**ATLANTIS THINKING MACHINES**

VOLUME 2

SERIES EDITOR: **KAI-UWE KÜHNBERGER**

# Atlantis Thinking Machines

Series Editor:

Kai-Uwe Kühnberger,

Institute of Cognitive Science

University of Osnabrück, Germany

(ISSN: 1877-3273)

**Aims and scope of the series**

This series publishes books resulting from theoretical research on and reproductions of general Artificial Intelligence (AI).The book series focuses on the establishment of new theories and paradigms in AI. At the same time, the series aims at exploring multiple scientific angles and methodologies, including results from research in cognitive science, neuroscience, theoretical and experimental AI, biology and from innovative interdisciplinary methodologies.

For more information on this series and our other book series, please visit our website at:

*www.atlantis-press.com/publications/books*

AMSTERDAM – PARIS

**© ATLANTIS PRESS**

# Real-World Reasoning: Toward Scalable, Uncertain Spatiotemporal, Contextual and Causal Inference

**Ben Goertzel**

Novamente
LLC/Biomind LLC
Bernerd Place
MD 20851, Rockville
USA

**Nil Geisweiller**

yl. Kliment 4
Samokov 2000
Bulgaria

**Lúcio Coelho**

Rua Guajajaras
1268, apto.506
30180-101
Belo Horizonte
Brasil

**Predrag Janičić**

Faculty of Mathematics
Studentski trg, 16
11000 Belgrade
Serbia

**Cassio Pennachin**

Igenesis Av. Prof. Mário
Werneck 2170 / 501
Buritis, Belo Horizonte
30575-180 Minas Gerais
Brasil

AMSTERDAM – PARIS

**Atlantis Press**

8, square des Bouleaux
75019 Paris, France

For information on all Atlantis Press publications, visit our website at: *www.atlantis-press.com*

**Copyright**

This book, or any parts thereof, may not be reproduced for commercial purposes in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording or any information storage and retrieval system known or to be invented, without prior permission from the Publisher.

**Atlantis Thinking Machines**

Volume 1: Enaction, Embodiment, Evolutionary Robotics. Simulation Models for a Post-Cognitivist Science of Mind - Marieke Rohde, Ezequiel A. Di Paolo

ISBNs
Print: 978-94-91216-10-7
E-Book: 978-94-91216-11-4
ISSN: 1877-3273

© 2011 ATLANTIS PRESS

# Contents

**Acknowledgements** **9**

**1. Introduction** **11**

1.1 The Advantages of a Logical Approach . . . . . 12
1.2 Main High-Level Conclusions . . . . . 13
1.3 Summary . . . . . 14
1.3.1 Part I: Representations and Rules for Real-World Reasoning . . . . . 14
1.3.2 Part II: Acquiring, Storing and Mining Logical Knowledge . . . . . 19
1.3.3 Part III: Real World Reasoning Using Probabilistic Logic Networks . . . . 22

**Part I: Representations and Rules for Real-World Reasoning** **25**

**2. Knowledge Representation Using Formal Logic** **27**

2.1 Basic Concepts of Term and Predicate Logic . . . . . 28
2.2 Review of Propositional Logic . . . . . 29
2.2.1 Deduction in Propositional Logic . . . . . 31
2.3 Review of Predicate Logic . . . . . 32
2.3.1 Deduction in First-Order Logic . . . . . 34
2.3.2 First-order Theories . . . . . 36
2.3.3 Forward and Backward Chaining . . . . . 37
2.3.4 Decidability and Decision Procedures . . . . . 39
2.4 Simple Examples of Formal Logical Inference . . . . . 40
2.4.1 Example of Kings and Queens . . . . . 40
2.4.2 Example of Minesweeper . . . . . 41
2.4.3 Example of Socrates . . . . . 43
2.5 Modal logic . . . . . 44
2.6 Deontic logic . . . . . 46
2.6.1 Fuzzy deontic logic . . . . . 47
2.7 The frame problem . . . . . 48
2.7.1 Review of the Frame Problem . . . . . 49
2.7.2 Working around the Frame Problem . . . . . 50

