98) 10(12) 47(91) 0.57(0.3) 8.3(20) 18(12) 1.0e-1:3.4e5	15(13) 14(14) 1.6c+1:430 8.7(13) 428(815) 491(725) 1013(1095) 0.77(0.3)★3 20(15) 823(1279) 6.3c-2:3.4c5	b1(89) 728(495) 1.0e+1:621 ∞ ∞ 1.2e4(1e4) 0.76(0.3) * 3 22(15) ∞ 4.0e-2:3.4e5	$\infty 2000$ $\infty 4e5$ 4.0e+0:1090 $\infty 501$ $\infty 7e4$ $\infty 2e6$ 0.85(0.3) $\infty 2000$ $\infty 4e5$ 2.5e-2:3.4e5	0/13 15/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 15/15 0/15 0/
f8 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C SMAC- fminc f9 EE	4.0e+4:19 1.9(0.9) 18(0.6) 0.99(0.9) 2.2(0) 2.1(3) 1.4(2) 1.1(1) 1.0e+2:357 ∞	166(161) 2.5e+4:35 1.3(0.5) 10(0.5) 1.0(0.6) 1.3(0.4) 2.6(1) 1.5(1) 0.99(0.9) 6.3e+1:560 ∞	468(390) 4.0e+3:67 2.2(2) 5.7(0.3) 1.3(0.9) 1.0(0.4) 3.3(1) 2.5(0.9) 1.6(1) 4.0e+1:684 ∞		∞ 2e5 1.6e+1:1470 ∞ 501 1.6(0.5) 1.2(0.3) 1.0(0.4) 1.3(0.4) ∞ 2000 0.84(0.2) 1.0e+1:1716 ∞ 501	0/15 15/15 0/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15	fminc f18 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fminc f19 EE	0.50(0.3) 20(65) 4.0e+1:116 0.59(0.9) 11(25) 1.8(2) 20(43) 0.41(0.7) 0.31(0.4) 7.0(6) 1.6e-1:2.5e5 ∞	0.92(1.0) 21(28) 2.5c+1:252 1.8(1) 56(98) 10(12) 47(91) 0.57(0.3) 8.3(20) 1.8(12) 1.0e-1:3.4e5 ∞	15(13) 14(14) <i>1.6e+1:</i> 430 <i>8.7</i> (13) 428(815) 491(725) 1013(1095) 0.77 (0.3)*3 20(15) 823(1279) 6.3e-23.4e5 ∞	b1(89) 728(495) 1.0e+1:621 ∞ ∞ ∞ 0.76(0.3)*3 22(15) ∞ 4.0e-2:3.4e5 ∞	$\infty 2000$ $\infty 4e5$ 4.0e+0:1090 $\infty 501$ $\infty 7e4$ $\infty 8e4$ 0.85(0.3) $\infty 2000$ $\infty 4e5$ 2.5e-2:3.4e5 $\infty 501$	0/13 15/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 15/15 0/15 0/15 0/
f8 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C SMAC- fminc f9 EE GLOBA	4.0e+4:19 1.9(0.9) 18(0.6) 0.99(0.9) 2.2(0) 2.1(3) 1.4(2) 1.1(1) 1.0e+2:357 ∞ 2.0(1)	$\begin{array}{c} 166(161)\\ \underline{2.5e+4:35}\\ 1.3(0.5)\\ 10(0.5)\\ 1.0(0.6)\\ 1.3(0.4)\\ \underline{2.6(1)}\\ 1.5(1)\\ 0.99(0.9)\\ \underline{6.3e+1:560}\\ \hline \infty\\ 1.5(0.9) \end{array}$	468(390) 4.0e+3.67 2.2(2) 5.7(0.3) 1.3(0.9) 1.0(0.4) 3.3(1) 4.0e+1.684 ∞ 1.3(0.5)		$ \begin{array}{c} & 0.2(5.5) \\ & \infty & 2e5 \\ & 1.6e+1:1470 \\ & \infty & 501 \\ & 1.2(0.3) \\ & 1.2(0.3) \\ & 1.0(0.4) \\ & 1.3(0.4) \\ & 1.3(0.4) \\ & 0.84(0.2) \\ & 1.6e+1:1716 \\ & \infty & 501 \\ & 1.7(0.3) \\ \end{array} $	0/15 15/15 0/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15	fminc fminc EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fminc f19 EE GLOBA	$\begin{array}{c} \textbf{0.50}(0.3)\\ 20(65)\\ 4.0e+1:116\\ 0.59(0.9)\\ 11(25)\\ 1.8(2)\\ 20(43)\\ 0.41(0.7)\\ \textbf{0.31}(0.4)\\ 7.0(6)\\ 1.6e-1:2.5e5\\ \infty\\ \infty\end{array}$	0.92(1.0) 21(28) 2.5e+1:252 1.8(1) 56(98) 10(12) 47(91) 0.57(0.3) 8.3(20) 18(12) 1.0e-1:3.4e5 ∞	$\begin{array}{c} 15(13)\\ 14(14)\\ 8.7(13)\\ 8.7(13)\\ 428(815)\\ 491(725)\\ 1013(1095)\\ \textbf{0.77}(0.3)^{\pm}3\\ 20(15)\\ 823(1279)\\ 6.3e{-}2:3.4e5\\ \infty\end{array}$	b (189) 728(495) 1.0e+1:621 ∞ ∞ 0.76(0.3)*3 22(15) ∞ 4.0e-2:3.4e5 ∞ ∞	$\infty 2000$ $\infty 4e5$ 4.0e+0:1090 $\infty 501$ $\infty 7e4$ $\infty 8e4$ $\infty 2e6$ 0.85(0.3) $\infty 2000$ $\infty 4e5$ 2.5e-2:3.4e5 $\infty 501$ $\infty 501$	0/13 15/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 15/15 0/15 0/15 3/15 0/15 0/15 0/15
f8 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C SMAC- fminc f9 EE GLOBA MCS h	4.0e+4:19 1.9(0.9) 18(0.6) 0.99(0.9) 2.2(0) 2.1(3) 1.4(2) 1.1(1) 1.0e+2:357 ∞ 2.0(1) 1.00(0.3)	166(161) 2.5e+4:35 1.3(0.5) 10(0.5) 1.0(0.6) 1.3(0.4) 2.6(1) 1.5(1) 0.99(0.9) 6.3e+1:560 ∞ 1.5(0.9) 1.0(0.2)	$\begin{array}{c} 4.68(390) \\ 4.0e+3.67 \\ 2.2(2) \\ 5.7(0.3) \\ 1.3(0.9) \\ 1.0(0.4) \\ 3.3(1) \\ 2.5(0.9) \\ 1.6(1) \\ 4.0e+1:684 \\ \hline \\ \infty \\ 1.3(0.5) \\ 1.1(0.2) \end{array}$	2.5e+2:231 ∞ 3.0(2) 1.3(2) 1.0(0,9) 2.5(0,6) 4.1(2) 1.4(0.5) 2.5e+1:756 ∞ 1.3(0,5) 1.1(0,1)	∞ 2e5 1.6e+1:1470 ∞ 501 1.6(0.5) 1.2(0.3) 1.3(0.4) ∞ 2000 0.84(0.2) 1.0e+1:1716 ∞ 501 1.7(0.3) 1.0(0.5)	0/15 15/15 0/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15	fminc f18 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fminc f19 EE GLOBA MCS b	$\begin{array}{c} \textbf{0.50}(0.3)\\ 20(65)\\ 4.0e+1:116\\ 0.59(0.9)\\ 11(25)\\ 1.8(2)\\ 20(43)\\ 0.41(0.7)\\ \textbf{0.31}(0.4)\\ 7.0(6)\\ 1.6e-1:2.5e5\\ \hline{\infty}\\ \hline{\infty}\\ \infty\\ 1.4(1)\\ \end{array}$	0.92(1.0) 21(28) 2.5e+1:252 1.8(1) 56(98) 10(12) 47(91) 0.57(0.3) 8.3(20) 18(12) 1.0e-1:3.4e5 ∞ ∞ 1(0.7)	$15(13) \\ 1.6e+1:430 \\ 8.7(13) \\ 428(815) \\ 491(725) \\ 1013(1095) \\ 0.77(0.3)^{*3} \\ 20(15) \\ 823(1279) \\ 6.3e-2:3.4e5 \\ \infty \\ 10.6) \\ 10.6$	$b_{1(89)}$ 1.0e+1:621 ∞ ∞ ∞ $0.76(0.3) \times 3$ 22(15) ∞ 4.0e-2:3.4e5 ∞ ∞ 1(2)	$\infty 2000$ $\infty 4e5$ 4.0e+0.1090 $\infty 501$ $\infty 7e4$ $\infty 2e6$ 0.85(0.3) $\infty 2000$ $\infty 4e5$ 2.5e-2.3.4e5 $\infty 501$ $\infty 5e4$ 1(2)	0/13 15/15 0/15
f8 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C SMAC- fminc f9 EE GLOBA MCS h NEW100	$\begin{array}{c} 4.0e+4:19\\ 1.9(0.9)\\ 18(0.6)\\ 0.99(0.9)\\ 2.2(0)\\ 2.1(3)\\ 1.4(2)\\ 1.1(1)\\ 1.0e+2:357\\ \infty\\ 2.0(1)\\ 1.00(0.3)\\ (130.6)\\ \end{array}$	166(161) 2.5e+4:35 1.3(0.5) 1.0(0.5) 1.0(0.6) 1.3(0.4) 2.6(1) 1.5(1) 0.99(0.9) 6.3e+1:560 ∞ 1.5(0.9) 1.0(0.2) 1.1(0.8)	468(390) 4.0e+3.67 2.2(2) 5.7(0.3) 1.3(0.9) 1.6(0.4) 3.3(1) 2.5(0.9) 1.6(1) 4.0e+1.684 ∞ 1.3(0.5) 1.1(0.2) 1.1(0.7)		∞ 2e5 1.6e+1:1470 ∞ 501 1.6(0.5) 1.2(0.3) 1.0(0.4) 1.3(0.4) 1.3(0.4) 0.84(0.2) 1.0e+1:1716 ∞ 501 1.7(0.3) 1.0(0.5) 1.0(0.5)	15/15 0/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15	fminc fminc f18 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fminc f19 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC	0.50(0.9) 20(65) 4.0e+1:116 0.59(0.9) 11(25) 1.8(2) 20(43) 0.41(0.7) 0.31(0.4) 7.0(6) 1.6e-1:2.5e5 ∞ 1.4(1) ∞	0.92(1.0) 21(28) 2.5e+1:252 1.8(1) 56(98) 10(12) 47(91) 0.57(0.3) 8.3(20) 1.8(12) 1.0e-1:3.4e5 ∞ 1(0.7) ∞	$15(13) \\ 1.6e+1:430 \\ 8.7(13) \\ 428(815) \\ 491(725) \\ 1013(1095) \\ 0.77(0.3) \\ \times 3 \\ 20(15) \\ 823(1279) \\ 6.3e-2:3.4e5 \\ \infty \\ 1(0.6) \\ \infty$	$b_{1(89)}$ 1.0e+1:621 ∞ ∞ $0.76(0.3) \times 3$ 22(15) ∞ 4.0e-2:3.4e5 ∞ 1(2) ∞	$\infty 2000$ $\infty 4e5$ 4.0e+0:1090 $\infty 501$ $\infty 7e4$ $\infty 8e4$ $\infty 2e6$ 0.85(0.3) $\infty 2000$ $\infty 4e5$ 2.5e-2:3.4e5 $\infty 501$ $\infty 5e4$ 1(2) $\infty 2e6$	0/13 15/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/1
f8 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C SMAC- fminc f9 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUO NEWUO	4.0e+4:19 1.9(0.9) 18(0.6) 0.99(0.9) 2.2(0) 2.1(3) 1.4(2) 1.1(1) 1.0e+2:357 ∞ 2.0(1) 1.00(0.3) 1.3(0.6) 1.4(0.2)	$\begin{array}{c} 166(161) \\ 2.5e+4.35 \\ \hline 1.3(0.5) \\ 10(0.5) \\ 1.0(0.6) \\ 1.3(0.4) \\ 2.6(1) \\ 1.5(1) \\ 0.99(0.9) \\ 6.3e+1:560 \\ \hline \infty \\ 1.5(0.9) \\ 1.0(0.2) \\ 1.1(0.8) \\ 12(0.2) \\ \end{array}$	4.68(390) 4.0e+3.67 2.2(2) 5.7(0.3) 1.3(0.9) 1.0(0.4) 3.3(1) 2.5(0.9) 1.6(1) 4.0e+1:684 ∞ 1.3(0.5) 1.1(0.2) 1.00(0.7) 1.0(2)	2.5e+2:231 ∞ 3.0(2) 1.3(2) 1.0(0,9) 2.5(0,6) 4.1(2) 1.4(0,5) 2.5e+1:756 ∞ 1.3(0,5) 1.1(0,1) 1.0(0,4) 1.0(0,4) 1.0(0,4) 1.0(0,4) 1.0(0,4) 1.0(0,4) 1.0(1,4) 1	∞ 2e5 1.6e+1:1470 ∞ 501 1.6(0.5) 1.2(0.3) 1.3(0.4) ∞ 2000 0.84(0.2) 1.0e+1:1716 ∞ 501 1.7(0.3) 1.0(0.5) 1.0(0.5) 1.0(0.5)	15/15 0/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15	fminc fla EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fminc fl9 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC	0.50(0.3) 20(65) 4.0e+1.116 0.59(0.9) 11(25) 1.8(2) 20(43) 0.41(0.7) 0.41(0.7) 0.6(e) 1.6e-1:2.5e5 ∞ ∞ 1.4(1)	0.92(1.0) 21(28) 2.5e+1:252 1.8(1) 56(98) 10(12) 47(91) 0.57(0.3) 8.3(20) 18(12) 1.0e-1:3.4e5 ∞ ∞ 1(0,7) ∞	$\begin{array}{c} 15(13)\\ 1.6e+1:430\\ \hline 8.7(13)\\ 428(815)\\ 491(725)\\ 1013(1095)\\ 0.77(0.3)^{\star 3}\\ 20(15)\\ 8.23(1279)\\ 6.3e-2:3.4e5\\ \infty\\ 10.6\\ \end{array}$	0.1(89) 1.0e+1:621 0.0e+1:621 $0.76(0.3)^{*3}$ 22(15) $0.76(0.3)^{*3}$ 22(15) $0.76(0.3)^{*3}$ 0.76($\infty 2000$ $\infty 4e5$ 4.0e+0:1090 $\infty 501$ $\infty 7e4$ $\infty 2e6$ 0.85(0.3) $\infty 2000$ $\infty 4e5$ 2.5e-2:3.4e5 $\infty 501$ $\infty 5e4$ 1(2) $\infty 2e6$ $\infty 2e6$	0/13 15/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/1
