

An Introduction to Verification of Visualization Techniques

Synthesis Lectures on Visual Computing

Computer Graphics, Animation, Computational Photography, and Imaging

Editor

Brian A. Barsky, *University of California, Berkeley*

This series presents lectures on research and development in visual computing for an audience of professional developers, researchers and advanced students. Topics of interest include computational photography, animation, visualization, special effects, game design, image techniques, computational geometry, modeling, rendering, and others of interest to the visual computing system developer or researcher.

[An Introduction to Verification of Visualization Techniques](#)

Tiago Etienne, Robert M. Kirby, and Cláudio T. Silva
2015

[Finite Element Method Simulation of 3D Deformable Solids](#)

Eftychios Sifakis and Jernej Barbic
2015

[Virtual Crowds: Steps Toward Behavioral Realism](#)

Mubbasir Kapadia, Nuria Pelechano, Jan Allbeck, and Norm Badler
2015

[Efficient Quadrature Rules for Illumination Integrals: From Quasi Monte Carlo to Bayesian Monte Carlo](#)

Ricardo Marques, Christian Bouville, Luís Paulo Santos, and Kadi Bouatouch
2015

[Numerical Methods for Linear Complementarity Problems in Physics-Based Animation](#)

Sarah Niebe and Kenny Erleben
2015

Mathematical Basics of Motion and Deformation in Computer Graphics

Ken Anjyo and Hiroyuki Ochiai
2014

Mathematical Tools for Shape Analysis and Description

Silvia Biasotti, Bianca Falcidieno, Daniela Giorgi, and Michela Spagnuolo
2014

Information Theory Tools for Image Processing

Miquel Feixas, Anton Bardera, Jaume Rigau, Qing Xu, and Mateu Sbert
2014

Gazing at Games: An Introduction to Eye Tracking Control

Veronica Sundstedt
2012

Rethinking Quaternions

Ron Goldman
2010

Information Theory Tools for Computer Graphics

Mateu Sbert, Miquel Feixas, Jaume Rigau, Miguel Chover, and Ivan Viola
2009

Introductory Tiling Theory for Computer Graphics

Craig S. Kaplan
2009

Practical Global Illumination with Irradiance Caching

Jaroslav Krivanek and Pascal Gautron
2009

Wang Tiles in Computer Graphics

Ares Lagae
2009

Virtual Crowds: Methods, Simulation, and Control

Nuria Pelechano, Jan M. Allbeck, and Norman I. Badler
2008

Interactive Shape Design

Marie-Paule Cani, Takeo Igarashi, and Geoff Wyvill
2008

Real-Time Massive Model Rendering

Sung-eui Yoon, Enrico Gobbetti, David Kasik, and Dinesh Manocha
2008

High Dynamic Range Video

Karol Myszkowski, Rafal Mantiuk, and Grzegorz Krawczyk
2008

GPU-Based Techniques for Global Illumination Effects

László Szirmay-Kalos, László Szécsi, and Mateu Sbert
2008

High Dynamic Range Image Reconstruction

Asla M. Sá, Paulo Cezar Carvalho, and Luiz Velho
2008

High Fidelity Haptic Rendering

Miguel A. Otaduy and Ming C. Lin
2006

A Blossoming Development of Splines

Stephen Mann
2006

© Springer Nature Switzerland AG 2022

Reprint of original edition © Morgan & Claypool 2016

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means—electronic, mechanical, photocopy, recording, or any other except for brief quotations in printed reviews, without the prior permission of the publisher.

An Introduction to Verification of Visualization Techniques

Tiago Etienne, Robert M. Kirby, and Cláudio T. Silva

ISBN: 978-3-031-01459-8 paperback

ISBN: 978-3-031-02587-7 ebook

DOI 10.1007/S00679ED1V01Y201511CGR022

A Publication in the Springer series

*SYNTHESIS LECTURES ON VISUAL COMPUTING: COMPUTER GRAPHICS, ANIMATION,
COMPUTATIONAL PHOTOGRAPHY, AND IMAGING*

Lecture #22

Series Editor: Brian A. Barsky, *University of California, Berkeley*

Series ISSN

Print 2469-4215 Electronic 2469-4223

An Introduction to Verification of Visualization Techniques

Tiago Etienne
Modelo Inc.

Robert M. Kirby
University of Utah

Cláudio T. Silva
New York University

*SYNTHESIS LECTURES ON VISUAL COMPUTING: COMPUTER
GRAPHICS, ANIMATION, COMPUTATIONAL PHOTOGRAPHY, AND
IMAGING #22*

ABSTRACT

As we increase our reliance on computer-generated information, often using it as part of our decision-making process, we must devise tools to assess the correctness of that information. Consider, for example, software embedded on vehicles, used for simulating aircraft performance, or used in medical imaging. In those cases, software correctness is of paramount importance as there's little room for error. Software verification is one of the tools available to attain such goals. Verification is a well known and widely studied subfield of computer science and computational science and the goal is to help us increase confidence in the software implementation by verifying that the software does what it is supposed to do.

The goal of this book is to introduce the reader to software verification in the context of visualization. In the same way we became more dependent on commercial software, we have also increased our reliance on visualization software. The reason is simple: visualization is the lens through which users can understand complex data, and as such it must be verified. The explosion in our ability to amass data requires tools not only to store and analyze data, but also to visualize it.