**3. Quantifying and Managing Uncertainty** **53**

3.1 Fuzzy logic . . . . . 53
3.2 Possibility theory . . . . . 54
3.3 Inference using Traditional Probabilities . . . . . 55
3.3.1 Bayesian Inference . . . . . 55

3.3.2 Bayesian Networks . . . 55
3.3.3 Bayesian Causal Networks . . . 59
3.3.4 Bayesian Inference . . . 59
3.3.5 Markov Logic Networks . . . 61
3.4 Imprecise and indefinite probability . . . 64

**4. Representing Temporal Knowledge 65**

4.1 Approaches to Quantifying Time . . . 66
4.2 Allen's Interval Algebra . . . 68
4.2.1 Allen Algebra in the Twitter Domain . . . 71
4.3 Uncertain Interval Algebra . . . 75

**5. Temporal Reasoning 79**

5.1 The Challenge Time Presents to Classical Logic . . . 80
5.1.1 First order logic: temporal arguments approach . . . 81
5.1.2 Reified temporal logic . . . 82
5.1.3 Modal temporal logic . . . 84
5.1.4 Integration of deontic and temporal logic . . . 87
5.2 Inference systems for temporal logic . . . 89
5.2.1 Inference in the Simple First Order Logic Approach . . . 90
5.2.2 Reified temporal logic . . . 91
5.2.3 Modal temporal logic . . . 92
5.2.4 Computational Tree Logic . . . 93
5.2.5 Branching Temporal Logic . . . 95
5.3 Examples of Temporal Inference in the Twitter Domain . . . 95

**6. Representing and Reasoning On Spatial Knowledge 99**

6.1 An Example Scenario for Spatial Representation and Reasoning . . . 100
6.2 Topological Representation . . . 100
6.3 Directional Reasoning . . . 108
6.4 Occupancy Grids: Putting It All Together . . . 112
6.5 Handling Change . . . 118
6.6 Spatial Logic . . . 119
6.6.1 Extending RCC into a Topological Logic . . . 121
6.6.2 Combining Spatial and Temporal Logic . . . 122

**7. Representing and Reasoning on Contextual Knowledge 123**

7.1 Logic-Based Context Models . . . 125
7.1.1 The Divide-and-conquer approach . . . 125
7.1.2 Compose-and-conquer Approaches . . . 126
7.1.3 Compatibility constraints . . . 127
7.2 Other Approaches to Contextual Knowledge Representation . . . 128
7.3 Contextual Knowledge in Probabilistic Logic Networks . . . 129
7.4 User Models as Contexts . . . 131
7.4.1 User Modeling in Information Retrieval Systems . . . 131
7.4.2 User modeling from the cognitive perspective . . . 133
7.4.3 Logic-based user modeling . . . 134
7.4.4 Contextual Logic for User Modeling . . . 134

7.5 General Considerations Regarding Contextual Inference . . . . . 138
7.5.1 Uncertain Contextual Inference . . . . . 140
7.6 A Detailed Example Requiring Contextual Inference . . . . . 140

**8. Causal Reasoning** **147**

8.1 Correlation does not imply causation . . . . . 148
8.2 Other Challenges in Causal Reasoning . . . . . 149
8.3 Mill's Methods . . . . . 150
8.4 Hill's Criteria . . . . . 153
8.5 Graphical models . . . . . 154
8.6 Potential-outcomes (counterfactual) models . . . . . 154
8.7 Structural-equation models . . . . . 156
8.8 Probabilistic causation . . . . . 157

**Part II: Acquiring, Storing and Mining Logical Knowledge 159**

**9. Extracting Logical Knowledge from Raw Data** **161**

9.1 Extracting Logical Knowledge from Tabular and Relational Data . . . . . 163
9.2 Extracting Logical Knowledge from Graphs, Drawings, Maps and Tables . . . . . 163
9.3 Extracting Logical Knowledge from Natural Language Text . . . . . 165