f8 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C SMAC- fminc f9 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C	$\begin{array}{c} 4.0e+4.19\\ 1.9(0.9)\\ 18(0.6)\\ 0.99(0.9)\\ 2.2(0)\\ 2.1(3)\\ 1.4(2)\\ 1.1(2)\\ 1.1(2)\\ 1.0e+2.357\\ \hline \infty\\ 2.0(1)\\ 1.00(0.3)\\ 1.3(0.6)\\ 1.6(0.2)\\ -\infty\\ \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 166(161)\\ \underline{2.5e+4.35}\\ 1.3(0.5)\\ 10(0.5)\\ 1.0(0.6)\\ 1.3(0.4)\\ \underline{2.6}(1)\\ 1.5(1)\\ 0.99(0.9)\\ \underline{6.3e+1:560}\\ \infty\\ 1.5(0.9)\\ 1.0(0.2)\\ 1.1(0.8)\\ 1.3(0.2)\\ \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 4.68(390) \\ \hline 4.0e+3.67 \\ 2.2(2) \\ 5.7(0.3) \\ 1.3(0.9) \\ 1.0(0.4) \\ 3.3(1) \\ 2.5(0.9) \\ 1.6(1) \\ 4.0e+1.684 \\ \hline \infty \\ 1.3(0.5) \\ 1.1(0.2) \\ 1.00(0.7) \\ 1.1(0.3) \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} \underbrace{2.5e+2.231}_{2.5e+2.231} \\ \hline \infty \\ 3.0(2) \\ 1.3(2) \\ 1.00(0.9) \\ 2.5(0.6) \\ 4.1(2) \\ 1.4(0.5) \\ 2.5e+1.756 \\ \hline \infty \\ 1.3(0.5) \\ 1.1(0.1) \\ 1.0(0.4) \\ 1.2(0.1) \\ \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} & \odot 2e5 \\ & 1.6e+1:1470 \\ \hline \infty \ 201 \\ 1.6(0.5) \\ & 1.2(0.3) \\ & 1.0(0.4) \\ & 1.3(0.4) \\ & 1.3(0.4) \\ & 1.3(0.4) \\ & 0.84(0.2) \\ & 1.0e+1:1716 \\ \hline \infty \ 501 \\ & 1.7(0.3) \\ & 1.00(0.5) \\ & 1.0(0.2) \\ & 2.1(0.5) \end{array}$	15/15 0/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15	minic fminc f18 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fminc f19 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C	$\begin{array}{c} \textbf{0.50(0.5)} \\ \textbf{0.60(0.5)} \\ \textbf{20(65)} \\ \textbf{4.0e+1:16} \\ \textbf{0.59(0.9)} \\ \textbf{11(25)} \\ \textbf{11(25)} \\ \textbf{11(25)} \\ \textbf{12(2)} \\ \textbf{20(43)} \\ \textbf{0.41(0.7)} \\ \textbf{0.31(0.4)} \\ \textbf{7.0(6)} \\ \textbf{1.6e-1:2.5e5} \\ \textbf{\infty} \\ \textbf{1.4(1)} \\ \textbf{\infty} \end{array}$	0.92(1.0) 21(28) 2.5e+1:252 1.8(1) 56(98) 10(12) 47(91) 0.57(0.3) 8.3(20) 18(12) 1.0e-1:3.4e5 ∞ 1(0.7) ∞	$\begin{array}{c} 15(13)\\ 14(14)\\ 1.6e+1:430\\ 428(815)\\ 491(725)\\ 1013(1095)\\ \textbf{0.77}(0.3)^{+3}\\ 20(15)\\ 823(1279)\\ 6.3e-2:3.4e5\\ \infty\\ 1(0.6)\\ \infty\\ \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} {}^{\rm b}(189)\\ 728(495)\\ 1.0e+1:621\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ 0.76(0.3)^{\pm 3}\\ 22(15)\\ \infty\\ 4.0e-2:3.4e5\\ \infty\\ 1(2)\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ \end{array}$	$\infty 2000$ $\infty 4e5$ 4.0e+0:1090 $\infty 501$ $\infty 7e4$ $\infty 8e4$ $\infty 2e6$ 0.85(0.3) $\infty 2000$ $\infty 4e5$ 2.5e-2:3.4e5 $\infty 501$ $\infty 5e4$ 1(2) $\infty 2e6$ $\infty 8805$	0/13 15/15 0/15
f8 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C SMAC- fminc f9 EE GLOBA MCS h NEW UO Imm-C SMAC- SMAC- MCS h NEW UO Imm-C SMAC-	4.0e+4:19 1.9(0.9) 18(0.6) 0.99(0.9) 2.2(0) 2.1(3) 1.4(2) 1.1(1) 1.0e+2:357 ∞ 2.0(1) 1.00(0.3) 1.3(0.6) 1.6(0.2) 5.0(3)	$\begin{array}{c} 166(161)\\ 2.5e+4:35\\ 1.3(0.5)\\ 1.0(0.6)\\ 1.0(0.6)\\ 1.3(0.4)\\ 2.6(1)\\ 1.5(1)\\ 0.99(0.9)\\ 6.3e+1:560\\ \hline \\ \hline \\ \hline \\ 0\\ 1.5(0.9)\\ 1.0(0.2)\\ 1.1(0.8)\\ 1.3(0.2)\\ 2.6(17)\\ \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 4.68(390) \\ 4.0e+3.67 \\ 2.2(2) \\ 5.7(0.3) \\ 1.3(0.9) \\ 1.0(0.4) \\ 3.3(1) \\ 2.5(0.9) \\ 1.6(1) \\ 4.0e+1.684 \\ \hline \\ \hline \\ 1.3(0.5) \\ 1.1(0.2) \\ 1.00(0.7) \\ 1.1(0.3) \\ \hline \\ \end{array}$		$ \begin{array}{c} \infty 2e5\\ 1.6e+1:1470\\ \infty 2e5\\ 1.6e+1:1470\\ 1.6(0.5)\\ 1.2(0.3)\\ 1.0(0.4)\\ 1.3(0.4)\\ \infty 2000\\ 0.84(0.2)\\ 1.0e+1:1716\\ \infty 501\\ 1.7(0.3)\\ 1.00(0.5)\\ 1.0(0.2)\\ 2.1(0.5)\\ \infty 2000\\ \end{array} $	15/15 0/15 15/15	minc fminc f18 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- SMAC- SMAC-	$\begin{array}{c} 0.50(0.3)\\ 20(65) & 4.0e+1.116\\ 0.59(0.9)\\ 11(25) & 1.8(2)\\ 20(43) & 0.41(0.7)\\ 0.31(0.4) & 7.0(6)\\ 1.6e+12.5e5\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ 1.4(1)\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ \end{array}$	0.92(1.0) 21(28) 2.5e+1-252 1.8(1) 56(98) 10(12) 47(91) 0.57(0.3) 8.3(20) 18(12) 1.0e-1:3.4e5 ∞ ∞ ∞ ∞ ∞ ∞ ∞ ∞ ∞ ∞ ∞	$\begin{array}{c} 15(13)\\ 1.6e+1:430\\ \hline 8.7(13)\\ 428(815)\\ 491(725)\\ 1013(1095)\\ 0.77(0.3)^{*3}\\ 20(15)\\ 823(1279)\\ 6.3e-2:3.4e5\\ \infty\\ 10(0.6)\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ \infty\end{array}$	0.1(89) 1.28(495) 1.0e+1:621 ∞ ∞ $0.76(0.3)^{*3}$ 22(15) ∞ 4.0e-2:3.4e5 ∞ 1(2) ∞ ∞ ∞ ∞ ∞ ∞		0/13 15/15 0/15
f8 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C SMAC- fminc f9 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C SMAC- fminc	4.0e+4:19 1.9(0.9) 18(0.6) 0.99(0.9) 2.2(0) 2.2(3) 1.4(2) 1.1(1) 1.0e+2:357 ∞ 2.0(1) 1.0(0.3) 1.6(0.2) 5.0(3) 0.30(0.1)*4	$\begin{array}{c} 166(161)\\ \underline{2.5e+4.35}\\ 1.3(0.5)\\ 1.0(0.5)\\ 1.0(0.6)\\ 1.3(0.4)\\ \underline{2.6(1)}\\ 1.5(1)\\ 0.99(0.9)\\ 6.3e+1.560\\ \hline \infty\\ 1.5(0.9)\\ 1.0(0.2)\\ 1.1(0.8)\\ 1.3(0.2)\\ 26(17)\\ .3(2)\\ 26(17)\\ .3(2)\\ .3(2)\\ .3(2)\\ .3(2)\\ .3(2)\\ .3(2)\\ .3(2)\\ .3(2)\\ .3(3)\\ .3($	468(390) 4.0e+3.67 2.2(2) 5.7(0.3) 1.3(0.9) 1.0(0.4) 3.3(1) 2.5(0.9) 1.6(1) 4.0e+1.684 0 1.3(0.5) 1.1(0.2) 1.00(0.7) 1.1(0.3) 0 3.3(0.5) 1.1(0.3) 0 3.3(1) 0.2(2) 1.0(0.4) 3.3(1) 4.0(2) 1.0(0.5) 1.1(0.3) 0 3.3(1) 0 3.3(1) 4.0(2) 1.0(0.4) 3.3(1) 4.0(2) 5	2.5e+2.231 2.5e+2.231 2.5e+2.231 3.0(2) 1.3(2) 1.3(2) 1.4(0.5) 2.5(e.6) 4.1(2) 1.4(0.5) 2.5e+1.756 0 1.3(0.5) 1.1(0.1) 1.0(0.4) 1.2(0.1) 0 0.34(o.0)*4	$ \begin{array}{c} \infty \ 2e5 \\ 1.6e+1:1470 \\ \infty \ 5o1 \\ 1.6(0.5) \\ 1.0(0.4) \\ \infty \ 501 \\ 1.0(0.4) \\ \infty \ 2000 \\ 0.84(0.2) \\ 1.0e+1:1716 \\ \infty \ 501 \\ 1.7(0.3) \\ 1.00(0.5) \\ 1.0(0.5) \\ 2.1(0.5) \\ \infty \ 2000 \\ 0.17(0.0)^{4} \\ \end{array} $	15/15 0/15 15/15	minc- fminc fl8 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fminc GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- SMAC- fminc	$\begin{array}{c} 0.50(0.5)\\ 20(65) & 4.0e+1.116\\ 0.59(0.9)\\ 11(25) & 1.8(2)\\ 20(43) & 0.41(0.7)\\ 0.31(0.4)\\ 7.0(6) & 1.6e+1.2.5e5\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ 1.4(1)\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ 6\\ 6\\ 6\\ 2e+d(2e-5) & *4 \end{array}$	0.92(1.0) 21(28) 2.5e+1:252 1.8(1) 56(98) 10(12) 47(91) 0.57(0.3) 8.3(20) 18(12) 1.0e-1:3.4e5 ∞ 1(0.7) ∞ 7.4e-4(7a7)* ⁴	$\begin{array}{c} 15(13) \\ 14(14) \\ 1.6e+1:430 \\ 428(815) \\ 491(725) \\ 1013(1095) \\ 0.77(0.3)^{+3} \\ 20(15) \\ 823(1279) \\ 6.3e-2:3.4e5 \\ \infty \\ 1(0.6) \\ \infty \\ \infty \\ 8.8e-4(7e-7)^{+4} \end{array}$	0.1(89) 728(495) 1.0e+1:621 ∞ ∞ $0.76(0.3)^{+3}$ 22(15) ∞ 4.0e-2:3.4e5 ∞ 1(2) ∞ $10e_{-3}(00.5)^{+4}$	$\infty 2000$ $\infty 4e5$ 4.0e+0:1090 $\infty 501$ $\infty 7e4$ $\infty 8e4$ $\infty 2e6$ 0.85(0.3) $\infty 2000$ $\infty 4e5$ 2.5e-2:3.4e5 $\infty 501$ $\infty 5e4$ 1(2) $\infty 2e6$ $\infty 8805$ $\infty 2000$ 12e-3(0e-5)*4	0/13 15/15 0/15
f8 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C SMAC- fminc f9 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C SMAC- fminc fno	$\begin{array}{c} 4.0e+4.19\\ 1.9(0.9)\\ 18(0.6)\\ 0.99(0.9)\\ 2.2(0)\\ 2.1(3)\\ 1.4(2)\\ 1.1(1)\\ 1.0e+2.357\\ \hline \infty\\ 2.0(1)\\ 1.00(0.3)\\ 1.3(0.6)\\ 1.6(0.2)\\ 5.0(3)\\ 0.30(0.1) *4\\ 4.6e+6.5\\ \end{array}$	$\frac{166(161)}{2.5e+4.35}$ $\frac{1.3(0.5)}{1.0(0.5)}$ $\frac{1.0(0.6)}{1.3(0.4)}$ $\frac{2.6(1)}{1.5(1)}$ $\frac{6.3e+1.560}{0.5(0.9)}$ $\frac{1.5(0.9)}{1.0(0.2)}$ $\frac{1.1(0.8)}{1.3(0.2)}$ $\frac{26(17)}{2.6(17)}$	$\begin{array}{c} 4.68(390) \\ 4.0e+3.67 \\ 2.2(2) \\ 5.7(0.3) \\ 1.3(0.9) \\ 1.0(0.4) \\ 3.3(1) \\ 2.5(0.9) \\ 1.6(1) \\ 4.0e+1:684 \\ \hline \\ \hline \\ 1.3(0.5) \\ 1.1(0.2) \\ 1.00(0.7) \\ 1.1(0.2) \\ 1.00(0.7) \\ 1.1(0.3) \\ \hline \\ \hline \\ \hline \\ 0.32(0.0)^{*} 4 \\ 4.0e+5.70 \\ \hline \end{array}$	2.5e+2:231 ∞ 3.0(2) 1.3(2) 1.0(0,9) 2.5(0,6) 4.1(2) 1.4(0,5) 2.5e+1:756 ∞ 1.3(0,5) 1.1(0,1) 1.0(0,4) 1.2(0,1) ∞ 0.34(0,0)*4 6.3°+(23)*	\sim 2/6.5 \sim 2/65 1.6e+1:1470 \sim 501 1.6(0.5) 1.2(0.3) 1.3(0.4) \sim 2000 0.84(0.2) 1.0e+1:1716 \sim 501 1.7(0.3) 1.00(0.5) 1.00(0.5) 1.00(0.5) \sim 2000 $0.17(0.0)^{*4}$ $40e^{-2.2015}$	15/15 0/15 15/15	fminc fminc f18 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fminc f19 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fminc fminc f19 EE GLOBA	$\begin{array}{c} 0.50(0.5)\\ \hline 0.520(5)\\ \hline 4.0e+1.116\\ \hline 0.520(.9)\\ 11(25)\\ 11.(25)\\ 11.(25)\\ 11.(25)\\ 1.8(2)\\ 20(43)\\ 0.41(0.7)\\ 0.31(0.4)\\ 7.0(6)\\ 1.6e+12.5e5\\ \hline \infty\\ \infty\\ 1.4(1)\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ 6.2e-4(2e-5)^{*4}\\ 1.6e-2^{*29}\end{array}$	0.92(1.0) 21(28) 2.5e+1:252 1.8(1) 56(98) 10(12) 47(91) 0.57(0.3) 8.3(20) 18(12) 1.0e-1:3.4e5 ∞ ∞ 1(0.7) ∞ ∞ 7.3e-4(7e-7)*4 7.3e-4(7e-7)*4	$15(13) \\ 1.6e+1:430 \\ 8.7(13) \\ 428(815) \\ 491(725) \\ 1013(1095) \\ 0.77(0.3)^{*3} \\ 20(15) \\ 8.23(1279) \\ 6.3e-2:3.4e5 \\ \infty \\ 10.6) \\ \infty \\ \infty \\ 8.8e-4(7e-7)^{*4} \\ 8.8e-4(7e-7)^{*4}$	ol(89) 728(495) 1.0e+1:621 ∞ ∞ ∞ ∞ 0.76(0.3)*3 22(15) ∞ 4.0e-2:3.4e5 ∞ ∞ ∞ 1(2) ∞ ∞ ∞ 1(2) ∞ ∞ ∞ 1(2) ∞ ∞ ∞ 1(2) 1(2) ∞ ∞ ∞ 0.76(0.3)*3 2(15) ∞ 0.76(0.3)*3 2(15) ∞ 0.76(0.3)*3 2(15) ∞ 1(2) 1(2	$\infty 2000$ $\infty 4e5$ 4.0e+0:1090 $\infty 501$ $\infty 7e4$ $\infty 2e6$ 0.85(0.3) $\infty 2000$ $\infty 4e5$ 2.5e-2:3.4e5 $\infty 501$ $\infty 5e4$ 1(2) $\infty 2e6$ $\infty 2805$ $\infty 2000$ 1.2e-3(9e-5)*4	0/13 15/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/1