This book is comprised of six chapters. After an introduction to the goals of the book, we present a brief description of both worlds of visualization (Chapter 2) and verification (Chapter 3). We then proceed to illustrate the main steps of the verification pipeline for visualization algorithms. We focus on two classic volume visualization techniques, namely, Isosurface Extraction (Chapter 4) and Direct Volume Rendering (Chapter 5). We explain how to verify implementations of those techniques and report the latest results in the field of verification of visualization techniques. The last chapter concludes the book and highlights new research topics for the future.

KEYWORDS

visualization, verification, isosurfaces, volume rendering, geometry processing, verifiable visualization

Contents

	Preface	xi
1	Introduction	1
2	Visualization in the Real World	5
2.1	Visualizing Data	5
2.1.1	Precursors of Modern Visualizations	6
2.2	Visualization Pipeline	9
2.3	Building Reliable Visualizations	11
2.3.1	The Pursuit of a Correct Marching Cubes Algorithm	11
2.4	Path to Verification	16
3	Validation and Verification in Simulation Science	19
3.1	A Canonical Example	22
3.2	A Realistic Example	24
3.2.1	Temporal Discretization	26
4	Isosurface Verification	29
4.1	An Isosurface Extraction Primer	29
4.1.1	Mathematical Definition	29
4.1.2	Isosurface Approximation	30
4.2	Overview of the Verification Procedure	32
4.3	Discretization Errors	34
4.3.1	Algebraic Distance Convergence Errors	35
4.3.2	Normal Convergence Errors	37
4.4	Verification Algorithm	40
4.5	Application Examples	41
4.6	Results	42
4.6.1	VTK Marching Cubes	42
4.6.2	Macet	42
4.7	Discussion	43
4.8	Conclusion	45

5	Volume Rendering Verification	47
5.1	A Volume Rendering Primer	47
5.1.1	Solving the Volume Rendering Equation	48
5.2	Why Verify Volume Rendering Techniques	49
5.2.1	Overview of the Verification Procedure	53
5.3	Discretization Errors	53
5.4	Verification Algorithms	58
5.4.1	Convergence Analysis	58
5.4.2	Order of Accuracy	59
5.5	Application Examples	62
5.6	Results	62
5.6.1	Voreen	63
5.6.2	VTK Fixed-Point Volume Ray Cast	65
5.6.3	VTK Volume Ray Caster	66
5.7	Discussion	66
5.8	Conclusions	68
6	Conclusion	71
	Bibliography	73
	Authors' Biographies	79

Preface

The term *verification* has become ubiquitous in both the computer science and engineering communities as denoting a process that somehow convinces the user that verified tools, whether those be circuits, algorithms, implementations, etc. are more safe, accurate, or complete than other tools that have not been verified. Although the term verification has a common root usage within both communities, it has evolved to mean something specific to each subarea of computer science and of engineering. For instance, within computer science, the verification of a circuit denotes either the exhaustive testing or proof that under all possible inputs, the circuit will produce the correct (specified) outputs. Similarly, for software, verification relates how well an implementation represents the behavior of its specification under all possible inputs. Within the engineering world, verification takes on a different, more nuanced meaning. One assumes that there exists an “exact solution” or “exact representation” resulting from the solution of a mathematical system of equations. In all but the most trivial circumstances, this exact solution is not attainable, and approximate solutions must be formed. The process of quantifying how well a numerical scheme or representation approximates the exact solution is referred to as verification. Verification may involve looking at how well (or quickly) an approximate solution converges (in an appropriate norm) to the exact solution, or may involve identifying features or invariants of the solution that should be maintained regardless of the approximate representation. As visualization models, algorithms and implementations lie at the interface of these two branches, what does it mean to produce *verifiable visualizations*?

This question motivated the research work that has become the foundation of this book. To answer such a broad question, we started as most researchers would: by examining a concrete example in which our ideas could be refined. We started with isosurface extraction. Many tests and a few software bugs (which our process found) later, we realized that not only were our results worth communicating to the community, but that there was much work still to do. We moved to verifying different techniques used within the visualization community—in turn learning new things along the way. We began to appreciate that verification is a process, and that articulating the guiding principles of that process was itself a contribution to our community. The various papers we reference outline the specific contributions of our work. This book is meant to make that work accessible to the general reader in a pedagogical way. We hope the reader will take away not just a particular technique, but a way of approaching and testing visualization algorithms and their implementations. In the end, we hope that all successful visualization techniques will produce verifiable visualizations.

Any work of this size and scope has benefitted by many people both indirectly and directly. We wish to thank our collaborators that helped to shape this work, in particular Luis

Gustavo Nonato, Carlos Eduardo Scheidegger, Julien Tierny, Thomas J. Peters, Valerio Pascucci, Daniel Jönsson, Timo Ropinski, João Luiz Dihl Comba, Anders Ynnerman, Lis Custódio, and Sinésio Pesco. We also thank the various faculty and students at the SCI Institute (University of Utah) with whom we sharpened our ideas. In addition, we would like to thank the various Federal Funding Agencies that have supported our research efforts over the years. The papers we reference which are co-authored by us detail those acknowledgements. Lastly, we would like to thank our spouses, without whose patience and encouragement we would probably not have made it this far.

Tiago Etienne, Robert M. Kirby, and Cláudio T. Silva
December 2015