**10. Scalable Spatiotemporal Logical Knowledge Storage** **169**

10.1 Comparison of Available Storage Technologies . . . . . 169
10.2 Transforming Logical Relationship-Sets into Graphs . . . . . 173

**11. Mining Patterns from Large Spatiotemporal Logical Knowledge Stores** **179**

11.1 Mining Frequent Subgraphs of Very Large Graphs . . . . . 180
11.2 Learning Partial Causal Networks . . . . . 182
11.3 Scalable Techniques for Causal Network Discovery . . . . . 184

**Part III: Probabilistic Logic Networks for Real-World Reasoning 187**

**12. Probabilistic Logic Networks** **189**

12.1 Motivations Underlying PLN . . . . . 189
12.2 Term and Predicate Logic in PLN . . . . . 191
12.3 Knowledge Representation in PLN . . . . . 193
12.4 PLN Truth Values and Formulas . . . . . 195
12.5 Some Relevant PLN Relationship Types and Inference Rules . . . . . 197
12.5.1 SatisfyingSet and Member . . . . . 198
12.5.2 Equivalence and Implication . . . . . 199
12.5.3 Quantifiers, Average and ThereExists . . . . . 200
12.5.4 Some Inheritance rules . . . . . 201
12.5.5 Intensional Inheritance . . . . . 201
12.6 Applying PLN . . . . . 202
12.7 Deploying PLN in the OpenCog System . . . . . 203

**13. Temporal and Contextual Reasoning in PLN** **205**

13.1 Temporal relationship types . . . . . 205
13.2 PLN Temporal Inference in Action . . . . . 207
13.3 PLN Causal Relationship Types . . . . . 211
13.4 PLN Contextual Inference in Action . . . . . 212

**14. Inferring the Causes of Observed Changes** **221**

14.1 The Case of Bob and His New Friends, with Temporal Inference Only . . . . . 223
14.1.1 Axioms . . . . . 223
14.1.2 Inference Trails . . . . . 227
14.2 Incorporating Spatial Inference into Analysis of Change . . . . . 233
14.2.1 New Axioms . . . . . 234
14.2.2 Evaluating the Theorems . . . . . 241

**15. Adaptive Inference Control** **247**

15.1 Specific Examples Requiring Adaptive Inference Control . . . . . 248
15.1.1 Using Commonsense Knowledge about Space in Inference Control . . . . 251
15.1.2 Using Commonsense Knowledge about Time in Inference Control . . . . 254
15.2 General Issues Raised by the Above Examples . . . . . 256
15.2.1 Inference Control and Cognitive Architectures . . . . . 257
15.3 Inference Control in the OpenCog Cognitive Architecture . . . . . 257
15.3.1 Activation Spreading and Inference Control in OpenCog . . . . . 257
15.3.2 Working around the Frame Problem via Integrative AGI . . . . . 259

**16. Conclusion** **265**

**References** **267**

# Acknowledgements

This book had its origins as a technical report written in 2008 by Novamente LLC for IARPA, under a program managed by Jeffrey Morrisson with the help of Ken Kisiel. So, above all, we would like to acknowledge the vision and practical support of these two most excellent applied scientists, without whom this book would not exist. The book in is current form is not precisely identical to the report we wrote for IARPA, but there is a large amount of overlap.

We also must especially acknowledge those who played a role in the development of the PLN inference system, which arises often in these pages. PLN was created by a large number of people, but perhaps the biggest contributors (aside from Goertzel and Geisweiller who co-authored this book) were Matt Ikle', Ari Heljakka, and Izabela Freire Goertzel, the co-authors of the PLN book, and Joel Pitt who became involved later. André Senna and Welter Silva also deserve particular thanks for their leading roles in developing the Novamente Cognition Engine and OpenCog frameworks in which the current PLN implementation exists.

Thanks are also due to Jeffrey Epstein for a research grant supporting Ben Goertzel's research, during part of the time period the original IARPA report was being written, and also during part of the time period the report was being turned into this book.

And, thanks go to Zeger Karssen of Atlantis Press for clearly understanding the need for a book such as this one ... and being patient with our inordinately long delays in producing the final manuscript.