f8 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C SMAC- fminc f9 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C SMAC- fminc f10 fminc f	$\begin{array}{c} 4.0e+4.19\\ 1.9(0.9)\\ 18(0.6)\\ 0.99(0.9)\\ 2.2(0)\\ 2.1(3)\\ 1.4(2)\\ 1.1(1)\\ 1.0e+2.357\\ \infty\\ 2.0(1)\\ 1.0(0.3)\\ 1.10(0.3)\\ 1.6(0.2)\\ 5.0(3)\\ 0.30(0.1)^{*4}\\ 1.6e+6.15\\ \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 166(161)\\ \underline{2.5e+4.35}\\ 1.3(0.5)\\ 1.0(0.5)\\ 1.0(0.6)\\ 1.3(0.4)\\ 2.6(1)\\ 1.5(1)\\ 0.99(0.9)\\ 6.3e+1.560\\ \hline \\ \infty\\ 1.5(0.9)\\ 1.0(0.2)\\ 1.1(0.8)\\ 1.3(0.2)\\ 26(17)\\ 0.31(2e-3)^{*4}\\ 0.31(2e-3)^{*4}\\ 1.6e+6.27\\ 1.6e+6.28\\ 1.6e+6.28\\$	468(390) 4.0e+3.67 2.2(2) 5.7(0.3) 1.3(0.9) 1.0(0.4) 3.3(1) 2.5(0.9) 1.6(1) 4.0e+1.684 (0.5) 1.1(0.2) 1.0(0.7) 1.1(0.3) (0.3) (0.4) (0.4) (0.5) 1.1(0.3) (0.4) (0.4) (0.4) (0.5) 1.1(0.3) (0.4) (0.5) (1.6) (1		$\begin{array}{c} \infty \ 2e5\\ 1.6e+1:1470\\ \infty \ 5e1\\ 1.6(0.5)\\ 1.6(0.5)\\ 1.2(0.3)\\ 1.0(0.4)\\ \infty \ 2000\\ 0.84(0.2)\\ 1.0e+1:1716\\ \infty \ 501\\ 1.7(0.3)\\ 1.00(0.5)\\ 1.0(0.2)\\ 2.1(0.5)\\ \infty \ 2000\\ 0.17(0.0)^{*4}\\ 4.0e+3:1015\\ \end{array}$	13/15 0/15 15/15	smirce fininc file EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fminc file EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fminc file file EE GLOBA	$\begin{array}{c} 0.50(0.5)\\ 0.6(5)\\ -4.0e+1.116\\ 0.59(0.9)\\ 11(25)\\ 1.8(2)\\ 20(43)\\ 0.41(0.7)\\ 0.31(0.4)\\ 7.0(6)\\ 1.6e+1.2.5e5\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ 1.4(1)\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ 6.2e-4(2e-5) \\ *4\\ 1.6e+4.38\\ \end{array}$	0.92(1.0) 21(28) 2.5e+1:252 1.8(1) 56(98) 10(12) 47(91) 0.57(0.3) 8.3(20) 18(12) 1.0e-1:3.4e5 ∞ 1(0.7) ∞ 7.3e-4(7e-7)*4 1.0e+4:42	$\begin{array}{c} 15(13)\\ 14(14)\\ 1.6e+1:430\\ 428(815)\\ 491(725)\\ 1013(1095)\\ \textbf{0.77}(0.3)^{\star}3\\ 20(15)\\ 823(1279)\\ 6.3e-2:3.4e5\\ \infty\\ 1(0.6)\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ \textbf{8.8e-4}(7e-7)^{\star}4\\ 2.5e+2:62\end{array}$	o (189) 728(495) 1.0e+1:621 ∞ ∞ 0.76(0.3)*3 22(15) ∞ 4.0e-23.4e5 ∞ 1.(2) ∞ ∞ 1.(2) ∞ 1.(2) ∞ 1.(2) ∞ 1.(2) ∞ 1.(2) ∞ 1.(2) ∞ 1.(2) ∞ 1.(2) 1.(2) ∞ 1.(2)	$ \begin{split} & & \sim 2000 \\ & & \sim 4.6e + 0:1090 \\ & & \sim 501 \\ & & \sim 7e4 \\ & & \sim 8e4 \\ & & \sim 2e6 \\ & & 0.85(0.3) \\ & & \sim 2000 \\ & & \sim 4e5 \\ & & 2.5e - 2:3.4e5 \\ & & \sim 5e4 \\ & & 1(2) \\ & & \sim 5e4 \\ & & 1(2) \\ & & \sim 2e6 \\ & & \sim 8805 \\ & & \sim 2000 \\ & & & 1.2e - 3(0e - 5)^{*4} \\ & & 1.6e + 0.2536 \end{split} $	0/13 15/15 0/15
f8 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C SMAC-fminc f9 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C SMAC-fminc fminc fminc f10	$\begin{array}{c} 4.0e+4.19\\ 1.9(0.9)\\ 18(0.6)\\ 0.99(0.9)\\ 2.2(0)\\ 2.1(3)\\ 1.4(2)\\ 1.1(1)\\ 1.0e+2.357\\ \infty\\ 2.0(1)\\ 1.0(0.3)\\ 1.3(0.6)\\ 1.5(0.2)\\ 5.0(3)\\ 0.30(0.1)^{\star}4\\ 1.6e+6.15\\ 5.3(4)\\ \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 166(161)\\ 2.5e+4.35\\ 1.3(0.5)\\ 10(0.5)\\ 1.0(0.6)\\ 1.3(0.4)\\ 2.6(1)\\ 1.5(1)\\ 0.99(0.9)\\ 6.3e+1.560\\ \hline \infty\\ 1.0(0.2)\\ 1.0(0$	$\begin{array}{c} 4.68(390) \\ 4.0e+3.67 \\ 2.2(2) \\ 5.7(0.3) \\ 1.3(0.9) \\ 1.0(0.4) \\ 3.3(1) \\ 2.5(0.9) \\ 1.6(1) \\ 4.0e+1:684 \\ \hline \\ \hline \\ 1.3(0.5) \\ 1.1(0.2) \\ 1.00(0.7) \\ 1.1(0.2) \\ 1.00(0.7) \\ 1.1(0.3) \\ \hline \\ \hline \\ 0.32(0.0)^{\star} 4 \\ 4.0e+5.70 \\ 22(24) \end{array}$	2.5e+2:231 ∞ 3.0(2) 1.3(2) 1.0(0,9) 2.5(0,6) 4.1(2) 1.4(0,5) 2.5e+1:756 ∞ 1.3(0,5) 1.1(0,1) 1.0(0,4) 1.2(0,1) ∞ 0.34(0,0)*4 6.3e+4:231 ∞	$\begin{array}{c} \infty 2e5\\ 1.6e+1:1470\\ \infty 2e5\\ 1.6e+1:1470\\ 1.6(0.5)\\ 1.2(0.3)\\ 1.3(0.4)\\ \infty 2000\\ 0.84(0.2)\\ 1.0e+1:1716\\ \infty 501\\ 1.7(0.3)\\ 1.00(0.5)\\ 1.0(0.5)\\ 0.17(0.0)^{*}4\\ 4.0e^{*}3:10\\ \infty 501\\ \end{array}$	13/15 0/15 15/15 0/15	minic fininc fininc fininc fI8 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fininc f19 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fininc f19 EE FI SMAC- fininc f19 EE FI SMAC- fininc f19 EE FI SMAC- fininc f19 EE FI SMAC- fininc f19 EE FI SMAC- fI FI EE FI SMAC- fI FI EE FI SMAC- FI FI EE FI SMAC- FI FI FI FI FI FI FI FI FI FI	$\begin{array}{c} 0.50(0.5)\\ -0.520(5)\\ -4.0e+1.116\\ 0.520(9)\\ 11(25)\\ 11.(25)\\ 11.(25)\\ 1.8(2)\\ 20(43)\\ 0.41(0.7)\\ 0.31(0.4)\\ 7.0(6)\\ 1.6e+1.2.5e5\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ 1.4(1)\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ 6.2e-4(2e-5)^{*.4}\\ 1.6e+4.38\\ 0.68(0.1)\\ \end{array}$	0.92(1.0) 21(28) 2.5e+1:252 1.8(1) 56(98) 10(12) 47(91) 0.57(0.3) 8.3(20) 18(12) 1.0e-1:3.4e5 ∞ ∞ 7.3e-4(7e-7)*4 1.0e+4:42 0.87(0.4)	$\begin{array}{c} 15(13) \\ 1.6e+1:430 \\ \hline $L.ce+1:430 \\ $428(815) \\ 428(815) \\ 491(725) \\ 1013(1095) \\ 0.77(0.3)^{\star 3} \\ 20(15) \\ 823(1279) \\ 6.3e-2:3.4e5 \\ \hline \infty \\ 10.6) \\ \hline \infty \\ \infty \\ 8.8e-4(7e-7)^{\star 4} \\ 2.5e+2:62 \\ 2.5(2) \end{array}$	ol(89) 728(495) 1.0e+1:621 ∞ ∞ ∞ ∞ 0.76(0.3)*3 22(15) ∞ 4.0e-2:3.4e5 ∞ ∞ ∞ 1.0e-3(9e-5)*4 2.5e+0:250 ∞	$ \begin{array}{c} & \infty \ 2000 \\ & \infty \ 4c + 0.1090 \\ \hline & 0.000 \\ & \infty \ 501 \\ \hline & 0.000 \\ & \infty \ 501 \\ \hline & 0.000 \\ & 0.0$	0/13 15/15 0/15
f8 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C SMAC-fminc f9 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C SMAC-fminc f10 EE GLOBA	$\begin{array}{c} 4.0e{+}4.19\\ 1.9(0.9)\\ 18(0.6)\\ 0.99(0.9)\\ 2.2(0)\\ 2.1(3)\\ 1.4(2)\\ 1.1(1)\\ 1.0e{+}2.357\\ \infty\\ 2.0(1)\\ 1.0(0.3)\\ 1.0(0.3)\\ 1.6(0.2)\\ 5.0(3)\\ 0.30(0.1)^{*}4\\ 1.6e{+}6.15\\ 5.3(4)\\ 14(9)\\ \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 166(161)\\ \underline{2.5e+4.35}\\ 1.3(0.5)\\ 1.0(0.5)\\ 1.0(0.6)\\ 1.3(0.4)\\ 2.6(1)\\ 1.5(1)\\ 0.99(0.9)\\ 6.3e+1.560\\ \hline \\ \hline \\ 0\\ 1.5(0.9)\\ 1.0(0.2)\\ 1.1(0.8)\\ 1.3(0.2)\\ 26(17)\\ 0.31(2-3) *4\\ 1.0e+6.27\\ 4.1(2)\\ 13(3)\\ 13(3)\\ \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 4.68(390) \\ \hline 4.0e+3.67 \\ 2.2(2) \\ 5.7(0.3) \\ 1.3(0.9) \\ 1.0(0.4) \\ 3.3(1) \\ 2.5(0.9) \\ 1.6(1) \\ 4.0e+1.684 \\ \hline \\ \\ \hline \\ \\ \\ \\ \\ \\ \\ \\ \\ \\ \\ \\ \\ \\ $	$\begin{array}{c} & & \\ & 2.5e+2.231 \\ \hline & \\ & \\ & \\ & \\ & \\ & \\ & \\ & \\ & \\$	∞ 2e5 1.6e+1:1470 ∞ 501 1.6(0.5) 1.6(0.5) 1.2(0.3) 1.0(0.4) ∞ 2000 0.84(0.2) 1.0e+1:1716 ∞ 501 1.7(0.3) 1.0(0.5) ∞ 2000 0.17(0.0)*4 4.0e+3:1015 ∞ 501 2.1(0.7)	13/15 0/15 15/15	minic fininc fininc fil8 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fininc f19 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fininc f19 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fininc f19 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fininc f19 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fininc f19 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fininc f19 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fininc GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fininc GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fininc GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fininc GLOBA MCS h GLOBA MCS h GLOBA MCS h GLOBA MCS h GLOBA GLOBA MCS h GLOBA GLOBA GLOBA GLOBA MCS h GLOBA GLO	$\begin{array}{c} 0.50(0.3)\\ 20(65) & 4.0e+1.116\\ 0.59(0.9)\\ 11(25) & 1.1(25)\\ 1.8(2)\\ 20(43) & 0.41(0.7)\\ 0.31(0.4)\\ 7.0.(6) & 1.6e+1.2.5e5\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ 1.4(1)\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ 1.6e+4.38\\ 0.68(0.1)\\ 8.7(0.3)\\ \end{array}$	0.92(1.0) 21(28) 2.5e+1:252 1.8(1) 56(98) 10(12) 47(91) 0.57(0.3) 8.3(20) 18(12) 1.0e-1:3.4e5 ∞ 10(0.7) ∞ 10e-1:3.4e5 ∞ 10e-4:42 0.87(0.4) 8.0(0.2)	$\begin{array}{c} 15(13)\\ 14(14)\\ 1.6e+1:430\\ 428(815)\\ 491(725)\\ 1013(1095)\\ 0.77(0.3)^{\star}3\\ 20(15)\\ 823(1279)\\ 6.3e-2:3.4e5\\ \infty\\ 1(0.6)\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ 8.8e-4(7e-7)^{\star}4\\ 2.5e+2:62\\ 2.5(2)\\ 6.2(0.3)\\ \end{array}$	o (189) 728(495) 1.0e+1:621 ∞ ∞ ∞ 0.76(0.3)*3 22(15) ∞ 4.0e-23.4e5 ∞ 1(2) ∞ ∞ 1.0e-3(9e-5)*4 2.5e+0:250 ∞ 3.8(1)	∞ 2000 ∞ 4e5 4.0e+0:1090 ∞ 501 ∞ 7e4 ∞ 8e4 ∞ 2e6 0.85(0.3) ∞ 2000 ∞ 4e5 2.5e-2:3.4e5 ∞ 501 ∞ 5e4 1(2) ∞ 2e6 ∞ 8805 ∞ 2000 1.2e-3(9e-5)*4 1.6e+0:2536 ∞ 501 1.5(2)	0/13 0/13 0/15
f8 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C SMAC-fminc f9 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C SMAC-fminc f0 EE GLOBA MCS h	$\begin{array}{c} 4.0e+4.19\\ 1.9(0.9)\\ 18(0.6)\\ 0.99(0.9)\\ 2.2(0)\\ 2.1(3)\\ 1.4(2)\\ 1.1(1)\\ 1.0e+2.357\\ \infty\\ 2.0(1)\\ 1.00(0.3)\\ 1.3(0.6)\\ 1.6(0.2)\\ 5.0(3)\\ 0.30(0.1)^{\star}4\\ 1.6e+6.15\\ 5.3(4)\\ 14(9)\\ 14(9)\\ 14(0.3)^{\star}\\ \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 166(161)\\ 2.5e+4.35\\ 1.3(0.5)\\ 10(0.5)\\ 1.0(0.6)\\ 1.3(0.6)\\ 2.6(1)\\ 1.5(1)\\ 0.99(0.9)\\ 6.3e+1.560\\ \hline \\ \hline \\ \hline \\ 0.99(0.9)\\ 1.0(0.2)\\ 1.1(0.8)\\ 1.3(0.2)\\ 2.6(17)\\ 0.31(2e-3)*4\\ 1.0e+6.27\\ 1.10e+6.27\\ 1.10e+5.27\\ 1.0e+6.27\\ 1.0e+5.27\\ 1.0e+5.28\\ 1.0$	$\begin{array}{c} 4.68(390) \\ 4.0e+3.67 \\ 2.2(2) \\ 5.7(0.3) \\ 1.3(0.9) \\ 1.0(0.4) \\ 3.3(1) \\ 2.5(0.9) \\ 1.6(1) \\ 4.0e+1.684 \\ \hline \\ \hline \\ 0.32(0.0) \\ 1.1(0.2) \\ 1.00(0.7) \\ 1.1(0.2) \\ 1.00(0.7) \\ 1.1(0.3) \\ \hline \\ \hline \\ 0.32(0.0) \\ 4 \\ 4.0e+5.70 \\ 22(24) \\ 6.0(0.8) \\ 1.0(5.5) \\ \hline \end{array}$		\sim 2/c5 1.6e+1:1470 \sim 501 1.6(0.5) 1.2(0.3) 1.3(0.4) \sim 2000 0.84(0.2) 1.0e+1:1716 \sim 501 1.7(0.3) 1.0(0.5) 1.0(0.5) \sim 2000 0.17(0.0)*4 4.0e+3:1015 \sim 501 2.1(0.7) 1.1(0.7)	13/15 0/15 15/15 <td>minc fminc fminc file EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fminc file EE GLOBA MCS h EE GLOBA MCS h</td> <td>$\begin{array}{c} 0.50(0.5)\\ \hline 0.520(5)\\ \hline 4.0e+1.116\\ \hline 0.520(.9)\\ \hline 11(25)\\ \hline 11.(25)\\ \hline 1.8(2)\\ 20(43)\\ \hline 0.41(0.7)\\ \hline 0.31(0.4)\\ \hline 7.06(6)\\ \hline 1.6e+1.2.5e5\\ \hline \infty\\ \hline \infty\\ \hline 1.4(1)\\ \hline \infty\\ \hline 6.2e-4(2e-5)^{*.4}\\ \hline 1.6e+4.38\\ \hline 0.68(0.1)\\ \hline 8.7(0.3)\\ \hline 2.1(0) \end{array}$</td> <td>0.92(1.0) 21(28) 2.5e+1.252 1.8(1) 56(98) 10(12) 47(91) 0.57(0.3) 8.3(20) 18(12) 1.0e-1.3.4e5 ∞ 1(0.7) ∞ ∞ 7.3e-4(7e-7)*4 1.0e+4.34 0.87(0.4) 8.3(20) 1.0e+4.34 0.87(0.4) 0.97(0.4) 0.97</td> <td>$\begin{array}{c} 15(13)\\ 1.6e+1:430\\ 8.7(13)\\ 428(815)\\ 428(815)\\ 491(725)\\ 1013(1095)\\ 0.77(0.3)^{\star}3\\ 20(15)\\ 823(1279)\\ 6.3e-2:3.4e5\\ \infty\\ 1(0.6)\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ 8.8e-4(7e-7)^{\star}4\\ 2.5e+2:62\\ 2.5(2)\\ 6.2(0.3)\\ 5.3(3)\end{array}$</td> <td>o 1(89) 728(495) 1.0e+1:621 ∞ ∞ ∞ ∞ 0.76(0.3)*3 22(15) ∞ 4.0e-2:3.4e5 ∞ ∞ ∞ 1.0e-3(9e-5)*4 2.5e+0:250 ∞ 3.8(1) 1.8(0.4)</td> <td>$\infty 2000$ $\infty 4e5$ 4.0e+0:1090 $\infty 501$ $\infty 504$ $\infty 2e4$ 0.85(0.3) $\infty 2000$ $\infty 4e5$ 2.5e-2:3.4e5 $\infty 501$ $\infty 5e4$ 1(2) $\infty 2e6$ $\infty 8805$ $\infty 2000$ 1.2e-3(9e-5)*4 1.6e+0.2536 $\infty 501$ 1.5(2) 4.7(11)</td> <td>0/13 0/13 0/15</td>	minc fminc fminc file EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fminc file EE GLOBA MCS h EE GLOBA MCS h	$\begin{array}{c} 0.50(0.5)\\ \hline 0.520(5)\\ \hline 4.0e+1.116\\ \hline 0.520(.9)\\ \hline 11(25)\\ \hline 11.(25)\\ \hline 1.8(2)\\ 20(43)\\ \hline 0.41(0.7)\\ \hline 0.31(0.4)\\ \hline 7.06(6)\\ \hline 1.6e+1.2.5e5\\ \hline \infty\\ \hline \infty\\ \hline 1.4(1)\\ \hline \infty\\ \hline 6.2e-4(2e-5)^{*.4}\\ \hline 1.6e+4.38\\ \hline 0.68(0.1)\\ \hline 8.7(0.3)\\ \hline 2.1(0) \end{array}$	0.92(1.0) 21(28) 2.5e+1.252 1.8(1) 56(98) 10(12) 47(91) 0.57(0.3) 8.3(20) 18(12) 1.0e-1.3.4e5 ∞ 1(0.7) ∞ ∞ 7.3e-4(7e-7)*4 1.0e+4.34 0.87(0.4) 8.3(20) 1.0e+4.34 0.87(0.4) 0.97(0.4) 0.97	$\begin{array}{c} 15(13)\\ 1.6e+1:430\\ 8.7(13)\\ 428(815)\\ 428(815)\\ 491(725)\\ 1013(1095)\\ 0.77(0.3)^{\star}3\\ 20(15)\\ 823(1279)\\ 6.3e-2:3.4e5\\ \infty\\ 1(0.6)\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ 8.8e-4(7e-7)^{\star}4\\ 2.5e+2:62\\ 2.5(2)\\ 6.2(0.3)\\ 5.3(3)\end{array}$	o 1(89) 728(495) 1.0e+1:621 ∞ ∞ ∞ ∞ 0.76(0.3)*3 22(15) ∞ 4.0e-2:3.4e5 ∞ ∞ ∞ 1.0e-3(9e-5)*4 2.5e+0:250 ∞ 3.8(1) 1.8(0.4)	$\infty 2000$ $\infty 4e5$ 4.0e+0:1090 $\infty 501$ $\infty 504$ $\infty 2e4$ 0.85(0.3) $\infty 2000$ $\infty 4e5$ 2.5e-2:3.4e5 $\infty 501$ $\infty 5e4$ 1(2) $\infty 2e6$ $\infty 8805$ $\infty 2000$ 1.2e-3(9e-5)*4 1.6e+0.2536 $\infty 501$ 1.5(2) 4.7(11)	0/13 0/13 0/15
f8 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C SMAC-fminc fminc GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C SMAC-fminc SMAC-fminc SMAC-fminc fminc SMAC-fminc fminc GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C SMAC-fminc full EE GLOBA MCS h	$\begin{array}{c} 4.0e+4.19\\ 1.9(0.9)\\ 18(0.6)\\ 0.99(0.9)\\ 2.2(0)\\ 2.1(3)\\ 1.4(2)\\ 1.1(1)\\ 1.0e+2.357\\ \infty\\ 2.0(1)\\ 1.0(0.3)\\ 1.6(0.2)\\ 5.0(3)\\ 1.6(0.2)\\ 5.0(3)\\ 1.6e+6.15\\ 5.3(4)\\ 1.6e+6.15\\ 5.3(4)\\ 14(9)\\ 1(0.3)^{\star}\\ 1(9)$	$\frac{166(161)}{2.5e+4.35}$ $\frac{1.3(0.5)}{1.0(0.5)}$ $\frac{1.0(0.6)}{1.3(0.4)}$ $\frac{2.6(1)}{2.6(1)}$ $\frac{1.5(1)}{0.99(0.9)}$ $\frac{6.3e+1.560}{6.3e+1.560}$ ∞ $\frac{1.5(0.9)}{1.0(0.2)}$ $\frac{1.0(0.2)}{1.1(0.8)}$ $\frac{1.3(0.2)}{26(17)}$ $\frac{2.6(17)}{1.3(0.2)}$ $\frac{4.1(2)}{13(3)}$ $\frac{1.0(e,6.27)}{13(3)}$	$\begin{array}{c} 4.68(390) \\ \hline 4.0e+3.67 \\ 2.2(2) \\ 5.7(0.3) \\ 1.3(0.9) \\ 1.0(0.4) \\ 3.3(1) \\ 2.5(0.9) \\ 1.6(1) \\ 4.0e+1.684 \\ \hline \\ \hline \\ \hline \\ 0.3(0.5) \\ 1.1(0.2) \\ 1.00(0.7) \\ 1.1(0.3) \\ \hline \\ 0.3(2(0.4)) \\ 4.0e+5.70 \\ 2.2(24) \\ 6.0(0.8) \\ 1.0(0.5) \\ 1.0(0.5) \\ 1.0(0.5) \\ \hline \end{array}$	2.5e+2:231 2.5e+2:231 2.5e+2:231 2.5e+2:231 1.00(0.9) 2.5(0.6) 4.1(2) 1.4(0.5) 2.5e+7:556 ∞ 1.3(0.5) 1.1(0.1) 1.0(0.4) 1.2(0.1) ∞ 0.34(0.0)*4 6.5e+4:231 ∞ 3.3(1) 14(19) 12(0.5)	$\begin{array}{c} \infty 2e5\\ 1.6e+1:1470\\ \infty 501\\ 1.6(0.5)\\ 1.2(0.3)\\ 1.0(0.4)\\ \infty 2000\\ 0.84(0.2)\\ 1.0e+1:716\\ \infty 501\\ 1.7(0.3)\\ 1.00(0.5)\\ 1.0(0.5)\\ 2.1(0.5)\\ \infty 2000\\ 0.17(0.0)^{*4}\\ 4.0e+3:1015\\ \infty 501\\ 2.1(0.7)\\ 1162(107)\\ 1162(107)\\ \end{array}$	13/15 0/15 15/15 <td>Smirce fminc fminc f18 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fminc f19 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fminc f20 EE GLOBA MCS h</td> <td>$\begin{array}{c} 0.50(0.3)\\ 20(65) & 4.0e+1.116\\ 0.59(0.9)\\ 11(25) & 1.1(25)\\ 1.8(2)\\ 20(43) & 0.41(0.7)\\ 0.31(0.4)\\ 7.0.(6) & 1.6e+1.2.5e5\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ 1.4(1)\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ 1.6e+4.38\\ 0.68(0.1)\\ 8.7(0.3)\\ 2.1(0)\\ 1.6(0.5)\\ 1.6e+4.38\\ 0.68(0.1)\\ 8.7(0.3)\\ 2.1(0)\\ 1.6e+4.38\\ 0.68(0.1)\\ 1$</td> <td>0.92(1.0) 21(28) 2.5e+1:252 1.8(1) 56(98) 10(12) 47(91) 0.57(0.3) 8.3(20) 18(12) 1.0e-1:3.4e5 ∞ 10(0.7) ∞ ∞ 7.3e+47(e-7)*4 1.0e+4:42 0.87(0.4) 8.0(0.2) 3.2(3)</td> <td>$\begin{array}{c} 15(13) \\ 14(14) \\ 1.6e+1:430 \\ \hline 8.7(13) \\ 428(815) \\ 491(725) \\ 1013(1095) \\ 0.77(0.3)^{\star}3 \\ 20(15) \\ 823(1279) \\ 6.3e-2:3.4e5 \\ \hline \infty \\ 1(0.6) \\ \hline \infty \\ \infty \\ 8.8e-4(7e-7)^{\star}4 \\ 2.5e+2:62 \\ 2.5(2) \\ 6.2(0.3) \\ 5.3(3) \\ 5.3(3) \\ 5.3(5) \end{array}$</td> <td>$b_{1(89)}$ 728(495) 1.0e+1:621 ∞ ∞ ∞ $0.76(0.3)^{+3}$ 22(15) ∞ 4.0e-23.4e5 ∞ 1(2) ∞ 1.2e4(1e4) $0.76(0.3)^{+3}$ 22(15) ∞ 1(2) ∞ 1(2) ∞ 1(2) ∞ 1(2) ∞ 1(2) ∞ 1(2) ∞ 3.8(1) 1.8(0.4) 1.8(0.4) $1.9(-5)^{+4}$ 2.5e+0.250</td> <td>$\infty 2000$ $\infty 4e5$ 4.0e+0:1090 $\infty 501$ $\infty 7e4$ $\infty 8e4$ $\infty 2e6$ 0.85(0.3) $\infty 2000$ $\infty 4e5$ 2.5e-2:3.4e5 $\infty 501$ $\infty 5e4$ 1(2) $\infty 2e6$ $\infty 8805$ $\infty 2000$ 1.2e-3(9e-5)*4 1.6e+0:2536 $\infty 501$ 1.5(2) 4.7(11)</td> <td>0/13 15/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 15/15 15/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 15/15 14/15</td>	Smirce fminc fminc f18 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fminc f19 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fminc f20 EE GLOBA MCS h	$\begin{array}{c} 0.50(0.3)\\ 20(65) & 4.0e+1.116\\ 0.59(0.9)\\ 11(25) & 1.1(25)\\ 1.8(2)\\ 20(43) & 0.41(0.7)\\ 0.31(0.4)\\ 7.0.(6) & 1.6e+1.2.5e5\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ 1.4(1)\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ 1.6e+4.38\\ 0.68(0.1)\\ 8.7(0.3)\\ 2.1(0)\\ 1.6(0.5)\\ 1.6e+4.38\\ 0.68(0.1)\\ 8.7(0.3)\\ 2.1(0)\\ 1.6e+4.38\\ 0.68(0.1)\\ 1$	0.92(1.0) 21(28) 2.5e+1:252 1.8(1) 56(98) 10(12) 47(91) 0.57(0.3) 8.3(20) 18(12) 1.0e-1:3.4e5 ∞ 10(0.7) ∞ ∞ 7.3e+47(e-7)*4 1.0e+4:42 0.87(0.4) 8.0(0.2) 3.2(3)	$\begin{array}{c} 15(13) \\ 14(14) \\ 1.6e+1:430 \\ \hline 8.7(13) \\ 428(815) \\ 491(725) \\ 1013(1095) \\ 0.77(0.3)^{\star}3 \\ 20(15) \\ 823(1279) \\ 6.3e-2:3.4e5 \\ \hline \infty \\ 1(0.6) \\ \hline \infty \\ \infty \\ 8.8e-4(7e-7)^{\star}4 \\ 2.5e+2:62 \\ 2.5(2) \\ 6.2(0.3) \\ 5.3(3) \\ 5.3(3) \\ 5.3(5) \end{array}$	$b_{1(89)}$ 728(495) 1.0e+1:621 ∞ ∞ ∞ $0.76(0.3)^{+3}$ 22(15) ∞ 4.0e-23.4e5 ∞ 1(2) ∞ 1.2e4(1e4) $0.76(0.3)^{+3}$ 22(15) ∞ 1(2) ∞ 1(2) ∞ 1(2) ∞ 1(2) ∞ 1(2) ∞ 1(2) ∞ 3.8(1) 1.8(0.4) 1.8(0.4) $1.9(-5)^{+4}$ 2.5e+0.250	$\infty 2000$ $\infty 4e5$ 4.0e+0:1090 $\infty 501$ $\infty 7e4$ $\infty 8e4$ $\infty 2e6$ 0.85(0.3) $\infty 2000$ $\infty 4e5$ 2.5e-2:3.4e5 $\infty 501$ $\infty 5e4$ 1(2) $\infty 2e6$ $\infty 8805$ $\infty 2000$ 1.2e-3(9e-5)*4 1.6e+0:2536 $\infty 501$ 1.5(2) 4.7(11)	0/13 15/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 15/15 15/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 15/15 14/15
f8 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C SMAC- fminc GLOBA MCS h NEWUO	$\begin{array}{c} 4.0e+4.19\\ 1.9(0.9)\\ 18(0.6)\\ 0.99(0.9)\\ 2.2(0)\\ 2.1(3)\\ 1.4(2)\\ 1.1(1)\\ 1.0e+2.357\\ \hline \infty\\ 2.0(1)\\ 1.00(0.3)\\ 1.3(0.6)\\ 1.5(0.2)\\ 5.0(3)\\ 0.30(0.1)^{\star}4\\ 1.6e+6.15\\ 5.3(4)\\ 1(0.3)^{\star}\\ 1(0.3)^{\star}\\ 4.2(1)\\ \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 166(161)\\ 2.5e+4.35\\ 1.3(0.5)\\ 10(0.5)\\ 1.0(0.6)\\ 1.3(0.4)\\ 2.6(1)\\ 1.5(1)\\ 0.99(0.9)\\ 6.3e+1.560\\ \hline \\ \hline$	$\begin{array}{c} 4.68(390) \\ 4.0e+3.67 \\ 2.2(2) \\ 5.7(0.3) \\ 1.3(0.9) \\ 1.0(0.4) \\ 3.3(1) \\ 2.5(0.9) \\ 1.6(1) \\ 4.0e+1.684 \\ \hline \\ \hline \\ 0.32(0.0) \\ 1.1(0.2) \\ 1.00(0.7) \\ 1.1(0.3) \\ \hline \\ \hline \\ 0.32(0.0) \\ 4 \\ 4.0e+5.70 \\ 22(24) \\ 6.0(0.8) \\ 1.0(0.5) \\ 1.4(0.6) \\ \end{array}$		$\begin{array}{c} \infty 2e5\\ 1.6e+1:1470\\ \infty 2e5\\ 1.6e+1:1470\\ \infty 501\\ 1.6(0.5)\\ 1.2(0.3)\\ 1.3(0.4)\\ \infty 2000\\ 0.84(0.2)\\ 1.0e+1:1716\\ \infty 501\\ 1.7(0.3)\\ 1.00(0.5)\\ 1.00(0.5)\\ 1.00(0.5)\\ 1.00(0.5)\\ 0.17(0.0)^{*4}\\ 4.0e+3:1015\\ \infty 501\\ 2.1(0.7)\\ 1162(1074)\\ 11(6.6)\\ \end{array}$	15/15 0/15 15/15	fminc fminc fminc f18 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fminc f19 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC	$\begin{array}{c} 0.50(0.3)\\ 20(65) & 4.0e+1.116\\ 0.59(0.9)\\ 11(25) & 1.8(2)\\ 20(43) & 0.41(0.7)\\ 0.31(0.4) & 7.0(6)\\ 1.6e+1.2.5e5\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ 1.4(1)\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ 6.2e-4(2e-5)^{*.4}\\ 1.6e+4.38\\ 0.68(0.1)\\ 8.7(0.3)\\ 2.1(0)\\ 1.1(0)\\ \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 0.92(1.0)\\ 21(28)\\ 2.5e+1.252\\ 1.8(1)\\ 56(98)\\ 10(12)\\ 47(91)\\ 0.57(0.3)\\ 8.3(20)\\ 118(12)\\ 1.0e-1.3.4e5\\ \hline \infty\\ 1(0.7)\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ 7.3e-4(7e-7)*4\\ 1.0e+4.34\\ 0.87(0.4)\\ 8.0(0.2)\\ 3.2(3)\\ 3.2(0)\\ 1.0(0)\\ \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 15(13)\\ 1.6e+1:430\\ \textbf{\emph{I.6e+1:430}}\\ \textbf{\emph{A28}(815)\\ 428(815)\\ 491(725)\\ 1013(1095)\\ \textbf{\emph{0.77}(0.3)}^{\star3}\\ 20(15)\\ 823(1279)\\ \textbf{\emph{6.3e-2:3.4e5}}\\ \textbf{\emph{0.6}}\\ \textbf{\emph{0.6}} \end{bmatrix}$	$\begin{array}{c} 0_{1(89)} \\ 128(495) \\ 1.0e+1:621 \\ \hline \infty \\ \infty \\ \infty \\ \infty \\ 0_{76(0,3)} \times 3 \\ 22(15) \\ \infty \\ 4.0e-2:3.4e5 \\ \infty \\ 1.0e-3(9e-5) \times 4 \\ 2.5e+0:250 \\ \infty \\ 0_{3.8(1)} \\ 1.8(0.4) \\ 1.0(0.5) \times 2 \end{array}$	$ \begin{array}{c} \infty & 2000 \\ \infty & 4cs \\ 4.0e+0:1090 \\ \end{array} \\ \begin{array}{c} \infty & 5c1 \\ \infty & 5c4 \\ \infty & 2c6 \\ \end{array} \\ \begin{array}{c} 0.85(0.3) \\ \infty & 2000 \\ \infty & 4c5 \\ 2.5e-2:3.4e5 \\ \end{array} \\ \begin{array}{c} \infty & 501 \\ \infty & 5c4 \\ 1(2) \\ \infty & 2c6 \\ \infty & 500 \\ \end{array} \\ \begin{array}{c} \infty & 501 \\ 1.2e-3(9e-5) \\ 1.6e+0.2536 \\ \end{array} \\ \begin{array}{c} \infty & 501 \\ 1.5(2) \\ 4.7(11) \\ 2.1(2) \end{array} \\ \end{array} $	0/13 15/15 0/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15 15/15
f8 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C SMAC-f fminc g EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C SMAC-f fminc SMAC-f fminc GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C Imm-C	$\begin{array}{c} 4.0e{+}4.19\\ 1.9(0.9)\\ 18(0.6)\\ 0.99(0.9)\\ 2.2(0)\\ 2.1(3)\\ 1.4(2)\\ 1.1(1)\\ 1.0e{+}2.357\\ \infty\\ 2.0(1)\\ 1.00(0.3)\\ 1.6(0.2)\\ 5.0(3)\\ 1.6(0.2)\\ 5.0(3)\\ 1.6e{+}6.15\\ 5.3(4)\\ 14(9)\\ 11(0.3)^{\star}\\ 4.2(1)\\ 3.7(4)\\ \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 166(161)\\ 2.5e+4.35\\ 1.3(0.5)\\ 10(0.5)\\ 1.0(0.6)\\ 1.3(0.4)\\ 2.6(1)\\ 1.5(1)\\ 0.99(0.9)\\ 6.3e+1.560\\ \hline \infty\\ 1.5(0.9)\\ 1.0(0.2)\\ 1.1(0.8)\\ 1.3(0.2)\\ 26(17)\\ 0.31(2e-3)\\ *4\\ 1.0e+6.27\\ 1.3(3)\\ 1.3(3)\\ 1.3(2)\\ 2.6(1)\\ 3.6(2)\\ \end{array}$	468(390) 4.0e+3.67 2.2(2) 5.7(0.3) 1.3(0.9) 1.0(0.4) 3.3(1) 2.5(0.9) 1.6(1) 4.0e+1.684 ∞ 1.3(0.5) 1.1(0.2) 1.00(0.7) 1.1(0.3) ∞ 0.32(0.0)*4 4.0e+5.70 22(24) 6.0(0.8) 1.0(0.5) 1.4(0.6) 1.4(0.6) 4.2(1)		$\begin{array}{c} \infty \ 2e5\\ 1.6e+1:1470\\ \infty \ 2e5\\ 1.6(0.5)\\ 1.6(0.5)\\ 1.2(0.3)\\ 1.0(0.4)\\ \infty \ 2000\\ 0.84(0.2)\\ 1.0(0.4)\\ 1.3(0.4)\\ \infty \ 2000\\ 0.17(0.3)\\ 1.00(0.5)\\ 1.0(0.5)\\ \infty \ 2000\\ 0.17(0.0)^{*4}\\ 4.0e+3:1015\\ \infty \ 501\\ 2.1(0.7)\\ 1162(1074)\\ 1(0.6)\\ 1.0(0.1)\\ \end{array}$	13/15 0/15 15/15	Smirce fminc fminc f18 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC SMAC- fminc f19 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fminc f20 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C	$\begin{array}{c} 0.50(0.3)\\ 20(65) & 4.0e+1.116\\ 0.59(0.9)\\ 11(25) & 1.1(25)\\ 1.8(2)\\ 20(43) & 0.41(0.7)\\ 0.31(0.4)\\ 7.0(6) & 1.6e+1.2.5e5\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ 1.4(1)\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ 1.6e+4.38\\ 0.68(0.1)\\ 8.7(0.3)\\ 2.1(0)\\ 1.1(0)\\ 0.92(1.0)\\ \end{array}$	0.92(1.0) 21(28) 2.5e+1.252 1.8(1) 56(98) 10(12) 47(91) 0.57(0.3) 8.3(20) 1.0e-1.3.4e5 ∞ 10e-1.3.4e5 ∞ 10e-1.3.4e5 ∞ 10e-4.42 0.87(0.4) 8.0(0.2) 3.2(3) 1.0(0) 1.4(2)	$\begin{array}{c} 15(13)\\ 14(14)\\ 1.6e+1:430\\ 428(815)\\ 491(725)\\ 1013(1095)\\ 0.77(0.3)^{\star}3\\ 20(15)\\ 823(1279)\\ 6.3e-2:3.4e5\\ \infty\\ 1(0.6)\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ 8.8e^{-4(7e-7)^{\star}4}\\ 2.5e+2:62\\ 2.5(2)\\ 6.2(0.3)\\ 5.3(3)\\ 1.0(0.2)\\ 3.9(0.9)\\ \end{array}$	(1,8) (1,8) (1,8) (1,2) ($ \begin{split} & & \sim 2000 \\ & & \sim 4.6e + 0:1090 \\ & \sim 501 \\ & \sim 501 \\ & \sim 7e4 \\ & \sim 8e4 \\ & \sim 2e6 \\ & \sim 2e6 \\ & \sim 2e6 \\ & \sim 2e6 \\ & \sim 8805 \\ & \sim 501 \\ & 1.6e + 0.2536 \\ & \sim 501 \\ & 1.5(2) \\ & 4.7(11) \\ & 2.1(2) \\ & 23(37) \\ \end{split} $	0/13 15/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 15/15 0/15 3/15 0/15 0/15 15/1
f8 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C SMAC-fminc f9 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C Imm-C SMAC-fminc f10 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUO Imm-C MCS h NEWUO MCS h SMAC-fminc SMAC- SMAC-	$\begin{array}{c} 4.0e+4.19\\ 1.9(0.9)\\ 18(0.6)\\ 0.99(0.9)\\ 2.2(0)\\ 2.1(3)\\ 1.4(2)\\ 1.1(1)\\ 1.0e+2.357\\ \hline \infty\\ 2.0(1)\\ 1.00(0.3)\\ 1.3(0.6)\\ 1.5(0.6)\\ 1.6(0.2)\\ 5.0(3)\\ 0.30(0.1)^{\star}4\\ 1.6e+6.15\\ 5.3(4)\\ 1(0.3)^{\star}4\\ 4.2(1)\\ 3.7(4)\\ 3.7(4)\\ 3.7(4)\\ 3.7(5)\\ \hline \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 166(161)\\ 2.5e+4.35\\ 1.3(0.5)\\ 10(0.5)\\ 1.0(0.6)\\ 1.3(0.4)\\ 2.6(1)\\ 1.5(1)\\ 0.99(0.9)\\ 6.3e+1.560\\ \hline \infty\\ 1.5(0.9)\\ 1.0(0.2)\\ 1.1(0.8)\\ 1.3(0.2)\\ 26(17)\\ 26(17)\\ 3.3(3)\\ 4.1(2)\\ 1.3(3)\\ 1.0(0.6)^{4}2\\ 2.6(1)\\ 3.6(2)\\ 5.6(4)\\ \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 4.68(390) \\ 4.0e+3.67 \\ 2.2(2) \\ 5.7(0.3) \\ 1.3(0.9) \\ 1.0(0.4) \\ 3.3(1) \\ 2.5(0.9) \\ 1.6(1) \\ 4.0e+1.684 \\ \hline \\ \hline \\ 0.32(0.9) \\ 1.1(0.2) \\ 1.00(0.7) \\ 1.1(0.2) \\ 1.00(0.7) \\ 1.1(0.3) \\ \hline \\ \hline \\ 0.32(0.0) \\ 4.0e+5.70 \\ 22(24) \\ 6.0(0.8) \\ 1.0(0.5) \\ 1.4(0.6) \\ 4.2(1) \\ 6.2(5) \\ \hline \end{array}$		$\begin{array}{c} \infty 2e5\\ 1.6e+1:1470\\ \infty 2e5\\ 1.6e+1:1470\\ \infty 501\\ 1.6(0.5)\\ 1.2(0.3)\\ 1.3(0.4)\\ \infty 2000\\ 0.84(0.2)\\ 1.0e+1:1716\\ \infty 501\\ 1.7(0.3)\\ 1.00(0.5)\\ 1.00(0.5)\\ 1.00(0.5)\\ 0.17(0.0)^{*4}\\ 4.0e+3:1015\\ \infty 501\\ 2.1(0.7)\\ 1162(1074)\\ 11(0.6)\\ 1.0(0.1)\\ \infty 2000\\ \end{array}$	13/15 0/15 15/15 <td>fminc fminc fminc f18 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fminc f19 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA NEWUC SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA NEWUC SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA NEWUC SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMACS SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- SMAC SMAC- SM</td> <td>$\begin{array}{c} 0.50(0.3)\\ 20(65) & 4.0e+1.116\\ 0.59(0.9)\\ 11(25) & 1.8(2)\\ 20(43) & 0.41(0.7)\\ 0.31(0.4) & 7.0(6)\\ 1.6e+1.2.5e5\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ 1.4(1)\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ 6.2e-4(2e-5)^{*.4}\\ 1.6e+4.38\\ 0.68(0.1)\\ 8.7(0.3)\\ 2.1(0)\\ 1.1(0)\\ 0.92(1.0)\\ 0.25(0.1)^{*}\\ \end{array}$</td> <td>0.92(1.0) 21(28) 2.5e+1.252 1.8(1) 56(98) 10(12) 47(91) 0.57(0.3) 8.3(20) 18(12) 1.0e-1.3.4e5 ∞ 10,7) ∞ ∞ 7.3e-4(7e-7)*4 1.0e+4.342 0.87(0.4) 8.0(0.2) 3.2(3) 3.2(3) 1.0(0) 1.4(2) 0.46(0.2)</td> <td><math display="block">15(13) 1.6e+1:430 8.7(13) 428(815) 428(815) 491(725) 0.77(0.3)*3 20(15) 823(1279) 6.3e-2:3.4e5 ∞ 10(0.6) ∞ 8.8e-4(7e-7)*4 2.5(e2) 6.2(0.3) 5.3(3) 1.0(0.2) 3.9(0.9) 0.91(0.2) 0.</math></td> <td><math display="block">\begin{array}{c} 0_{1(89)} \\ 128(495) \\ 1.0e+1:621 \\ \hline \infty \\ \infty \\ \infty \\ \infty \\ \infty \\ 0.76(0.3)^{\star 3} \\ 22(15) \\ \infty \\ 4.0e-2:3.4e5 \\ \hline \infty \\ 1.0e-3(9e-5)^{\star 4} \\ 2.5e+0:250 \\ \hline \infty \\ 3.8(1) \\ 1.8(0.4) \\ 1.8(0.4) \\ 1.8(0.4) \\ 1.8(0.5)^{\star 2} \\ 6.6(0.8) \\ \infty \end{array}</math></td> <td>$\begin{array}{c} \infty \ 2000 \\ \infty \ 4c + 0.1090 \\ 4.0c + 0.1090 \\ \hline \end{array} \\ \begin{array}{c} \infty \ 5c1 \\ \infty \ 5c1 \\ \infty \ 5c4 \\ \infty \ 2c6 \\ 0.85(0.3) \\ \infty \ 2000 \\ \infty \ 4c5 \\ 2.5c - 2.3.4c5 \\ \hline \end{array} \\ \begin{array}{c} \infty \ 5c4 \\ 1(2) \\ \infty \ 5c4 \\ 1.2c \\ 3000 \\ \infty \ 5c4 \\ 1.2c \\ 3000 \\ 1.2c \\ 3000 \\ 1.2c \\ 3000 \\ 1.5(2) \\ 4.7(11) \\ 2.1(2) \\ 2.3(37) \\ \infty \ 2000 \end{array}$</td> <td>0/13 15/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/1</td>	fminc fminc fminc f18 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fminc f19 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC Imm-C SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA MCS h NEWUC SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA NEWUC SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA NEWUC SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA NEWUC SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMAC- fminc SMAC- fminc f10 EE GLOBA SMACS SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- fminc f10 SMAC- SMAC SMAC- SM	$\begin{array}{c} 0.50(0.3)\\ 20(65) & 4.0e+1.116\\ 0.59(0.9)\\ 11(25) & 1.8(2)\\ 20(43) & 0.41(0.7)\\ 0.31(0.4) & 7.0(6)\\ 1.6e+1.2.5e5\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ 1.4(1)\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ \infty\\ 6.2e-4(2e-5)^{*.4}\\ 1.6e+4.38\\ 0.68(0.1)\\ 8.7(0.3)\\ 2.1(0)\\ 1.1(0)\\ 0.92(1.0)\\ 0.25(0.1)^{*}\\ \end{array}$	0.92(1.0) 21(28) 2.5e+1.252 1.8(1) 56(98) 10(12) 47(91) 0.57(0.3) 8.3(20) 18(12) 1.0e-1.3.4e5 ∞ 10,7) ∞ ∞ 7.3e-4(7e-7)*4 1.0e+4.342 0.87(0.4) 8.0(0.2) 3.2(3) 3.2(3) 1.0(0) 1.4(2) 0.46(0.2)	$15(13) 1.6e+1:430 8.7(13) 428(815) 428(815) 491(725) 0.77(0.3)*3 20(15) 823(1279) 6.3e-2:3.4e5 \infty10(0.6)\infty8.8e-4(7e-7)*42.5(e2)6.2(0.3)5.3(3)1.0(0.2)3.9(0.9)0.91(0.2)0.$	$\begin{array}{c} 0_{1(89)} \\ 128(495) \\ 1.0e+1:621 \\ \hline \infty \\ \infty \\ \infty \\ \infty \\ \infty \\ 0.76(0.3)^{\star 3} \\ 22(15) \\ \infty \\ 4.0e-2:3.4e5 \\ \hline \infty \\ 1.0e-3(9e-5)^{\star 4} \\ 2.5e+0:250 \\ \hline \infty \\ 3.8(1) \\ 1.8(0.4) \\ 1.8(0.4) \\ 1.8(0.4) \\ 1.8(0.5)^{\star 2} \\ 6.6(0.8) \\ \infty \end{array}$	$ \begin{array}{c} \infty \ 2000 \\ \infty \ 4c + 0.1090 \\ 4.0c + 0.1090 \\ \hline \end{array} \\ \begin{array}{c} \infty \ 5c1 \\ \infty \ 5c1 \\ \infty \ 5c4 \\ \infty \ 2c6 \\ 0.85(0.3) \\ \infty \ 2000 \\ \infty \ 4c5 \\ 2.5c - 2.3.4c5 \\ \hline \end{array} \\ \begin{array}{c} \infty \ 5c4 \\ 1(2) \\ \infty \ 5c4 \\ 1.2c \\ 3000 \\ \infty \ 5c4 \\ 1.2c \\ 3000 \\ 1.2c \\ 3000 \\ 1.2c \\ 3000 \\ 1.5(2) \\ 4.7(11) \\ 2.1(2) \\ 2.3(37) \\ \infty \ 2000 \end{array} $	0/13 15/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/15 0/1

Table 1: Expected runtime (ERT in number of function evaluations) divided by the respective best ERT measured during BBOB-2009 in dimension 20. This ERT ratio and, in braces as dispersion measure, the half difference between 10 and 90%-tile of bootstrapped run lengths appear for each algorithm and run-length based target, the corresponding reference ERT (preceded by the target Δf -value in *italics*) in the first row. #succ is the number of trials that reached the target value of the last column. The median number of conducted function evaluations is additionally given in *italics*, if the target in the last column was never reached. Entries, succeeded by a star, are statistically significantly better (according to the rank-sum test) when compared to all other algorithms of the table, with p = 0.05 or $p = 10^{-k}$ when the number k following the star is larger than 1, with Bonferroni correction by the number of functions (24). A \downarrow indicates the same tested against the best algorithm from BBOB 2009. Best results are printed in bold. Data produced with COC V2.4



Figure 7: As in Figure 4, but for dimension 40 and $f_3, f_4, f_7, f_{15}, \ldots, f_{19}$.



Figure 8: As in Figure 4, but for dimension 80 (top row) and 160 (bottom row) and f_{16}, \ldots, f_{19} on the bbob-largescale testbed. The Rastrigin function f_{15} has degenerate results for all algorithms and so is not shown. Note that [12] points out that algorithms are only comparable up to the smallest budget given to any of them, corresponding in our case exactly to the location of crosses (×), which indicate where bootstrapping of experimental data begins to estimate results for larger numbers of function evaluations. These locations are very far to the left, though EXPLO2 (here indicated as EE) is consistently a top performer there.

#FEs/D	0.5	1.2	3	10	50	#succ	#FEs/D	0.5	1.2	3	10	50	#succ
f21	6.3e+1:36	4.0e+1:77	4.0e+1:77	1.6e+1:456	4.0e+0:1094	15/15	f23	6.3e+0:29	4.0e+0:118	2.5e+0:306	2.5e+0:306	1.0e+0:1614	15/15
EE	3.5(2)	2.9(3)	2.9(2)	1.3(1.0)	6.6(12)	1/15	EE	1.5(2)	11(14)	~	~	∞ 501	0/15
GLOBA	9.2(0.7)	5.2(0.8)	5.2(0.8)	1.0(0.2)	1.00(0.9)	15/15	GLOBA	1.8(2)	2.9(1)	1.7(0.2)	1.7(0.2)	1.00(0.7)	15/15
MCS h	0.99(0.5)	1.0(0.7)	1.0(0.7)	31(44)	36(39)	14/15	MCS h	1.5(0.9)	18(26)	29(31)	29(31)	124(103)	5/15
NEWUO	1.8(0.2)	0.99(0.2)	0.99(0.2)	1.4(3)	2.9(2)	15/15	NEWUO	7.2(19)	2.8(6)	2.1(3)	2.1(3)	3.5(4)	15/15
lmm-C	3.5(1)	2.5(1)	2.5(1)	1.3(0.1)	4.3(9)	11/15	lmm-C	1.9(3)	8.2(5)	408(548)	408(296)	∞ <i>8823</i>	0/15
SMAC-	7.5(4)	4.2(7)	4.2(8)	2.7(4)	5.2(3)	4/15	SMAC-	1.5(2)	5.0(4)	46(68)	46(75)	$\infty 2000$	0/15
fminc	0.81(0.3)	0.64 (0.2)	0.64 (0.3)	0.96(0.9)	0.92 (1)	15/15	fminc	4.9(5)	4.8(7)	3.2(2)	3.2(2)	4.4(4)	15/15
f22	6.3e+1:45	4.0e+1:68	4.0e+1:68	1.6e+1:231	6.3e+0:1219	15/15	f24	2.5e+2:208	1.6e+2:918	1.0e+2:6628	6.3e+1:9885	4.0e+1:31629	15/15
EE	2.4(0.7)	2.8(3)	2.8(3)	2.6(3)	2.9(3)	2/15	EE	0.40(0.2)	∞	∞	~	∞ 501	0/15
GLOBA	7.9(0.6)	5.8(0.9)	5.8(0.9)	2.0(0.9)	1.0(1)	15/15	GLOBA	31(95)	∞	∞	~	∞ 3e4	0/15
MCS h	1(0.3)	0.99(0.4)	0.99(0.3)	33(76)	20(27)	13/15	MCS h	1.8(1)	2.7(4)	12(33)	~	∞ 8e4	0/15
NEWUO	1.5(0.2)	1.2(0.3)	1.2(0.4)	1.00(1)	1.4(3)	15/15	NEWUO	1.1(2)	1.2(2)	4.3(5)	247(334)	∞ 2e5	0/15
lmm-C	3.1(2)	5.8(2)	5.8(11)	5.9(13)	3.8(8)	11/15	lmm-C	0.74(0.2)	1.1(0.5)	1.4 (0.8)	1.2(0.9)	1.2(1)	3/15
SMAC-	10(13)	7.2(22)	7.2(9)	4.2(7)	2.0(2)	7/15	SMAC-	0.65(1)	10(5)	∞	∞	∞ 2000	0/15
fminc	0.99 (0.4)	2.5(0.2)	2.5(7)	2.9(4)	3.5(9)	15/15	fminc	0.51(0.3)	12(1)	886(1345)	∞	∞ 4e5	0/15

Table 2: Continuation of Table 1.

GECCO '22, July 9-13, 2022, Boston, MA, USA

Zachary Hoffman et. al.



Figure 9: As in Figure 8, but for dimensions 320 (top row) and 640 (bottom row).



Figure 10: A comparison of VD-CMA-ES and EXPLO2 on the Rastrigin function (without rotations or shifts, but otherwise corresponding to f_{15} in the BBOB testbed) on $[-5.12, 5.12]^D$ for D = 20 and a budget of 500 function evaluations. For VD-CMA-ES, various initial step sizes σ_{init} were selected as shown and logging is intermittent; meanwhile, for EXPLO2, we considered $n_{\parallel} \in \{1, 32\}$ parallel workers. Each algorithm/parameter pair was run three times, all shown. Note that the initialization phase of VD-CMA-ES is not plotted.



Figure 11: As in Figure 10, but for D = 320 and a budget of 1600.

[5] S. Finck, N. Hansen, R. Ros, and A. Auger. 2009. Real-Parameter Black-Box Optimization Benchmarking 2009: Presentation of the Noiseless Functions. Technical Report 2009/20. Research Center PPE. http://coco.lri.fr/downloads/download15. 03/bbobdocfunctions.pdf Updated February 2010.



Figure 12: As in Figure 10, but for the Griewank-Rosenbrock function F8F2 (without rotations or shifts, but otherwise corresponding to f_{19} in the BBOB testbed) on $[-5, 5]^D$ for D = 20. Note that VD-CMA-ES often terminates before the budget is reached.



Figure 13: As in Figure 12, but for D = 320 and a budget of 1600.

- [6] Guohua Gao, Jeroen C Vink, Chaohui Chen, Yaakoub El Khamra, and Mohammadali Tarrahi. 2017. Distributed Gauss-Newton optimization method for history matching problems with multiple best matches. *Computational Geosciences* 21, 5 (2017), 1325–1342.
- [7] Raphael T Haftka, Diane Villanueva, and Anirban Chaudhuri. 2016. Parallel surrogate-assisted global optimization with expensive functions-a survey. Structural and Multidisciplinary Optimization 54, 1 (2016), 3-13.
- [8] N. Hansen, A Auger, D. Brockhoff, D. Tušar, and T. Tušar. 2016. COCO: Performance Assessment. ArXiv e-prints arXiv:1605.03560 (2016).

GECCO '22, July 9-13, 2022, Boston, MA, USA

- [9] Nikolaus Hansen, Anne Auger, Raymond Ros, Olaf Mersmann, Tea Tušar, and Dimo Brockhoff. 2021. COCO: A platform for comparing continuous optimizers in a black-box setting. *Optimization Methods and Software* 36, 1 (2021), 114–144.
- [10] N. Hansen, S. Finck, R. Ros, and A. Auger. 2009. Real-Parameter Black-Box Optimization Benchmarking 2009: Noiseless Functions Definitions. Technical Report RR-6829. INRIA. http://coco.lri.fr/downloads/download15.03/bbobdocfunctions. pdf Updated February 2010.
- [11] Nikolaus Hansen, Sibylle D Müller, and Petros Koumoutsakos. 2003. Reducing the time complexity of the derandomized evolution strategy with covariance matrix adaptation (CMA-ES). *Evolutionary computation* 11, 1 (2003), 1–18.
- [12] N. Hansen, T. Tušar, O. Mersmann, A. Auger, and D. Brockhoff. 2016. COCO: The Experimental Procedure. ArXiv e-prints arXiv:1603.08776 (2016).
- [13] Steve Huntsman. 2022. Parallel black-box optimization of expensive highdimensional multimodal functions via magnitude. arXiv preprint arXiv:2201.11677 (2022).
- [14] Najeeb Khan. 2018. A parallel implementation of the covariance matrix adaptation evolution strategy. arXiv preprint arXiv:1805.11201 (2018).
- [15] Tom Leinster. 2021. Entropy and Diversity: the Axiomatic Approach. Cambridge.[16] Tom Leinster and Mark W Meckes. [n.d.]. The magnitude of a metric space: from
- category theory to geometric measure theory. In *Measure Theory in Non-Smooth* Spaces, Nicola Gigli (Ed.).
- [17] Kenneth Price. 1997. Differential evolution vs. the functions of the second ICEO. In Proceedings of the IEEE International Congress on Evolutionary Computation. IEEE, Piscataway, NJ, USA, 153–157. https://doi.org/10.1109/ICEC.1997.592287

- [18] Frederik Rehbach, Martin Zaefferer, Jörg Stork, and Thomas Bartz-Beielstein. 2018. Comparison of parallel surrogate-assisted optimization approaches. In Proceedings of the Genetic and Evolutionary Computation Conference. 1348–1355.
- [19] Raymond Ros. 2009. Benchmarking the NEWUOA on the BBOB-2009 function testbed. In Proceedings of the 11th Annual Conference Companion on Genetic and Evolutionary Computation Conference: Late Breaking Papers. 2421–2428.
- [20] Ingo Steinwart and Andreas Christmann. 2008. Support vector machines. Springer.
 [21] Tea Tušar, Dimo Brockhoff, and Nikolaus Hansen. 2019. Mixed-integer benchmark
- [21] Tea Tusar, Dinio Drocknon, and Mioraus Francei. 2019. Mixed-integer benchmark problems for single-and bi-objective optimization. In Proceedings of the Genetic and Evolutionary Computation Conference. 718–726.
 [22] Tea Tušar, Nikolawa Hangar, and Dirag Banche off. 2017. Amsting Parachersel.
- [22] Tea Tušar, Nikolaus Hansen, and Dimo Brockhoff. 2017. Anytime Benchmarking of Budget-Dependent Algorithms with the COCO Platform. In IS 2017-International multiconference Information Society. 1–4.
- [23] Konstantinos Varelas. 2019. Benchmarking large scale variants of cma-es and l-bfgs-b on the bbob-largescale testbed. In Proceedings of the Genetic and Evolutionary Computation Conference Companion. 1937–1945.
- [24] Konstantinos Varelas, Anne Auger, Dimo Brockhoff, Nikolaus Hansen, Ouassim Ait ElHara, Yann Semet, Rami Kassab, and Frédéric Barbaresco. 2018. A comparative study of large-scale variants of CMA-ES. In International Conference on Parallel Problem Solving from Nature. Springer, 3–15.
- [25] Wei Xia and Christine Shoemaker. 2021. GOPS: efficient RBF surrogate global optimization algorithm with high dimensions and many parallel processors including application to multimodal water quality PDE model calibration. *Optimization* and Engineering 22, 4 (2021), 2741–2777.